City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT	OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 23, 2014			
TITLE:	711 State Street – Exterior Remodeling in the Downtown Core, "Subway." 8 th Ald.	REFERRED:			
	Dist. (33310)	REREFERRED:			
		REPORTED BACK:			
AUTHOR: Jay Wendt, Acting Secretary		ADOPTED:	POF:		
DATED: April 23, 2014		ID NUMBER:			

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Dawn O'Kroley, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Tom DeChant, Lauren Cnare and Cliff Goodhart.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 23, 2014, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of exterior remodeling in the Downtown Core located at 711 State Street for 'Subway." Appearing on behalf of the project were Bill Montelbano and Pat McGowan, representing the University Book Store. The outdoor eating area has been raised from the lower level to street level, the stair has been consolidated and shifted to the east to be closer to the main entrance of the existing building. They attempted to make the entrance to the Subway below more transparent by using a different style of railing (gable rather than picket), and they opened up the basement wall that faces into the Subway store. The sign has been removed from the building and incorporated into the railing. The stair will be built from concrete in order to minimize space in that area, there will be no space hidden beneath the stairs.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- I remember that Subway sign that was to be integrated with the fence, and it was not going to be those colors, we asked about that and they said it was possible. I know I've seen it done elsewhere so I know it's possible, and that's what we asked for, not a sign like this that doesn't really fit in.
 - The integrated in I took as part of the fence not on the building. We certainly can do something about the colors. To do something that could be swapped in or out easier would be preferable to us. Something other than Subway colors they'll just have to deal with. You'll know it's a Subway.

I think we need to upscale this mall. We need aluminum lettering or something. I would line that up differently on the fence.

- What about putting it back on the strip on the face of the building?
 - We were told we would not be allowed to put it on the face of the building. If the size is OK and the material should change, we can certainly change that. If the location of this down in the fence makes more sense, that can be changed. If you think it might make sense to put it on the soffit, I think that would make some sense also. The sign is, for us, a fairly insignificant part.

- If we just made it smaller so it extended within the two posts, the proportions would be better.
- I assume that you aligned this with the new State Street Mall design for the 700-800 blocks, in terms of the entryway and such?
 - Yes. In fact they're using granite pavers in there and we're thinking we might want to extend those granite pavers into our space.
- The integrity of the cables to lower the sign within the body of the fence, it's above the top rail, any thoughts on that?
 - I'd prefer to see it in the rail, but they need to be able to interchange that. If they can figure out a way to do that interchanging, and have an interior fence that'd be great.
- Make sure you have lighting in that area at night.
- You could have metal letters that the cable runs through. Instead of a panel you'd have letters floating in there that you could see through. That's doable, that's sharp.

ACTION:

On a motion by O'Kroley, seconded by Harrington, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (6-0). The motion provided for the following:

- Explore the possibility of signage below the top of the guard rail.
- Explore using a metal sign with muted colors, no plastic.
- The stairwell shall be well-lighted and clearstory maintained.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall rating for this project is 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 711 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	-	-	-	5	-	-	6

General Comments:

- Integrate sign with fence.
- Durable metal sign.