

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION      **PRESENTED:** June 10, 2015

TITLE: 4525 Secret Garden Drive – Multi-Family Residential Development Consisting of Twelve Multi-Family Buildings with 102 Dwelling Units. 16<sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (36751)

**REFERRED:**  
**REREFERRED:**  
**REPORTED BACK:**

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary      **ADOPTED:**      **POF:**

DATED: June 10, 2015      **ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Tom DeChant, John Harrington, Cliff Goodhart, Richard Slayton, Melissa Huggins and Sheri Carter.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of June 10, 2015, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a multi-family residential development located at 4525 Secret Garden Drive. Appearing on behalf of the project was Joseph Lee, representing David J. Decker. Auto courts are oriented interior to the site. Townhome units are now included in the project and will front the interior private streets. The site plan shows two 12-unit buildings, seven 6-unit buildings and seven townhome buildings. Building materials are proposed to be cultured stone veneer, vinyl siding with the exception of the trim, composite trim, corner boards and horizontal banding.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- Just a couple shots of the surrounding area are not enough of a context.
- I'd really like to see the rooflines broken down a bit. The townhomes should look more like townhomes. What I really object to in the larger buildings is this massive roof, which is not energy efficient. I would like to see how you would break that building down.
- I'm wondering if these could be gable elements and the apartment in the middle might be a flat roof.
- It's a nice composition with the middle and ends, especially when you're not going to see it flat on.
- There's an opportunity being missed here. Can you think of a way you can make the fire access split, keep the greenspace and get rid of the parking in front so you create this big greenspace that goes all the way along the center.
- Is there any way to incorporate a front porch on the townhome units? Make it more inviting.
  - We can look at that.
- On the backside where the garages are, where is there parking for guests?
  - Guest parking is on the street side. There are some extra spaces behind some of the townhouses.
- You've got balconies over the garages, so basically over asphalt. Do those things really get used?
  - Yes, they do.

- Looking at the limited outdoor space, and also engaging and activating the street, nothing activates the street like people, so I second the idea of porches.
- Make sure these spaces near the garages have enough depth and width for at least a small scale tree.
- Look at this as two halves of the development with green right up the spine. It's troublesome to see so much asphalt; I think you can use your drives more efficiently and deal with the long view of just cars.
- Vinyl is destroying the earth, I'd have a hard time voting for it.
- Vinyl comes in 2 or 3 "boards" so you see the seam whereas cement board siding, they stagger the boards like they would with wood. It would have to be a really high quality product so it doesn't curl like the cheap ones.
- Vinyl does not wear well. Just looking at some of the projects in my neighborhood that were very early on new development for downtown and they're really looking shabby now. If we want our buildings to stand the test of time vinyl is not a good choice.
- Where it would really be apparent with vinyl is where there are some of these larger elevations that are not broken up.
- My position has always been I'm not fond of vinyl at all, but I think it's up to the Commission.

**ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

No rankings were provided for this project.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 4525 Secret Garden Drive**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>								

General Comments:

- Create a true grand promenade of green.