

## AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

**PRESENTED:** January 22, 2014

TITLE: 617 North Segoe Road – Conditional Use-  
Existing Zoning NMX – 12-Story  
Apartment Building. 11<sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist.  
(32843)

**REFERRED:**

**REREFERRED:**

**REPORTED BACK:**

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

**ADOPTED:**

**POF:**

DATED: January 22, 2014

**ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: 2029, 2033, 2037 South Park Street & 2032 Taft Street

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of January 22, 2014, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a conditional use located at 617 North Segoe Road. Appearing on behalf of the project were Randy Bruce and Don Schroeder, representing Stoddard Arms, LLP; and James Stoppie. Registered and speaking in opposition was Steve Kihm, representing the Weston Place Condominium Association. Registered in opposition but not wishing to speak were David Cloninger, Mary Gillham and Beverly Balekhovsky. Bruce presented the site plan and noted that they have held several meetings with surrounding neighbors. Plans call for a mixed-use development with commercial across the front face of the building on Segoe Road and 15 parking stalls. Access to the main underground parking area will be off the driveway on Segoe Road. The background of the building is masonry and glass, with a projection around the front corner of the building in a metal skin with glass. The neighbors are concerned with the proximity of this new building to theirs (Weston Place). Alternatives (rougher in form) include taking the same plan and dropping one floor, eliminating the first floor commercial space, making first floor parking as a standalone residential building, which would allow them to eliminate the driveway on the north side of the building, which helps with sunlight issues. They also looked at ways to modify the footprint, by making it more rectilinear to maximize the amount of separation between Weston Place and this building, or an L-shaped building. The shared driveway that connects Segoe Road to Frey Street is already congested so there is concern about adding traffic to the area. The neighbors would like them to pursue the possibility of getting access to Segoe Road, keeping access on the north side of the building to the major parking area.

Steve Kihm spoke as the president of the Weston Place Condominium Association, and they have been engaged in conversations with Bruce and Stoppie. They have filed nine (9) pages of comments. Their concerns include the effects to the skyline of having two 12-story buildings next to each other, and how that effects the aesthetics. This does not seem very well planned out. They support development in this area but ask for some sense of complementary design and symmetry.

Jim Stoppie spoke in support. He stated that Traffic Engineering feels this development will bring less traffic than the Associated Bank that operated on this site. They looked at walkability and mass transit, and they feel it is an ideal location for density.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- The DOT is requesting 600,000 square feet of office space for their uses on the Hill Farms site a block from this site in question. The RFP for this development will be coming in May. The rest of the site's development has not been planned. There are big changes in store for Sheboygan Avenue.
- What are the shared goals that you have with the neighbors?
  - Having high quality housing here is a shared goal for everybody. Where the density level is, is not necessarily a common understanding. If we eliminate the first floor commercial that takes the building height down and reduces 15 surface parking stalls. We're somewhat flexible in terms of the building shape and perimeter, although Jim feels strongly that if we were to take this building and make it a floor shorter that that's the best approach.
- Have you tried flipping the "L" so that the projection came out to the street but the main body was in the back, pushing that notch towards Weston Place? That might let more sunlight in too.
  - I think by putting the "L" in this direction we felt it opened up more view lines from Weston Place. That was our thought process.
- I strongly encourage you to eliminate the retail, I think the retail is superfluous, it's not going to add anything. I would much prefer to see you activate the street by actually having some of the entrances come directly from that first floor. It would make it feel much less monolithic. In terms of the various shapes, I appreciate what the neighbors want and I appreciate trying to create that greater space, I definitely do not think the block works, it's going to have a very funny feel to it. I think trying to fight Traffic on that is a non-starter; if they told you where you need to go in and out then that's where you need to go in and out. I would say for the benefit of the neighbors, across the street on Segoe Road there's going to be a considerable amount of density, eventually you're not even going to see the Weston Place building coming from Middleton, there will be entirely new development there. As far as this building really having a negative impact on the aesthetics of Weston Place, I think it's actually going to fit in quite nicely overall.
- I would much rather see units on the ground floor. Imagining what is happening at Hilldale, and what will happen at Hill Farms, that space would just sit empty and nobody wants to see that. I'm not really sure as a citizen driving around if I would really notice the difference between the square and the "L," but I would think the "L" would give you an opportunity for better units with daylight.
  - The "L" shaped one is a bit problematic in that we create a dead zone.
- The "L" shaped design picks up something about the horizontal line on the neighboring building. If you get rid of the retail, now you've brought down that elevation and there's a major break point now the two kind of tie together on the street front, acknowledging one another.
- Go for "PD" zoning and eliminate the retail to activate the street with first floor entries.

### **ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall rating for this project is 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 617 North Segoe Road**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	6	7	-	-	-	-	-	-
	7	6	-	-	-	7	7	7

General Comments:

- Good high-rise design, better than average.
- Recommend eliminating retail and lower building.