**Veldran, Lisa**

---

Please add all the emails related to this to the legistar file thanks

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

> **From:** Veronica Lazo <veronical@unidosagainstdv.org>
> **Date:** July 21, 2016 at 11:49:24 AM CDT
> **To:** allalders@cityofmadison.com
> **Subject: Resolution prohibiting machine translation**
>
> Dear Alders,
>
>
> As bilingual services provider leading culturally specific organization, I can't emphasize enough the importance of having quality material translated in the language that your audience speaks. Google translate is not a tool to use if you are truly invested in providing language access, outreach and connecting monolingual communities who speak a language other than English with goods and services. As a bilingual bilingual service provider in this community who speak Spanish I have struggle to understand the Spanish translations from pages such as the county jail and forms from other government entities. It is time consuming to have to seat and decode the "Spanish" translations in some of this documents. I urge to approve this resolution and use qualified professional to translate websites and material. No cost does not equal quality language access.
>
>
> Thanks,
>
>
>
>
> Veronica Lazo
> Executive Director
> UNIDOS Against Domestic Violence
>
> 2875 Fish Hatchery Rd
> Fitchburg, WI 53713
> Phone: (608) 256-9195 xt. 102
>
> Toll Free: 1800-510-9195
> Fax: (608) 256-1223
> veronical@unidosagainstdv.org
>
> unidosagainstdv.org

Like us on Facebook

"Peace cannot be achieved through violence, it can only be attained through understanding."

- Ralph Waldo Emerson

UNIDOS exists to empower the community to break the cycle of domestic violence, end sexual assault and promote healthy family systems.

*Core Values:*
• *Social justice: respecting human dignity and promoting social equity*
• *Education: providing safe venues to dismantle myths about domestic and sexual violence*
• *Empowerment: supporting victims/survivors to seek community driven solutions to end violence*
• *Collaboration: building a strong coalition of victims, survivors and allies*
Sent from my iPhone

| From: | Michelle Brandemuehl [mbrandemuehl@wisc.edu] |
|---|---|
| Sent: | Wednesday, July 20, 2016 4:34 PM |
| To: | All Alders |
| Subject: | Resolution # 34666 |

Hello,

I am writing in support of passing Resolution # 34666 to prohibit the use of machine translation for official City of Madison communications. I am currently a law student here at the University of Wisconsin Law School, but I have worked in the social service field for seven years prior to law school in both Milwaukee and Dane Counties. I speak Spanish as a second language, but I am constantly trying to improve my fluency. I provided translation and interpretation services for my prior employers. I have many times used Google Translate and other online translation services to check my translations, but I use them knowing that the translations are often incorrect. I only use those services because of my Spanish fluency, and I never recommend non-Spanish speakers to rely solely on those services.

Specifically, I have observed that online translation services often incorrectly conjugate verbs or use incorrect verbs altogether. The type of vocabulary that is used in translation is very specific to the unique field in which the translation is needed. Therefore, there are certain vocabulary words that might translate directly to an English word, but they would not appropriately convey the meaning as the terms are used in that field. In translating materials for distribution for past employers, I have done so working on a team with others. This was necessary because of the complexities of translation, and to ensure that our materials were correctly translated for the community we served. Using online programs like Google Translate would result in the distribution of incorrectly translated materials, which may cause confusion about the information being conveyed.

Additionally, I worry that it would send the message to our Latino Community that their needs are not a priority to our City. Incorrect translations are very obvious to Spanish-speakers, and might show a lack of care and effort on the part of the drafter. It is my personal and professional hope that the City of Madison will take the necessary steps to avoid this negative result by passing this resolution.

Thank you so much for your time and consideration of this matter.

Michelle Brandemuehl
J.D. Candidate, 2018
Immigrant Justice Clinic
University of Wisconsin Law School
mbrandemuehl@wisc.edu

| | |
|---|---|
| **From:** | fernando cano [ferchocs@yahoo.com] |
| **Sent:** | Wednesday, July 20, 2016 7:12 PM |
| **To:** | All Alders |
| **Subject:** | support for prohibiting the use of machine translations |

Hello,

I am writing to share my support of the new resolution on prohibiting the use of machine translations for official city of Madison communications including the website or any other city communications.

I believe the only way that a member of the community can interact with the city is by having clear communication. Using machine translations does not provide clear communication. It actually would increase the possibility for miscommunication.

In my experience as an interpreter and mental health provider in the community machine translations are often wrong and create a lot of confusion.

Sometimes people may think that some translation is better than no translation. I can tell you that a bad translation is worse than no translation.

It is my expectation that a great city like Madison will provide it's citizens with good quality translation & interpretation services.

Thank you.

Fernando Cano ospina
312 East Bluff
Madison, WI 53704.

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

**Veldran, Lisa**

Dear Alders,

As bilingual services provider leading culturally specific organization, I can´t emphasize enough the importance of having quality material translated in the language that your audience speaks. Google translate is not a tool to use if you are truly invested in providing language access, outreach and connecting monolingual communities who speak a language other than English with goods and services. As a bilingual bilingual service provider in this community who speak Spanish I have struggle to understand the Spanish translations from pages such as the county jail and forms from other government entities. It is time consuming to have to seat and decode the "Spanish" translations in some of this documents. I urge to approve this resolution and use qualified professional to translate websites and material. No cost does not equal quality language access.

Thanks,

Veronica Lazo
Executive Director
UNIDOS Against Domestic Violence

2875 Fish Hatchery Rd
Fitchburg, WI 53713
Phone: (608) 256-9195 xt. 102

Toll Free: 1800-510-9195
Fax: (608) 256-1223
veronical@unidosagainstdv.org

unidosagainstdv.org

Like us on Facebook

"Peace cannot be achieved through violence, it can only be attained through understanding."

- Ralph Waldo Emerson

UNIDOS exists to empower the community to break the cycle of domestic violence, end sexual assault and promote healthy family systems.

*Core Values:*
- *Social justice: respecting human dignity and promoting social equity*
- *Education: providing safe venues to dismantle myths about domestic and sexual violence*
- *Empowerment: supporting victims/survivors to seek community driven solutions to end violence*
- *Collaboration: building a strong coalition of victims, survivors and allies*

Sent from my iPhone

| From: | Fabiola Hamdan [fabiolahamdan@gmail.com] |
|---|---|
| Sent: | Thursday, July 21, 2016 4:21 PM |
| To: | All Alders |
| Subject: | Resolution prohibiting machine translation |

Dear Alders:
I am writing this email in support of the resolution proposed by Alder Bidar-Sielaff
thank you
Fabiola Hamdan

| | |
|---|---|
| **From:** | Carmen Romero Gonzalez [carmenrg76@hotmail.com] |
| **Sent:** | Friday, July 22, 2016 12:23 PM |
| **To:** | All Alders |
| **Cc:** | Carmen Romero Gonzalez |
| **Subject:** | Re: Resolution prohibiting machine translation |

Dear Alders of the City of Madison,

My name is Carmen Romero-González, and I am a resident of the city of Madison. I have read the resolution prohibiting machine translation, and I would like to thank you for taking this step, which I hope it is approved by all of you.

I am the Director of Cultural Linguistic Services at UW-Madison, where we work to assure that employees of the university have access to all services, resources and opportunities on our campus regardless of language barriers. Respectful language access is extremely important to include and integrate individuals, whose first language is not English, in our campus and broader community. Providing translation, interpretation and professional development in multiple languages is part of the daily work that our department does. The services are provided by qualified, trained and experienced translators, interpreters and instructors. On line-translation is not a reliable tool of communication, and it cannot be trusted. Translations that result from a machine lack the human component of the revision and proofreading, which is so crucial in the translation process. Machine translations are automatically generated and can be very offensive, misleading and negatively impact the image of the organization that makes the decision to use it. If machine translation is not prohibited, the city of Madison would have no control over the communication that comes from an automatic machine generating information in languages other than English. The damage of using machine translation can be outrageous for Madison and its residents.

It is my hope that you approve this resolution and identify viable solutions to provide language access to the city of Madison. At UW-Madison, we have implemented very viable and successful language access programs for thousands of employees, and I would be happy to share examples and information with the appropriate municipal office if that helps.

Respectfully,

Carmen Romero-González
MBA, Business Communication
Master's in English <> Spanish Translation

---

**De:** Bidar-Sielaff, Shiva <district5@cityofmadison.com>
**Enviado:** viernes, 22 de julio de 2016 0:17:15
**Para:** Carmen Romero Gonzalez
**Asunto:** Fwd: Resolution prohibiting machine translation

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** <district5@cityofmadison.com>
**Date:** July 20, 2016 at 6:02:50 PM CDT
**To:** <marios.sierra@gmail.com>, <ferchocs@yahoo.com>, "Vero (veronical@unidosagainstdv.org)" <veronical@unidosagainstdv.org>, "Fabiola Hamdan" <Hamdan@countyofdane.com>
**Subject: Resolution prohibiting machine translation**

Hola,

You asked me to forward the resolution to you. It is attached. Si pudieran mandar un email a allalders@cityofmadison.com antes de mediodía mañana se lo agradecería. Mil gracias Shiva

**Veldran, Lisa**

| | |
|---|---|
| **From:** | Angelica Ramos [angelicaramos628@gmail.com] |
| **Sent:** | Sunday, July 24, 2016 12:22 PM |
| **To:** | All Alders |
| **Subject:** | Resolution support |
| **Attachments:** | DYeNSRb.jpg |

I am writing today to express my support to the resolution by Shiva Bidar, to ban the use of statistical machine translation to provide translations of official information to the community.
I am a native Spanish speaker with a Certificate of English as a Second Language. I am a Certified Healthcare Interpreter and a volunteer translator for Colombianos en Wisconsin, Inc.
For me, translation is an art. It's not just putting words together from a dictionary. Translating includes knowing two languages and interchanging words that convey the same meaning. There are words that have many different translations depending on the context.

Machine translation is nowhere near perfect. If we allow machine translation of important information, we are doing a diservice to our community. To me, as member of the community and with family and friends who don't read English, it is inappropriate to think that a machine translation is an accurate way to convey meaning.
Please support Shiva with your vote. We should not allow machine translation of official information that will reach our community.

Here is a website where I found a short comparison between machine and human translation:
http://www.argotrans.com/blog/content-management/2016/02/machine-vs-human-translation

I also want to share an example where "Made in Turkey" was translated as "Hecho en Pavo". You are welcome to use machine translation to find out what "Pavo" means. (See attached image).

Thank you,
Angelica Ramos

**From:** Kim Bagley [kmbagley@ymail.com]
**Sent:** Thursday, August 25, 2016 2:34 PM
**To:** Glozier, Jason
**Cc:** All Alders
**Subject:** Disagreement to the use of electronic/machine translations

Dear Alders of Madison,

I am asking that you do not support the use of electronic/machine translations. I am a nationally certified interpreter for the Deaf, Hard of Hearing and Deaf Blind. I have been doing this professionally for 24 years. I am also a child of Deaf parents (known as a CODA-Child of a Deaf Adult).

The last 18 years I have been a full time medical interpreter and have witnessed the use of machine translations. They truly are not an adequate substitution for a face to face interpretation. In all languages, not just American Sign Language, there is never a "word for word" translation that would actually be comprehendible between two different languages. Interpretation is based on the concept communicated in one language and then interpreted into the equal concept into the second language that applies to their language and cultural understanding. Machines are not made to bring in the cultural component, which can be a costly misunderstanding.

Machine interpretation is highly disliked in the communities I serve. American Sign Language is a visual language that utilizes space. If the sign is used in a different space, that can alter the interpretation drastically. Let alone, forcing a person who uses signs, gestures and space into trying to watch it on a flat 2-D screen, is equivalent to a hearing person straining to hear another person whisper across the room.
Then you those people who depend on lip reading as well as sign language. It is next to impossible to try to lip read a person on a small screen. Then there are the people who have low vision on top of their hearing loss. This only creates more misunderstandings, more frustration and disputes between both parties included, not just the one I serve.

The Deaf, Hard of Hearing, and Deaf Blind population are very strong and know their rights within the laws in regards to the ADA. (Americans with Disabilities Act.) The wording allows the community to choose the best access to information. No one will ever ask to use a machine as a first choice.

If you were in their shoes, wouldn't you want the best and most accurate way of being informed and heard? Don't you want your messages to be understood? Don't you want the information you are obtaining to be accurate and not a guessing game? These are human lives we are dealing with. Have some compassion.

Let me end by saying, that I am representing the interpreters perspective. I was not able to reach the Deaf, Hard of Hearing, and Deaf Blind community to speak for themselves.

Kim Bagley
UW Medical Staff Interpreter
CODA
kmbagley@ymail.com
608-535-7526