

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

SEPTEMBER 2, 2015 URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

SEPTEMBER 21, 2015 PLAN COMMISSION



Project Address: 723 State Street

Application Type: PD(GDP-SIP) Alteration

Legistar File ID # [39485](#)

Prepared By: Timothy M. Parks, Planning Division
Report includes comments from other City agencies, as noted.

Summary & Background Information

Applicant & Property Owner: Father Eric Nielsen, St. Paul University Catholic Center; 723 State Street; Madison.

Contact Person: Ronald M. Trachtenberg, von Briesen & Roper, SC; 10 E. Doty Street, Suite 900; Madison.

Requested Action: Approval of an alteration to an approved Planned Development–General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan to allow construction of a new church and student center with one less story than previously approved.

Proposal Summary: St. Paul University Catholic Center received approval in 2012 to demolish the existing two-story church and student center to allow construction

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Section 28.098(6) states that “No alteration of a Planned Development District shall be permitted unless approved by the Plan Commission, provided however, the Zoning Administrator may issue permits for minor alterations that are approved by the Director of Planning and Community and Economic Development and are consistent with the concept approved by the Common Council.” According to Section 28.098(6), the Plan Commission is authorized to approve alterations to a Planned Development zoning district using the review standards in Section 28.098(2).

Review Required By: Urban Design Commission and Plan Commission.

Parcel Location: An approximately 0.26-acre (11,352 square feet) parcel located on the south side of State Street between East Campus Mall and N. Lake Street; Aldermanic District 8 (Wood); Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The site is developed with the existing two-story church and student center, zoned PD.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: Memorial Library, zoned CI (Campus-Institutional District);

South: Pres House Apartments, zoned PD; UW Extension Building, zoned CI;

West: University Presbyterian Church/ Pres House, zoned PD;

East: Fitch Court, Calvary Lutheran Student Center, University Bookstore, zoned CI.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The [Comprehensive Plan](#) identifies the subject site and surrounding properties as part of the University of Wisconsin–Madison Campus. The Campus land use designation recognizes the “wide

diversity of uses associated with the primary education mission” of institutions such as the University, including the proposed Music Performance Facility.

The Downtown Plan includes the subject site and other nearby properties west of N. Lake Street in the Campus Neighborhood/ District. Recommendations for this district are limited, but the Downtown Plan emphasizes that development on the eastern end of the University campus continue to improve its interface with the rest of Downtown along and near its borders while making a clear and coordinated transition to campus (from Objective 4.13). In this area, the University-owned properties are recommended for campus uses, while the non-University properties located on the south side of State Street including the subject site are recommended for Downtown Mixed-Use as described in the plan similar to the uses recommended along State Street east of Lake. Building heights up to 6 stories are recommended on the Maximum Building Heights Map for the 700-block of State Street.

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located within a mapped environmental corridor (see Map E8)

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Zoning Summary: The subject property is zoned PD. The proposed alteration will be reviewed in the following sections.

Other Critical Zoning Items	
Yes:	Adjacent to Landmark (Pres House), Urban Design (PD zoning), Utility Easements, Barrier Free
No:	Floodplain, Wellhead Protection, Waterfront Development
<i>Prepared by: Jenny Kirchgatter, Asst. Zoning Administrator</i>	

Previous Approvals

On February 28, 2012, the Common Council conditionally approved a request by St. Paul University Catholic Center to rezone an approximately 0.26-acre property located at 723 State Street (between N. Lake Street and East Campus Mall) from R6 (General Residential District) to Planned Unit Development- General Development Plan-Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-GDP-SIP) [1966 Zoning Code] to allow demolition of the existing St. Paul University Catholic Center and the construction of a new six-story church and student center. The Plan Commission approved the demolition and recommended approval of the planned unit development on February 6, 2012.

On March 9, 2015, the Plan Commission approved a 24-month extension for the required construction of the approved Planned Development for the place of worship and student center. A building permit for the approved project must be issued by February 28, 2017 or the 2012 approval is null and void.

Project Description, Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant, St. Paul University Catholic Center, is requesting to amend a previously approved General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan to allow construction of a new church and student center with one less story than previously approved in 2012. The new church and student center was approved as a six-story building with occupied basement with 62,714 square feet of finished floor area, including a multi-purpose room on the top floor.

The amended plans for the new facility call for the first floor to be occupied by a student center, reading room, offices, and a kitchen and dining room, with the rest of that level devoted to service and mechanical spaces. A small parking and loading area continues to be proposed at the southeastern corner of the building, which will be accessed from Fitch Court. The chapel continues to occupy most of the second and third floors of the building, with the sanctuary proposed along the southern wall of the second floor and a lobby proposed along the northern wall. The third floor will include balcony seating overlooking the chapel below on three sides as well as offices and a classroom. Total occupancy for the two-story chapel will be approximately 490 persons. The fourth floor of the new facility has been revised to include a single five-bedroom apartment for clergy, where previously 2 apartments were proposed. The fifth, top occupied floor of the proposed church and student center will primarily be occupied with a large multi-purpose room, kitchen and pantry. The fifth floor will be set back from the majority front wall below to accommodate a roof garden located in the stepback along the northern/front wall overlooking State Street. The building will have an unfinished basement that may accommodate future programming.

The architecture of the proposed building has previously been described as a ““new classicism”, combining traditional Catholic forms and symbolism with a modern energy” in the style of traditional American church architecture of the 1930s, which combines Italianate, Romanesque and Art Deco styles. The exterior of the now five-story building continues to primarily consist of brick, with natural and cast stone spandrels and trim elements, with a prominent two-story tall religious mural or fresco proposed above the second floor along the State Street facade. The building will be topped with a tall standing-seam copper roof and prominent cupola located above a mechanical penthouse.

The letter of intent indicates that the reduced scale and scope of the church and student center has been caused by fundraising limitations, construction costs, and the need and desire to begin construction and operation of the new facility. The letter of intent includes a detailed inventory of the changes to the building contained in the amended plans.

The Planning Division believes that the Urban Design Commission and Plan Commission can find the standards met and approve the amended plans for St. Paul University Catholic Center to allow construction of a shorter, five-story church and student center. Despite the reduced scale of the new facility, staff believes that the proposed five-story building will allow an important member of the University community to maintain its presence in the East Campus area in a building that is still well scaled to its surroundings.

As noted, the adjacent “Pres House” University Presbyterian Church at 731 State Street is a designated City Landmark. Section 28.144 of the Zoning Code requires that the Landmarks Commission make an advisory recommendation to the Urban Design Commission and Plan Commission for any proposed development adjacent to a designated landmark, specifically “...to determine whether the proposed development is so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark or landmark site.” In reviewing the amended plans for the St. Paul’s redevelopment on August 3, 2015, the Landmarks Commission advised the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission that the proposed project is not so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Timothy M. Parks, 261-9632)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find the proposed alteration consistent with the Planned Development approved by the Common Council and the standards of approval for Planned Developments met and **approve** an alteration to the Planned Development–General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan for 723 State Street to allow construction of a church and student center with one less story than previously approved following a recommendation by the Urban Design Commission and subject to input at the public hearing and the following conditions:

Recommended Conditions of Approval Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

1. The subject development shall be subject to the zoning text for the Planned [Unit] Development–General Development Plan previously approved and recorded for the church and student center.
2. That the final plan materials be revised to include the square-footage of each floor of the proposed building by use and the gross floor area of the building.

The following conditions have been submitted by reviewing agencies:

City Engineering Division (Contact Janet Schmidt, 261-9688)

This agency submitted a response with no new conditions for this request. All City Engineering Division requirements from the previously approved PD shall remain intact. No further comments on the alteration are provided.

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Eric Halvorson, 266-6527)

3. The applicant shall submit one contiguous plan showing proposed conditions and one contiguous plan showing existing conditions for approval. The plan drawings shall be scaled to 1" = 20' and include the following, when applicable: existing and proposed property lines; parcel addresses; all easements; pavement markings; signing; building placement; items in the terrace such as signs, street light poles, hydrants; surface types such as asphalt, concrete, grass, sidewalk; driveway approaches, including those adjacent to and across street from the project lot location; parking stall dimensions, including 2 feet of vehicle overhang; drive aisle dimensions; semitrailer movement and vehicle routes; dimensions of radii; and percent of slope.
4. All parking facility design shall conform to the standards in MGO Section 10.08(6).

Zoning Administrator (Contact Matt Tucker, 266-4569)

This agency did not provide comments for this request.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 261-9658)

5. Provide fire apparatus access as required by IFC 503 2012 edition, MGO Sec. 34.503, as follows:
 - a.) The site plans shall clearly identify the location of all fire lanes.

- b.) MGO Sec. 34.503/IFC 503 Appendix D105: Provide an aerial apparatus access fire lane that is at least 26 feet wide, if any part of the building is over 30 feet in height. The near edge of the aerial fire lane shall be within 30 feet and not closer than 15 feet from the structure, and parallel to one entire side. The aerial fire lane shall cover not less than 25% of the building perimeter.

6. Provide direct roof access from the stair.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, 261-9243)

- 7. All wells located on this property shall be abandoned if no valid well operation permit has been obtained from the Madison Water Utility in accordance with MGO Section 13.21. The Water Utility will not need to sign off the final plans for the building, and will not need a copy of the approved plans.

Parks Division (Contact Kay Rutledge, 266-4714)

This agency submitted a response with no comments or conditions for this request.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency did not provide comments for this request.