PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

September 21, 2015



PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name/Address:	1925 Kendall
Application Type:	Certificate of Appropriateness
Legistar File ID #	<u>40101</u>
Prepared By:	Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared:	September 15, 2015

Summary	
Project Applicant/Contact:	Jason Kwan
Requested Action:	The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a greenhouse structure in the University Heights Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

<u>41.24(4)</u> Standards for the Review of New Structures in the TR-V1, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts.

- (b) <u>Accessory Structures</u>. Accessory structures, as defined in Section 28.211 of the Madison general ordinances, shall be compatible with the design of the existing structures on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory structure shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal structures as set forth in sec. 41.24(4)(a)2.
- (a) <u>Principal Structures</u>.
 - 2. <u>Materials</u>. Materials for the exterior walls shall be the same as or similar to materials prevalent in the University Heights Historic District. Permitted materials include brick, narrow gauge horizontal clapboards four or less inches in exposed width, stone, stucco, smooth shingles or combinations of the above provided the combinations occur in a manner and location similar to the materials on existing structures in University Heights (e.g., brick on first floor with clapboard on second floor). Other materials, such as aluminum or vinyl must be visually compatible with structures within 200 feet of the subject property. The following materials are prohibited: concrete block, asbestos, wide clapboards over four inches in exposed width, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes.

28.211 Definitions (Zoning Code)

<u>Accessory Building or Structure</u>. A subordinate building or structure, the use of which is clearly incidental to that of the main building and which is located on the same lot as the principal building, and is subordinate to the principal building in height and floor area.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed structure is 6' x 8' and 7' tall and therefore, does not exceed 15' in height. Given the oddlyshaped corner lot, the greenhouse cannot be placed in the rear yard as the ordinance states based on current zoning requirements. The zoning definition of rear yard would allow the structure to be placed where it is proposed as long as it is within the buildable area.

The greenhouse structure is a prefabricated unit. The Applicant shall provide information about the foundation of the structure. If the greenhouse is installed on a concrete slab, it is more "permanent" than if it is installed on piers in the grass. The design of the greenhouse unit is not customizable to include solid lower wall materials as prescribed in the ordinance. The use of materials found elsewhere in the historic district or from the primary residence would make the structure more compatible and less obtrusive.

The location of the greenhouse on the more visible side of the lot is a concern. The University Heights section of the Historic Preservation Ordinance gives special consideration to those alterations that are not visible from the street. Given that intent, it seems that the greenhouse might be less obtrusive if it were located toward the interior of the block instead of on a visible corner.

The concern for the neighborhood becomes the use and appearance of the structure when the greenhouse use falls out of favor.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the accessory structure (greenhouse) are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

- 1. The Applicant shall provide information about the foundation.
- 2. The Applicant shall consider relocating the greenhouse to the east side of the lot so that the structure is obscured toward the interior of the block.