



Project Name/Address: 3244 Atwood Avenue, Garver Feed Mill

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to a landmark and landmark site

Legistar File ID # [39060](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 30, 2015

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: D.L. Baum

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to a landmark building and landmark site.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is a designated landmark site located in Olbrich Park.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

33.19(5)(b)4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:

- a. Whether in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done;

28.144 DEVELOPMENT ADJACENT TO A LANDMARK OR LANDMARK SITE.

Any development on a zoning lot adjoining a landmark or landmark site for which Plan Commission or Urban Design Commission review is required shall be reviewed by the Landmark Commission to determine whether the proposed development is so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark or landmark site. Landmark Commission review shall be advisory to the Plan Commission and the Urban Design Commission.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Garver Feed Mill was constructed in 1906 as the Unites States Sugar Company. The Sugar Company closed in 1924 and Garver purchased the property in 1929. The feed mill operated here until the mid 1990s. Olbrich Botanical Society purchased the Garver site in 1997 and conveyed the property to the City. The Baum Development team is proposing the adaptively reuse the Garver Building and landmark site with a modern use that is similar to the historic use. Their proposal would use the building as a food production facility and parts of the landmark site would be used for micro-lodges. Adjacent to the landmark site, a cold storage building would be constructed for use by Olbrich/Parks storage needs and more micro-lodges would be placed.

The Commission shall determine if the proposed treatments to the landmark building and site would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect the landmark. In addition, the Commission should determine

if the proposed adjacent cold storage building and adjacent micro-lodges are so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjacent landmark.

Staff understands that the applicant is pursuing historic tax credits. The proposed project may be revised to meet the State and Federal requirements for the tax credit program. The applicant is proposing to retain the majority of the building with the exception of the garage addition on the west elevation which is proposed to be demolished. The applicant is also proposing to construct an entrance addition on the north elevation. In addition, the existing masonry openings are being opened and new windows will be installed to replicate the original window types and configurations.

The micro-lodges are “temporary” structures with individual foundations and utilities. The Urban Design Commission will review the varying designs of the micro-lodges. Some of the micro-lodges will be placed on the landmark site, but will be buffered from the Garver building by significant space and landscaping.

The cold storage building is similar to the out buildings that historically existed on the site.

Recommendation

Due to the tax credit review process for the Garver building, revisions to the current proposal are likely. Staff requests that the Commission allow the applicant to work with staff on the review and approval of revisions and the conditions of approval below. Staff has the discretion to send the revisions to the Commission for review and approval if necessary.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall provide information about the seating terrace appearance and perimeter materials.
2. The Applicant shall provide window materials and details.
3. The applicant shall provide door details.
4. The applicant shall provide details regarding brick repair.
5. The applicant shall provide details for the entrance addition.
6. The applicant shall confirm that the brick hatch shown on the elevations on drawing A-1.1 does not indicate a larger scale masonry infill material.
7. The proposed mechanical equipment should be exposed (not screened).

Due to the varying nature of the designs of the micro-lodges, staff requests that the Commission allow the applicant to work with staff on the review and approval of the designs of the structures related to the adjacency issues and the landmark site compatibility issues. Staff has the discretion to send the revisions to the Commission for review and approval if necessary.

Staff believes the cold storage building is not so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjacent landmark. Staff requests that the Commission allow the applicant to work with staff on the review and approval of the design of the storage building related to the adjacency issues. Staff has the discretion to send the revisions to the Commission for review and approval if necessary.