

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

September 19, 2016



PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 2022 Monroe St. (District 13 - Ald. Eskrich)
Application Type: Conditional Use
Legistar File ID # [44170](#)
Prepared By: Jessica Vaughn, AICP, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted

Summary

Property Owner: Joel Bodilly; 2022 Monroe St.; Madison, WI 53711

Applicant & Contact: Eric Nelson; Great American Home Improvement; 1417 Kings Lynn Rd.; Stoughton, WI 53589

Requested Action: The applicant requests approval of:

- A Conditional Use for an accessory building in excess of 576 square feet in a TR zoning district; and
- A Conditional Use for an accessory dwelling unit (ADU).

Proposal Summary: The applicant is seeking approval of a Conditional Use to construct a 1,152 square-foot detached, two-story accessory building. The building will be utilized as a two-car garage on the ground floor (576 square feet) and a one-bedroom ADU on the second floor (576 square feet). The material palette consists of wood siding.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Pursuant to Section 28.131(a) and (b), MGO, no individual accessory building or structure shall exceed 576 square feet in size in a TR zoning district except as approved through Conditional Use. In addition, accessory dwelling unit uses are identified as a conditional use in the Traditional Residential-Consistent 2 (TR-C2) zoning district. As such, the development proposal is subject to the standards for Conditional Uses pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO and the supplemental regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO for accessory dwelling unit uses and accessory buildings and structures.

Review Required By: Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the Conditional Use standards are met and **approve** the request to construct a 1,152 square-foot garage with accessory dwelling unit at 2022 Monroe St. This recommendation is subject to the input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The project site is located on the north side of Monroe Street, just east of the intersection of Monroe and Lincoln Streets. The project site is located within the Dudgeon-Monroe Neighborhood and is comprised of approximately 6,050 square feet (0.14 acres).

The site is in Aldermanic District 13 (Ald. Eskrich), the Madison Metropolitan School District, and within the Monroe Street Commercial District Plan planning area.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: Currently the project site is comprised of a two-story, English Tudor-inspired single-family residence with an attached one-car garage that is off the southwest corner of the home. The

architecture of the residence is marked by its steeply pitched front gable entry with side-gable roof configuration. The home is primarily comprised of brick with minimal detailing, including patterned brickwork and multi-paned windows.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning: The project site is zoned Traditional Residential-Consistent 2 (TR-C2). Pursuant to Section 28.041, MGO, the Traditional Residential Consistent zoning districts’ general purpose and intent statement speaks to:

- Promote the preservation, development and redevelopment of traditional residential neighborhoods in a manner consistent with their distinct form and residential character.
- Ensure that new buildings and additions to existing buildings are designed with sensitivity to their context in terms of building placement, facade width, height and proportions, garage and driveway placement, landscaping, and similar design features.
- Facilitate the preservation, development or redevelopment goals of the comprehensive plan and of adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.

North: Single-family residential; TR-C2 zoning;

South: Multi-family (two units) residential; TR-C2 zoning;

East (across Monroe Street): Single-family residential; TR-C4 zoning; and

West: Single-family residential; TR-C2 zoning.

Zoning Summary:

Zoning Criteria		
Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	4,000 sq. ft.	6,050 sq. ft.
Lot Width	40’	50’
Front Yard Setback	20’	Adequate
Max. Front Yard Setback	30’ or up to 20% greater than block average	Adequate
Rear Yard Setback: Accessory Building	3’	10’
Usable Open Space	750 sq. ft.	Adequate
Maximum Lot Coverage	65%	38%
Maximum Building Height: Accessory Building	25’	25’ (Zoning Condition No. 1)
Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	None	2 car garage
Number Bike Parking Stalls	None	None
Building Forms	None	Accessory Building

Other Critical Zoning Items	
Yes:	Utility Easements
No:	Urban Design, Historic District, Adjacent to Park, Barrier Free (ILHR 69), Wetlands, Floodplain, Wellhead Protection District

Comprehensive Plan: The Comprehensive Plan recommends Low Density Residential (LDR) development for the project site. As defined in the Comprehensive Plan, LDR development is categorized for its low density (0-15 dwelling units/acre), primarily single-family detached residential development.

Adopted Neighborhood Plan: The project site is located within the planning area boundary of the Monroe Street Commercial District Plan. While the plan provides more specific recommendations along the Monroe Street corridor in those areas identified for Site Specific Development, the plan does generally speak to the preservation of the residential neighborhoods surrounding Monroe Street: “Preserve and enhance the residential character of the neighborhoods around the commercial districts” (Monroe Street Commercial District Plan, Page 9).

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site not within a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicant is requesting approval of two Conditional Use requests to construct a two-story, 1,152 square-foot accessory building (“garage”) with an ADU. The proposed garage will be comprised of a two vehicle parking spaces on the ground floor (576 square feet) and a 576 square-foot accessory dwelling unit on the second floor.

The proposed garage addition is simple in design, with a square building footprint measuring 24’-by-24’ feet with a gable roof configuration. The proposed material palette includes wood siding and trim.

Analysis and Conclusion

Pursuant to Section 28.131, “*General Regulations*,” MGO, no individual accessory structure shall exceed 576 square feet in the Traditional Residential districts except as approved through Conditional Use. This proposal is subject to the standards for Conditional Use pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO, and the Supplemental Regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO for accessory buildings and structures and accessory dwelling units.

Accessory buildings and structures are subject to the supplemental regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO, which identify the parameters for determining when Conditional Use approval is required for accessory buildings and structures, including those in excess of 576 square feet of floor area in the TR zoning district. The Conditional Use application satisfies the supplemental regulations.

Accessory dwelling units are also subject to the Supplemental Regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO. Generally, the Supplemental Regulations speak to consistency and compatibility of the proposed detached accessory building housing the ADU with the principal residence, including overall size, design/appearance and placement, which are “required standards” that ADU must meet. Staff believes that the proposed accessory dwelling unit is consistent with the supplemental regulations required standards regarding size, setbacks, entry connectivity to the street, and maintaining the appearance of the principal residence as a single-family home (Standards (a) 1-10).

The supplemental regulations also provide “suggested guidelines” that specifically speak to the design of the buildings that houses the ADU, should the ADU be located in a separate building from the principal dwelling,

including exterior materials, roof pitch, trim and projecting eaves and fenestration. The guidelines are intended to set design parameters for ADU's located in separate buildings, and to facilitate a building design that is in-like and kind to the principal dwelling, maintain a visual relationship between the accessory and principal buildings (Standards (b) 1-4).

In this case, the proposed building design and material palette (wood siding and trim, large windows and standard roof pitch) significantly differ from that of the principal dwelling, as pictured at the right (brick, steeply pitched roof with multi-pane windows). As such, Planning Division staff has identified concerns regarding the lack of a visual relationship between the principal and accessory buildings, specifically as it relates to exterior finish materials, roof pitch and fenestration. In order to meet the intent of the suggested design guidelines, Planning Division staff recommends adopting a condition of approval that speaks to maintaining a building design and material palette that is more reflective of the principal dwelling as mentioned below in the Planning Division conditions.



Image 1: 2022 Monroe St., Existing Principal Dwelling

Generally, the intent of a Conditional Use review is to determine if a particular site is an appropriate location for a proposed use, to evaluate the compatibility of that use with surrounding uses and development, and to mitigate potential nuisance impacts to surrounding properties. In order to approve the Conditional Use request, Plan Commission must find that the proposed Conditional Use approval standards pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO have been met, including those related to normal and orderly development, mitigating nuisance impacts, and consistency and compatibility with the existing development.

Planning Division staff believes that the proposed Conditional Uses, if revised to satisfy the conditions of approval, can meet the Conditional Use approval standards, given that:

- The area is characterized by its predominantly residential character. The existing neighborhood character will not be significantly impacted given that the principal single-family residential land use will remain. In addition, the proposed accessory building and use are commonly associated with residential uses and that is incidental and subordinate to the principal use (Standards #1-6).
- The proposed accessory building is located on the site in a manner that is sensitive to existing building relationships, required setback, and development patterns, where garages are commonly located behind principal structures (Standards #4 and 7).
- The building material palette and design, if revised to reflect a better visual connection between the principal and accessory dwellings, including consistency in the material palette, roof pitch and/or fenestration; providing a visual connection between the principal and the accessory buildings, the proposed accessory building can meet the Conditional Use (Conditional Use Standard #9 and Supplemental Regulations).

At the time of report writing, several public comments have been received. The comments submitted were in opposition to the proposed accessory dwelling unit use, but not the proposed accessory building itself. Generally, the comments submitted expressed concerns regarding additional noise and traffic that may be generated as a result of the accessory dwelling unit. In addition, the comments also identify that the police have been called numerous times in the recent past to address noise issues on the project site.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Jessica Vaughn, (608) 267-8733)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the Conditional Use standards are met and **approve** the request to construct a 1,152 square-foot garage with accessory dwelling unit at 2022 Monroe St. This recommendation is subject to the input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Jessica Vaughn, (608) 267-8733)

1. The Applicant shall work with Planning Division staff to finalize the building design to provide a better visual connection between the proposed accessory building and principal dwelling. In doing so, consideration should be given to revising the plans to include a combination of any one of the following:
 - a. Revising the exterior finish materials to match the type, size and placement of the exterior finish materials of the principal dwelling.
 - b. Revising the roof pitch to match the predominant roof pitch of the principal dwelling.
 - c. Utilizing trim and projecting eaves that match those of the principal dwelling.
 - d. Utilizing a fenestration pattern, design and size that match the principal dwelling.
2. That prior to final sign-off and any excavating in this area, the applicant shall obtain all necessary approvals under Wis. Stat. 157.70 from the Wisconsin State Historical Society, and provide the City with proof of all such approvals.

City Engineering Division (Contact Timothy Troester, (608) 267-1995)

1. It is recommended (not required) to have a separate sanitary sewer lateral for the proposed accessory dwelling unit. Show proposed sanitary service for the accessory unit.
2. The plan set shall be revised to show more information on proposed drainage for the site. This shall be accomplished by using spot elevations and drainage arrows or through the use of proposed contours. It is necessary to show the location of drainage leaving the site to the public right-of-way. It may be necessary to provide information off the site to fully meet this requirement. (POLICY)

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Eric Halvorson, (608) 266-6527)

The agency reviewed this request and has recommended no conditions of approval.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608) 266-4429)

1. Show the height of the proposed building on all four building elevations. The maximum height is 25 feet. Height is the average of the height of all building facades. For each facade, height is measured from the midpoint of the existing grade to the highest point on the roof of the building or structure. No individual facade shall be more than fifteen percent (15%) higher than the maximum height of the zoning district.
2. The proposed accessory dwelling unit shall comply with the supplemental regulations of Section 28.151, "Accessory Dwelling Unit in Districts Other than the TR-P District," MGO.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, (608) 261-9658)

1. Madison Fire Department recommends the installation of a residential fire sprinkler system in accordance with NFPA 13D and SPS 382.40(3)(e). Additional information is available at the Home Fire Sprinkler Coalition website: <http://www.homefiresprinkler.org/Consumer/ConsHome.html>.

Parks Division (Contact Janet Schmidt, (608) 266-4714)

1. Park impact fees (comprised of the Park Development Impact Fee per Section 20.08(2), MGO, and the Parkland Impact Fee in-lieu of land dedication per Sections 16.23(8)(f) and 20.08(6), MGO) will be required for all new residential development. The developer must select a method for payment of park fees before sign-off on the Conditional Use. This development is within the Vilas Brittingham impact fee district (SI27). Please reference ID#16143 when contacting Parks about this project.
2. Approval of plans for this project does not include any approval to prune, remove or plant trees in the public right-of-way. Permission for such activities must be obtained from the City Forester, 266-4816

Water Utility (Contact Adam Wiederhoeft, (608) 266-9121)

1. It is recommended (not required) to have a separate water service lateral for the proposed accessory dwelling unit.

Metro Transit (Contact Timothy Sobota, (608) 261-4289)

The agency reviewed this request and has recommended no conditions of approval.

City Engineering Review Mapping (Contact Jeff Quamme, (608) 266-4097)

1. The site plan shall identify lot and block numbers of recorded Certified Survey Map or Plat. Also the depth of the lot is not 120 feet. The depth of record of the east line is 121.96 feet and the west is 121.74. A survey by a professional land surveyor of the property is advised prior to construction to assure accurate placement of the proposed structure.
2. The site plan shall include a full and complete legal description of the site or property being subjected to this application.

SUBCHAPTER 28J: SUPPLEMENTAL REGULATIONS

28.151 APPLICABILITY.

Supplemental regulations are established to address the unique characteristics of certain land uses. The standards and conditions listed for land uses in this chapter are applicable to both permitted uses and uses permitted by conditional use permit, as specified for each zoning district, unless otherwise noted.

Accessory Dwelling Unit in Districts Other than the TR-P District.

(a) Required Standards.

1. The principal dwelling or the accessory dwelling unit must be owner-occupied except that a temporary absence of up to six (6) months is allowed.
2. The principal dwelling must be a single-family detached dwelling.
3. No more than one (1) accessory dwelling unit may be located on a lot.
4. The number of occupants of the accessory dwelling unit shall not exceed one (1) family or two (2) unrelated individuals.
5. The accessory dwelling unit shall not be sold separately from the principal dwelling.
6. The maximum height of a detached building containing an accessory dwelling unit, including one built above a garage, shall be twenty-five (25) feet. Height shall be measured as a principal building pursuant to Sec. 28.134(1)(b).
7. The maximum size of an accessory dwelling unit shall be seventy-five percent (75%) of the principal dwelling's floor area, up to a maximum size of seven hundred (700) square feet.
8. The minimum setback requirements shall be those for accessory building or structures of the underlying zoning district.
9. Accessory dwelling unit entry ways within a rear or side yard shall be connected to a street frontage by a paved walkway or driveway.
10. The appearance or character of the principal building shall not be significantly altered so that its appearance is no longer that of a single-family dwelling.

(b) Suggested Guidelines.

1. The exterior finish material of an accessory dwelling unit shall match the type, size and placement of exterior finish material of the principal dwelling.
2. The roof pitch shall match the predominant roof pitch of the principal dwelling.
3. Trim and projecting eaves shall match those of the principal dwelling.
4. Windows shall match those in the principal dwelling in proportion (relationship of width to height) and orientation (horizontal or vertical).