

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: December 4, 2013

TITLE: 741 East Mifflin Street/754 East Washington Avenue/10 North Livingston Street – PD(GDP-SIP), Amended Signage Plan for a Mixed-Use Development, Blade Signs – The Constellation. 2nd Ald. Dist. (24584)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: December 4, 2013

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Dawn O’Kroley, John Harrington, Melissa Huggins, Henry Lufler, Richard Slayton, Cliff Goodhart and Lauren Cnare.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 4, 2013, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of an amended signage plan for The Constellation located at 741 East Mifflin Street/754 East Washington Avenue/10 North Livingston Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Christopher Gosch and Peter Siepe, both representing Gebhardt Development; Lindsey Lee, the owner of Cargo Coffee; Angela Black, representing Constellation Project, LLC; Bridget Growney, Kevin Andersen, Nicki Andersen and TJ Blitz. Gosch stated that in discussions with Cargo Coffee, the previously approved blade sign for Cargo Coffee and The Constellation at 48 square feet has changed to a sign exclusively for Cargo Coffee and about 32 square feet. Four blade signs would be added to the building identification signage package. Lee spoke to the importance of prominent signage for local small business owners. The Secretary reviewed what was previously approved for this project, including a larger blade sign in the current location, four walls for the tenant spots on East Washington Avenue, an identification entrance sign on the first floor at Livingston Street and a monument ground sign for the project. The Secretary noted that when you have projecting signs and ground signs there is a provision that says if you have a ground sign and a projecting sign, only one can exceed 12 square feet; thus the signage package is in conflict with the sign ordinance.

Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- I took issue with the signage above because it was affecting the architectural lines of the building. These don’t ruin the architectural lines.
- Have you considered minimizing or getting rid of the monument sign?
 - We can’t get rid of the monument sign. We’re tied into a lease to have the monument sign.
- They feel more like banners to me. The design of this building is very simplistic and this kind of adds something to it, to some extent. This is a busy street, we want our businesses to be successful. While there are times when signs seem out of control I don’t believe this is one of those times.

- As I look at this perspective, the building's big, the sign's relatively small, they don't project out past the overhang of the building, and they're integrated into the column lines of the building pretty well. If there's only four of them, I don't have a problem with it either.
- The Cargo Coffee sign, I have some issue with it being so different than the banner signs.
- You can actually see the sign when you're driving by without having to turn your head, it's in your line of sight.

ACTION:

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-1) with O'Kroley voting no.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall rating for this project is 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 10 North Livingston Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	7	-	7	7
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	-