PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

August 1, 2016



PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name/Address:	4718 Monona Drive, Dean House
Application Type:	Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration (sign) on landmark site
Legistar File ID #	<u>43693</u>
Prepared By:	Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared:	July 25, 2016
Summary	
Summary	
Project Applicant/Contact:	Ann Waidelich, Historic Blooming Grove Historical Society

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a ground sign on a landmark site

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located on Monona Drive.

Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

- **41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
 - (1) <u>New construction or exterior alteration</u>. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (3) <u>Signs</u>. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
 - (a) The size or design of the sign(s) would adversely affect the historic fabric of the structure or the district;
 - (b) The sign(s) fails to comply with Chapter 31 of the Madison general ordinances;
 - (c) The sign(s) fails to comply with specific standards and guidelines for signs adopted in each historic district under this ordinance.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
- 4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

- 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
- 8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 9 and 10 are most relevant to the review of the proposed sign installation and are discussed below:

- 9. The sign is being located away from the historic residence on the landmark site so that it is visible from Monona Drive. The construction of the sign will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. In addition, the proposed sign will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and architectural details to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. The sign can be removed in the future and the form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The size or design of the sign would not adversely affect the historic fabric of the structure.

The Applicants shall file an application with zoning for review of the sign related to Chapter 31. Zoning provided staff with a preliminary review of the proposed sign so that it could be reviewed by the Landmarks Commission.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of the sign are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission as submitted.