

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

February 8, 2016

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name/Address: 1318 Rutledge
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness
Legistar File ID # [41563](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: February 2, 2016

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Kurt Hartjes, Waunakee Remodeling, Inc.
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for an exterior alteration involving the replacement of windows in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- 1) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) Height
 - (b) Landscape treatment
 - (c) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - 2) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - 3) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - 4) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - 5) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

Gerry Frantz of Waunakee Remodeling explained in an email that the proposal includes "... replacing the previously replaced replacement windows and aluminum storms (not original) there is only one original window left in this home on the driveway side second floor and we are not replacing this window. The replacement of these windows will bring this house much closer to the original look o f this house than what she currently has on there now."

In another email Frantz provides the following:

“if you look at the 2nd floor driveway side window on the 2nd floor it has True Divided light grilles. I would assume this is an original window. No other windows on the home have grilles anymore. The windows by the front door are definitely replacements. Our Renewal by Andersen Fibrex composite (NOT VINYL) window is going to bring these windows back to the original look of this house more than leaving what is there with the aluminum storms over replacement sashes.”

The building was constructed in 1864 and the existing windows do not appear to be original. The existing replacement windows are wood sash and appear to date to the 1900-1920s. There is one window that may be original and it is located on the second floor facing the driveway. This window is a two-over-two double hung with true divided lights. The windows on the first floor facing the front appear to be more recent vinyl replacements.

A brief discussion of the standards of 41.23 (9) follows:

1. N/A
2. N/A
3. The existing historical materials of the street façade will be affected by the replacement of windows. The second floor windows appear to be older wood sash while the first floor windows appear to be vinyl replacement units.
4. N/A
5. N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the alterations may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

1. The replacement windows shall be one-over-one double hungs.
2. The Applicant shall confirm the use and appearance of screens.