PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

June 27, 2016



PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 933 Menomonie Ln. (District 18 - Ald. Kemble)

Application Type: Conditional Use

Legistar File ID # 42966

Prepared By: Jessica Vaughn, AICP, Planning Division

Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted

Summary

Applicant, Property Owner & Contact: Obasi Torti; 933 Menomonie Ln.; Madison; WI 53704

Requested Action: The applicant requests approval of a Conditional Use to construct an accessory building in excess of 800 square feet.

Proposal Summary: The applicant is seeking approval of a Conditional Use to construct a one-story detached garage that is 1,014 square feet in the Suburban Residential-Consistent 1 zoning district. The proposed garage is a three-car garage with a flat roof. The material palette consists of board and batten siding to match the house.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Pursuant to Section 28.131, MGO no individual accessory structure shall be in excess of 800 square feet except as approved through Conditional Use. This proposal is subject to the standards for Conditional Uses pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO and the supplemental regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO for accessory buildings and structures.

Review Required By: Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the Conditional Use standards are met and **approve** the request to construct a detached accessory building in excess of 800 square feet at 933 Menomonie Ln. This recommendation is subject to the input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The project site is located mid-block along Menomonie Lane, just west of the intersection of Chinook Lane and Menomonie Lane on the south side of the street. The project site is located within the Cherokee Park Neighborhood and is comprised of approximately 26,100 square feet (0.60 acres). While the project site is comprised of two individual lots, they are considered one zoning lot as they are developed as one unit.

The site is in Aldermanic District 18 (Kemble) and the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: Currently the project site is comprised of a one-story, roughly 1,800 square-foot single-family residence with a 1,800 square-foot basement and a two-car attached garage that is roughly 795 square feet in size. The existing home is oriented towards and the driveway takes access from Menomonie Lane. According to the City Assessor's records, the home was constructed in 1978.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning: The project site is zoned Suburban Residential-Consistent 1 (SR-C-1). Pursuant to Section 28.041, MGO, the Suburban Residential Consistent zoning district's general purpose and intent statement speaks to:

- Ensure that new buildings and additions to existing buildings are designed with sensitivity to their context in terms of building placement, facade width, height and proportions, garage and driveway placement, landscaping, and similar design features.
- Maintain and improve the viability of existing housing of all types, while providing for updating of older housing in a context sensitive manner.
- Facilitate the preservation, development or redevelopment goals of the comprehensive plan and of adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.

North (across Menomonie Lane): Single-family Residential; SR-C1 zoning;

South: Cherokee Marsh/Yahara River, owned by the City of Madison; Conservancy District (CN) zoning;

East: Single-family Residential; SR-C1 zoning; and

West: Single-family Residential; SR-C1 zoning.

Zoning Summary:

Zoning Criteria		
Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	8,000 sq. ft.	26,100 sq. ft.
Lot Width	60′	180′
Front Yard Setback	30′	30.19′
Side Yard Setback	One-story: 6' Two-story: 7'	40.04′
Rear Yard Setback: Accessory Building	3′	88.88′
Usable Open Space	1,300 sq. ft.	Adequate
Maximum Lot Coverage	50%	19.1%
Maximum Building Height: Accessory Building	15′	14'
Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	1 (location only)	2 existing garage stalls 3 proposed garage stalls
Number Bike Parking Stalls	None	None
Building Forms	None	Accessory Building

Other Critical Zoning Items		
	Floodplain (F2), Utility Easements, Wellhead	
Yes:	Protection District (WP-13, 50 Yr. Capture Zone),	
	Environmental Corridor	
No:	Urban Design, Historic District, Adjacent to Park,	
NO.	Barrier Free (ILHR 69), Wetlands	

Legistar File ID # 42966 933 Menomonie Ln. June 27, 2016 PC Page 3

Comprehensive Plan: The <u>Comprehensive Plan</u> recommends Low Density Residential development for the project site. As defined in the Comprehensive Plan, LDR development is categorized for its low density (0-16 dwelling units/acre), primarily single-family detached dwelling unit residential development.

Adopted Neighborhood Plan: The project site is located within the planning area boundary of the Cherokee Special Area Plan (the "Plan"). The Plan identifies the project site as being within an area designated for low density residential development with densities at less than eight dwelling units per acre. While the Plan does include neighborhood development and design principles, the design principles identified in the Plan only "apply to development in all six core sub-areas within the Cherokee SAP" (Pg. 16, The Plan). The project site is not located within an identified sub-area.

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site has a mapped environmental corridor mapped along the lot's Yahara River frontage, along the rear (south) yard of the project site. The proposed development is located outside of the area designated as environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicant requests approval of a Conditional Use to construct a one-story detached accessory building that is 1,014 square feet in size. The proposed accessory building is to be used as a three-car garage with access off the main driveway via a grass-crete drive (permeable paving system) and concrete apron. No additional curb cuts are proposed as part of the proposal.

Although the architecture of the proposed garage is of a more modern design motif with a shed-style pitched roof, the material palette consists of more traditional materials, including board and batten siding to match the house and glass block windows.

Analysis and Conclusion

Pursuant to Section 28.131, "General Regulations," MGO, no individual accessory structure shall exceed 576 square feet in the TR districts and or 800 square feet in other districts except as approved through Conditional Use. This proposal is subject to the standards for Conditional Uses pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO and the supplemental regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO for accessory buildings and structures.

The applicable Supplemental Regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO identify the parameters for determining when Conditional Use approval is required for accessory buildings and structures, including those in excess of 1,000 square feet of coverage and 800 square feet of floor area. The proposal satisfies the supplemental regulations.

Generally, the intent of a Conditional Use review is to determine if a particular site is an appropriate location for a proposed use, to evaluate the compatibility of that use with surrounding uses and development, and to mitigate potential nuisance impacts to surrounding properties. In order to approve the Conditional Use request, Plan Commission must find that the proposed Conditional Use approval standards pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO, including those related to normal and orderly development, mitigating nuisance impacts, and consistency and compatibility with the existing development.

Legistar File ID # 42966 933 Menomonie Ln. June 27, 2016 PC Page 4

Planning Division staff believes that the proposed Conditional Use can meet the Conditional Use approval standards.

- The area is characterized by its predominantly residential character. The existing neighborhood character will not be significantly impacted given that the principal single-family residential land use will remain. The proposed accessory building, being a garage is commonly associated with a residential use and that is incidental, and subordinate to the principal use (Standards #1-7).
- The proposed accessory building is located on the site in a manner that is sensitive to existing building relationships, including maintaining one driveway access and consistent setbacks from Menomonie Lane. Recognizing that the project is comprised of two lots, the proposed accessory building will have a minimal impact to the overall building to lot ratio (19 percent lot coverage) and will maintain the generally open development patterns that are present in the area (Standard #4).
- The proposed building material palette consists of more traditional materials, including board and batten siding to match the house, and glass block windows, which maintains a similar design aesthetic that is already present on the project site (Standard #9).

At the time of report writing, several public comments were received, none of which were in support of the application. Of the comments received concerns were focused on maintaining compatibility and consistency with the existing development pattern, citing that detached garages are not a commonly found in the neighborhood. All of the public comments received to date are included in the Plan Commission materials.

In light of the concerns expressed by the neighborhood regarding design, the Plan Commission may consider conditions of approval to reduce the prominence of the proposed accessory building along the street in an area where garages are setback and detached accessory structures are not a common occurrence. Those include:

- (1) Orienting the garage more internally to the project site by turning the garage 90 degrees. A building sidewall will be located along Menomonie Lane instead of the three large garage bay doors. Further articulation of the sidewall by incorporating a small window to break-up the long appearance of the side wall should also be considered; and
- (2) Setting the proposed detached garage back to a location that is behind the existing garage façade. The increased setback will push the building further back from the street, decreasing the building's overall prominence at the street, move the grass-crete paving system away from the curb eliminating the appearance of another curb cut, and be consistent with the attached garage setbacks in the zoning code in all residential zoning districts (Section 28.031(3), MGO).

The applicant has been made aware of the proposed design changes and is amenable to making them.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Jessica Vaughn, (608) 267-8733)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the Conditional Use standards are met and **approve** the request to construct a detached accessory building at 933 Menomonie Ln. This recommendation is subject to the input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Jessica Vaughn, (608) 267-8733)

1. The agency reviewed this request and has no recommended no conditions of approval.

City Engineering Division (Contact Timothy Troester, (608) 267-1995)

- 2. All outstanding Madison Metropolitan Sewerage District (MMSD) charges are due and payable prior to Engineering sign-off, unless otherwise collected with a Developer's/Subdivision Contract. Contact Mark Moder (608-261-9250) to obtain the final MMSD billing a minimum of two (2) working days prior to requesting City Engineering sign-off (Section 16.23(9)(d)(4), MGO).
- 3. The Applicant shall replace all sidewalk and curb and gutter which abuts the property which is damaged by the construction or any sidewalk and curb and gutter which the City Engineer determines needs to be replaced because it is not at a desirable grade regardless of whether the condition existed prior to beginning construction (POLICY).
- 4. All work in the public right-of-way shall be performed by a City licensed contractor (sections 16.23(9)(c)(5) and 23.01, MGO).
- 5. All damage to the pavement on Menomonie Lane, adjacent to this development shall be restored in accordance with the City of Madison's Pavement Patching Criteria. For additional information please see the following link: http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/patchingCriteria.cfm (POLICY).

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Eric Halvorson, (608) 266-6527)

The agency reviewed this request and has no recommended no conditions of approval.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608) 266-4429)

- 7. Records show that the property is located within a designated flood plain. Show the designated flood plain area on the site plan.
- 8. A second driveway may not be constructed unless it meets the residential driveway design and location requirements of Section 28.141(9)(c). Provide a detail of the proposed permeable/ driveable grass area.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, (608) 261-9658)

9. The agency reviewed this request and has no recommended no conditions of approval.

Parks Division (Contact Janet Schmidt, (608) 266-4714)

10. The agency reviewed this request and has no recommended no conditions of approval.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, (608) 261-9243)

11. All operating private wells shall be identified and permitted by the Water Utility in accordance with Section 13.21, MGO. All unused private wells shall be abandoned in accordance with Section 13.21, MGO.

Metro Transit (Contact Timothy Sobota, (608) 261-4289)

12. The agency reviewed this request and has no recommended no conditions of approval.

City Engineering Review Mapping (Contact Jeff Quamme, (608) 266-4097)

13. The site plan shall identify and show lots 130 and 131 per the plat of Second Addition to Cherokee Park.