

## AGENDA # 9

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION      **PRESENTED:** March 19, 2014

TITLE:      202 East Washington Avenue -  
                Redevelopment of the "Pahl Tire" Site  
                for a 10-Story, 146-150 Room  
                "Courtyard by Marriott Hotel." 2nd  
                Ald. Dist. (33109)

**REFERRED:**  
**REREFERRED:**  
**REPORTED BACK:**

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary      **ADOPTED:**      **POF:**

DATED: March 19, 2014      **ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley, Cliff Goodhart and John Harrington.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of March 19, 2014, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a 10-story hotel building located at 202 East Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were Josh Wilcox and Dennis Lynch, both representing North Central Group. Wilcox presented updates and changes to the proposed development. A continuous base will run across the entire East Washington Avenue and Webster Street façades. They have added a canopy, added the storefront and enhanced the glass at the corners a bit more. The interior food component is now pushed back about 4-feet, which increases the guest traffic circulation area, alleviating any possible crowding on the sidewalk, and gives them the opportunity to add tables and chairs to the sidewalk area. The canopy adds strength to the façade and takes your eye away from the garage entry. The shared access agreement is still evolving. Short-term parking has been removed from the rear yard, which is now proposed as a mechanical location.

The Secretary reiterated the Planning Division’s concerns with the project, which include glass sitting on top of masonry with glass on top of the building, with no balance or carry through; the lack of stepback or step down on Webster Street which is now required as part of the Lamp House Ad Hoc Committee, and the interface with the Lamp House and the shared drive access.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- Where the sidewalk changes from a flush to a non-flush condition, make sure that there is something to alert people to the change in elevation.
    - One of the things we’re exploring there is using different paving throughout the entire valet sequence. We’re also looking at bringing in bollards to that area, but that was something that wasn’t very well received by Traffic Engineering.
- Just beware of the trip hazard where there’s transitions. But I think this is really an exciting piece here.

- I like the direction you're going in. We don't want that corner to be too transparent. I'm not sure the proportions are right.
- The valet parking, I'm still concerned with the bike lane there. I think that's something to work with the City on. Coming in and out of there creates a problem.
- Maybe explore green roofs. If you want the two bonus stories it has to be something exceptional. You've got a nice building here but you need to tell us why, what you're going to do that is so much better that deserves the bonus stories.
- I'm not convinced this is there yet for the plus two bonus stories. I almost wonder about 3-9, what if they were 3-7, I don't know how that gets resolved. Architecturally the canopy really seems to support the overall composition of the building, but we need to look at the case with the canopy, that portion of sidewalk in my opinion is claimed by the hotel. That whole section will feel like vehicles in and out, there's driveways in and out. I don't know that I would see furniture out there as a successful use of public space, like a café spilling out onto the street would have. With that said, if we accept this is vehicular, you've created this beautiful piece on the corner, let me in. As I'm walking towards it wouldn't it be beautiful to walk by it and enter on the backside on East Washington. If you had an exterior entry it could be very enlivening for that space too.
  - From a security standpoint we have one main entrance.
- The idea from East Washington Avenue, to get a sense of that volume what if that volume was projecting from the base rather than being flush with the base? What if you pulled this back 5-feet? You would now start your hotel sequence and your entry, your guests would feel like they're arriving once they see that projection. It's a perception that I'm here, I've arrived, let's park the car and get in that glass volume.
- They have the dining area on Webster. Thinking of the Tenney building where the coffee shop has the openness, with nice weather. If some of that openness could be thought about for the dining area along Webster, that might make it seem less like an auto space. I don't think that complicates your controlled entry.
- It would be fantastic if you could reinforce the outdoor Lamp House room and not have mechanical stuff. If you had a way to shift the mechanicals closer to the Mullins building, where you have your stair and restroom core now, that would seem reasonable. Then let the outdoor room remain an outdoor room.
  - We have to be conscious that the mechanicals need room to breathe. We're limited in where we can exhaust air and bring air in, and the idea of noise, for the hotel guests themselves as well as other neighborhood residents.

Unless there's daylighting in the pool, maybe the mechanicals go above the pool.

- Thank you for considering the possibility of future buildings, that doesn't always happen.
- One of our concerns was bringing some of the vertical elements from the top and the middle down to the base. Is there a relationship between the proportions of your openings and the wall panels that line up with the rhythm of the windows?
  - This plane is set back from this plane by 3-feet, just to give you a sense of that.
- So there's a relationship between the top and the bottom without making them the same material. So there's a carry through of the vertical proportions.
- The number of stories is still a significant issue for staff. We feel that you can reallocate your rooms to actually meet the height requirement here. That's still going to be a problem.
  - We provided more stepbacks.

So it is different.

You can see the stepback effect that's occurring.

- It would be better if you could show some stepbacks in terms of context with the other buildings.
- It would be a valuable perspective to look at the massing of the US Bank. Even if it's an outlined section, not a complicated drawing or anything.

- Integration with surrounding materials, the proportions of the openings.
- The VTech panels, I think you'll have the most success if right now you think of them as an opening. When I look at the massing you have a very strong grid of solid, with openings around it. Right now it looks to me like you're sticking an opening in what you wish were solid, so as you look at your proportion of a bay, integrated with the glass.
- Consider it is an opening in the wall.
- Right now you have a solid and void composition. That VTech to me is void, and you have it on a solid, so just as you massage your openings and your grid...

**ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 7 and 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 202 East Washington Avenue**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	6/7	-	-	-	6	8	7

General Comments:

- Nice direction.
- Building design has beautiful aspects/details. However, the building can and should be exceptional.