

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 2, 2016
TITLE: 130 East Gilman Street – Mansion Hill Historic District – Review proposed land division. 2 nd Ald. Dist. Contact: Gary Brown, UW-Madison	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary	ADOPTED: 5/2/16 POF:
DATED: May 2, 2016	ID NUMBER: 42481

Members present were: Stuart Levitan, Chair; Anna V. Andrzejewski, Vice Chair; Erica Fox Gehrig, David WJ McLean, and Christina Slattery

SUMMARY:

McLean recused himself and left the meeting room.

Levitan opened the public hearing.

Gary Brown, University Facilities, registering in support, wishing to speak and available to answer questions. Brown explained that a similar request was made and approved in 2013. He explained that a permanent historic preservation covenant would be attached to Lot 1, but that the entire site would remain listed on the National Register.

Staff explained that the ordinance was revised since the original review and that now the Commission must review for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff also explained that the site plan had been modified from the previous review and that now the site was 10 feet narrower and 40 feet longer.

Eugene Devitt, registering in support and wishing to speak. Devitt explained that he was not representing the neighborhood with his comments. He explained that he would personally want the building to be a public space and that it is probably best suited to be a museum or art gallery. Devitt explained that he wanted to be certain that the entire original site remain a landmark site.

Bob Klebba, registering in support and not wishing to speak.
David Waugh, registering in support and not wishing to speak.

Levitan closed the public hearing.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Slattery, seconded by Andrzejewski, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the land division of the landmark site in a historic district. The motion passed by a voice vote.



Department of Planning & Community & Economic Development

Planning Division

Katherine Cornwell, Director

Madison Municipal Building, Suite LL-100

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard

P.O. Box 2985

Madison, Wisconsin 53701-2985

Phone: (608) 266-4635

Fax (608) 267-8739

www.cityofmadison.com

May 12, 2016

Gary Brown, PLA, FASLA
University of Wisconsin-Madison
Facilities Planning & Management
30 N. Mills St. 4th Floor
Madison, WI 53715

Re: Certificate of Appropriateness for 130 E Gilman Street

At its meeting on May 2, 2016 the Madison Landmarks Commission reviewed, in accordance with the Madison General Ordinances pertaining to provisions of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, your plans to divide the lot of the landmark site located at 130 E Gilman Street in the Mansion Hill Historic District. The Landmarks Commission voted to approve the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness for the project as submitted.

This letter will serve as the "Certificate of Appropriateness" for the project. When you apply for a building permit, take this letter with you to the Building Inspection Counter, Department of Planning and Development, Lower Level Suite LL-100, Madison Municipal Building, 215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard.

Please note that any major design changes from the plans submitted and the additional information provided to the Landmarks Commission must receive approval by the Landmarks Commission, or staff designee, prior to the issuance of the building permit. This Certificate is valid for 24 months from the date of issuance.

Please also note that failure to comply with the conditions of your approval is subject to a forfeiture of up to \$250 for each day during which a violation of the Landmarks Commission ordinance continues (see Madison General Ordinances Chapter 41, Historic Preservation Ordinance).

Please contact me (608-266-6552 or ascanlon@cityofmadison.com) with any questions.

Sincerely,

Amy Loewenstein Scanlon, Registered Architect
Preservation Planner
City of Madison Planning Division

cc: Tim Parks, Planning Division
City preservation file

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

May 2, 2016

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name/Address: 130 E Gilman Street
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for land division in historic district
Legistar File ID # 42481
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: April 26, 2016

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Gary Brown, UW-Madison
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for land division of a landmark site in the Mansion Hill Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is a landmark site located in the Mansion Hill Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.

- (4) Land Divisions and Combinations. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for land divisions, combinations, and subdivision plats of landmark sites and properties in historic districts, unless it finds that the proposed lot sizes adversely impact the historic character or significance of a landmark, are incompatible with adjacent lot sizes, or fail to maintain the general lot size pattern of the historic district.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant came before the Landmarks Commission on June 10, 2013 to request a recommendation for land division. At that time the Ordinance gave the Landmarks Commission the authority to review the land division request and provide a recommendation for Plan Commission review. The Historic Preservation Ordinance was revised to give the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue Certificates of Appropriateness for land division and was adopted in July of 2015. The request for land division is returning to the Commission for the review of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

The current lot is large in relation to the lots across E Gilman Street; however, it is waterfront property and the current lot size seems appropriate for its historic context. This property was historically a grand mansion of some of Madison's elite families and then later the official residence of seventeen Wisconsin Governors. Many important social and cultural events took place on this site and certainly many of them were near the water. In 1870 internationally renowned violinist, Ole Bull, married Sara Thorp on the property and according to the landmark nomination, "their wedding was the occasion for the most elaborate festivities Madison had ever seen." Also according to the nomination, Bull is responsible for creating a terraced embankment of Norwegian gardens leading to the lake and a croquet ground.

In 1950 the property was sold to the University of Wisconsin and was most recently used as a student residence hall for Knapp graduate scholars. The date of construction for the boathouse/lifesaving station is unknown, but presumed to be in 1970 or 1971. The Executive Residence was designated a landmark in January of 1972, likely concurrent with or slightly after the construction of the boathouse.

The CSM proposes creating a much smaller lot than what currently exists which may be more consistent with the size of other adjacent lots in the historic district, but somewhat diminishes the historic character of the landmark site. The size of the proposed lots has been revised since 2013. The width of the proposed lot (Lot 1) has been reduced by 10' to meet zoning requirements and the depth of the lot has increased by 40'. While staff is concerned that the size of Lot 2 may allow for future development that may negatively impact the landmark site, it should be noted that lots 1 and 2 will remain the landmark site unless the designation is amended to only include Lot 1. If the designation is amended, Lot 2 may become a site adjacent to a landmark site.

Recommendation

Staff believes that, beyond the structure itself, a contributing factor to the landmark status of the site is the large lawn that slopes down to the lake and that staff would prefer to see the rear lot line moved closer to the lake to aid in preserving the historic landscape and context.

Staff believes that the standards to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission.