

Architecture Planning

June 21, 2013

Mr. Chip Harry L. Brown, III Government Assistance and Training Specialist Wisconsin Historical Society 816 State Street Madison, WI 53706-1482

Re: Dane County Lake View Sanatorium Dormitory for Help 1206 Northport Drive Madison, WI 53704

Dear Chip:

Following please find our Project Narrative Description for the proposed deconstruction of the Dane County Lake View Sanatorium Dormitory for Help.

## **Present Use**

The Lake View Campus was converted to Dane County Human Services office use in the 1960's. The Dormitory for Help underwent a renovation in 1976. By the early 1990's the Dormitory for Help was no longer occupied and used for file storage. The three story 19,260 SF building is unoccupied.

The majority of exterior masonry of the essentially utilitarian structure with subtle Art Deco influences remains intact. A deconstruction strategy is included evaluating materials suitable for salvage and reuse.

The entire property is zoned Conservancy, under the zoning code which went into effect January 1, 2013.

#### Background

The Dormitory for Help (also referred to as the Nurse's Dormitory) is one of the contributing structures of the Lake View Sanatorium State and National Register of Historic Places 1993 listing (**Appendix 1**). Per the listing, the Dormitory for Help was constructed in 1934 to house the entire staff to allow the staff living quarters on the fourth floor of the Main Sanatorium Building constructed in 1929-1930, serve as additional patient rooms.

The Lake View Sanatorium was nominated under criterion A and C. The statement of significance indicates the distinctive design characteristics of the tuberculosis sanatorium in support of the open air treatment philosophy and the essential curative effects of opens space for exercise and fresh air before the discovery of penicillin to cure the disease. Features of significance include the isolated, hill-top location; landscaped grounds with paths so patients could walk and exercise; 'germ traps'; and porches for patients to take full advantage of the fresh air. All features were noted as typical of the medical establishment's view of the appropriate method of treatment before the discovery and wide use of penicillin to cure the disease. The facility is also listed for its local significance in the area of health/medicine. The architectural features of significance including the porches and small anterior chamber called a 'germ trap' are features of the Main Sanatorium Building.

# **Historical Significance and Alternatives**

A Phase I Environmental Audit of a Portion of the Old Lakeview Sanatorium Property was prepared by Philip H. Salkin of Archeological Consulting and Services, Inc. in the summer of 1999 (**Appendix 2**).

From April through June 2008, Great Lakes Archaeological Research Center (GLARC) conducted a Historical, Archaeological, and Geological Geatures Inventory of the Lake View County Park (**Appendix 3**). The study confirmed that the two potential prehistoric archaeological sites identified on the property are not of prehistoric origin. The report indicates the Lake View Sanatorium is listed on the NRHP on the basis of architecture of the Main Sanatorium Building and the facilities contribution to the health/medicine including the use of fresh air, moderate activity and creation of community.

In July 2011, The Lake View Hill Park Cultural Landscape Evaluation prepared by Quinn Evans Architects (**Appendix 4**) included the following Dormitory Area Conceptual Treatment Recommendations (page IV.7):

- 1. \* Repair and maintain the historic sidewalks at the north and west sides of the Dormitory;
- 2. \* Plant native deciduous trees on north and west sides of building to replace lost and elderly historic trees;
- 3. \* Preserve the lawn on the south side of the building;
- *4.* #+ Implement storm water management and erosion control measures that are holistic and sensitive to the historic fabric of the property;
- 5. \* Interpret the location of the historic service drive along the eastern property boundary;
- #+ It is recommended that the dormitory be rehabilitated for an adaptive reuse that is 6 compatible with the current use and historic character of the Lake View property. Dane County does not have funds for rehabilitating the dormitory and does not need the building for office or storage space. The county has given permission to the Friends of Lake View Hill to explore possibilities for rehabilitating the building. The Friends of Lake View Hill will pursue a grant to fund a feasibility study and will seek partners who have interest. experience, and funding that could be used toward rehabilitating the building. The feasibility study will assess the financial potential of rehabilitating the dormitory for a specific use or list of uses that are compatible with the Human Services Campus and park use. The study will be unique in that it will facilitate a decision-making process that will result in the stakeholders stating acceptable uses for the property, and parameters that apply. The proposed use should be compatible with the existing site limitations related to parking, vehicular circulation, storm water management, and the Conservancy zoning of the overall property. The study will clearly indicate if there is an identified need for the proposed use in this location. If the Friends of Lake View Hill are not successful in finding partners by January 2012, Dane County will pursue steps toward demolition of the building. Following demolition, the county will develop a plan for a park gathering space with interpretive materials related to the historic aspects of the property. The design of the space will strive to respect the integrity of the remaining historic landscape.

In support of the preservation of historic cultural landscape features and recommendation 2 above, Dane County completed a Tree Inventory of this area of Lake View Hill Park, March 11, 2013 (**Appendix 5**).

In 2008 and 2009, Dane County contracted with Dorschner|Associates, Inc. to complete a study of the Lake View Campus to determine goals and requirements for future projects for the continued rehabilitation of the Lake View Campus to provide office space to meet the needs of Dane County departments, divisions and offices. This study included 6 departments and/or their sub-units to determine space needs, evaluate existing building conditions and provide an estimate of probable construction cost meeting the Secretary of the Interiors Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Properties (**Appendix 6**). This study concluded Dane County does not have the demand for office space for the rehabilitation of the Nurse's Dormitory to provide additional office space. The estimate of probable construction cost for the rehabilitation of the Nurse's Dormitory for office use was in excess of \$3 million in 2009. Dane County has also contracted with Dorschner|Associates to complete space needs assessments involving approximately 20 additional departments and/or their sub-units. Relocation of these departments to the Lake View Campus is not suitable due to required departmental adjacencies and public access.

An appraisal completed for Dane County by Tenny Albert, Wisconsin Certified General Appraiser #154, provided an opinion of estimated market value of \$575,000 on August 30, 2001, for a total of 4 acres including the Dormitory for Help assuming rezoning to PUD, access to Northport Drive, an approved density of 15 units per acre and the approval for the demolition of the structure, not including abatement.

The building and contents are currently insured for approximately \$1.7million.

In 2004, the Dane County Board amended the 2001-2005 Parks and Open Space Plan to include Lake View Hill as a recreation park. In 2008-2009, Ken Saiki Design completed the Lake View Hill Park Master Plan (**Appendix 7**). The Master Plan provides recommendations on the role of the park and landscape providing information and interpretive opportunities that highlight the history of the site. The Park's adjacency to residential neighborhoods and schools creates opportunities to enhance the site's diverse educational potential.

In July, 2012 Dane County contracted with Urban Assets to help determine the future of the Nurse's Dormitory (**Appendix 8**). The report concluded Dane County does not have a use for the building, but at the request of the various stakeholders had allowed the opportunity to explore if there were a viable reuse of the building. Of the suggestions for various uses raised interesting possibilities, they lacked two key elements – a champion willing to lead the project and the prospect of financial feasibility, based on the history of similar projects and current market conditions.

The report also summarizes the 2009 Northport-Warner Park-Sherman Neighborhood Plan and Friends of Lake View Hill Park efforts in the entire property's land use designation as conservancy. Based on the zoning code, the only permitted use would be the construction of a gathering area and shelter. All other uses would either require the approval of the Planning Director, approval through a conditional use process, or a full rezoning as a Planned Development.

The report indicates an Ad Hoc committee formed in 2012 to guide the recommended next steps developed three principles for decision making to guide the future of the Nurses' Dormitory. First, the solution should be a shared community asset that is available to the public, creates an opportunity to educate, and has a positive impact on the neighborhood and the community. Second, the solution should contribute to the conservation of the natural and historical landscape and its role in the story of healing. And third, the solution should be financially feasible.

The report indicates that given the results of the research, and within the context of the decision making principals, Urban Assets recommended the following:

- 1. While the Nurses' Dormitory is a contributing factor to the historic designation of the former sanatorium and the Lake View Hill Park, it is not a determining factor. There are many elements within the park that will continue to tell the story of the property and the proper reuse of the site will facilitate that story.
- 2. Due to the current condition of the building and the lack of a feasible reuse within a reasonable time frame, the Nurses' Dormitory should be demolished.
- Based on the Conservancy zoning, the only permitted use for the site, beyond allowing it to return to its natural state, is as a gathering area or park shelter. *The 2009 Lake View Hill Park Master Plan* recommends the development of additional gathering areas and structures (LVHPMP p.33) within the park which would allow opportunities for environmental education and historical-cultural resource interpretation. Not including, however, covered shelters (LVHPMP p. 35).
- 4. While the plan recommends the fountain as a potential site for a gathering area, the demolition of the Nurses' Dorm creates an additional opportunity for creating a gathering space that incorporates both the natural environment **and** the history of the park's built environment. Indeed, the plan identifies the site of the Nurses' Dorm as an appropriate location for historical-cultural resource interpretation (LVHPMA p.25). The creation of a gathering space that incorporates elements of the original building within a natural setting will provide a space for the education and enjoyment of the community.
- 5. Working collaboratively, the County, the Friends of Lake Hill View Park, and neighborhood residents should develop a clear plan for the site's reuse within the context of the park's history, current use, existing plans, and opportunities for their implementation. The hiring of a professional consultant to guide this process is highly recommended.
- 6. Future reuse of the site should address the storm water management issues including restoration of the historic watercourse to the south to accommodate roof drainage from the DCDHS building (LVHPMP p. 30) as well as other issues related to the drainage of the parking area.
- 7. The DCDHS should relinquish management of the property to Public Works to coordinate the demolition of the building followed by the Parks Department to coordinate the planning and future reuse of the site.
- 8. The County should carefully deconstruct the building in order to preserve key architectural and historical elements that could be used in the future reuse of the site to help depict the historical-cultural interpretation.

Please refer to **Appendix 8** for the Urban Assets report including a timeline beginning on Page 15 including the above and additional assessment of the assets on the site, options considered and the option chosen to pursue.

In May 2013, Dane County contracted Dorschner|Associates, Urban Assets and Ken Saiki Design to continue involvement with the public including the Friends of Lake View Hill Park, focus groups with MMSD and other park users, preservationists and area elected officials in the development of interpretive gathering area design concepts incorporating materials that would be salvaged from the Dormitory for Help.

# Integrity

After our review of the significance, we evaluated the seven aspects of integrity and the Lake View Sanatorium's ability to convey its significance: Location, Design, Setting, Materials, Workmanship, Feeling and Association.

While listed as a contributing building within the property, the physical features of the Dormitory for Help are not essential physical features in the ability of the property to convey its significance.

## **Deconstruction Strategy**

Deconstruction involves carefully removing materials that can be reused and recycled.

Exterior material salvage from the deconstruction of the Dormitory for Help would provide opportunities for reuse in an interpretive site element to both display the historical significance of the site and continue to encourage the connection between people and open space. Visitors to this site will be provided with information as to the history of the site and the Dormitory for Help.

Photo documentation including architectural digital photography, with views required similar to the Historic American Building Survey (HABS) standards, would be compiled prior to deconstruction.

The following key elements observed to be in good condition and have excellent potential to be salvaged and reused. Habitat ReStore will be contacted to deconstruct and resell materials not salvaged for reuse in the interpretive site element or display. Any remaining items that Habitat ReStore cannot take would be marketed accordingly. Also please see attached images at the end of this report.

- Exterior masonry including brick, datestone, watertable including the extension of the watertable cap feature at exterior stairs, entry door surrounds, pilaster capitols (*Images 1-5, 11 and 12*).
- Wood doors and windows, including interior openings typical the south facing rooms (Image 6). Original exterior wood doors and windows (*exterior images and Image 9 of a typical window from the interior*).
- · Original hardware that remains and wood handrails in the interior stairs.
- Original light fixtures in restrooms (*Image 7*) and at the main entry (*Image 10*).
- Built in cabinets on first floor (Image 8).

Dane County requires that as many waste materials as possible produced as a result of a project be salvaged, reused or recycle in order to minimize the impact of construction waste on landfills and to minimize expenditure of energy and cost in fabricating new materials per the Dane County Green Building Policy, Resolution 299, 1999-2000. A comprehensive reuse and recycling plan would be completed meeting Dane County and the City of Madison requirements. Materials suitable for recycling include, but are not limited to: wood, asphalt, wiring and components, toilets and lavatories and metal.

Hazardous materials will be appropriately removed and disposed of.

The historic cultural landscape will be protected during the deconstruction.

Dane County would identify a protected environment to store salvaged materials prior to their reuse or display.

**Appendix 9** includes drawings reflecting the floor plan layout of the Dormitory for Help and lighting modifications from the 1976 renovation.

In summary, the deconstruction of the Dormitory for Help creates an opportunity for a public asset that incorporates both the natural environment, the history of the built environment and will continue the site's historic significance in connecting people with the natural environment. This gathering area will be located to preserve the Historic Cultural Landscape and is a permitted use within the Conservancy Zoning.

Sincerely,

Dawn O'Kroley, AIA, NCARB Principal

# DORSCHNER

Architecture Planning

Dormitory for Help Salvage and Reuse Images Dorschner|Associates, Inc. and Dane County Public Works



Image 1 Dormitory for Help



Image 2 Dormitory for Help Main Elevation



Image 3 Dormitory for Help



Image 4 Exterior Door to west stair



Image 5 Exterior door to east stair



Image 6 Wood door and window, interior, typical south facing rooms



Image 7 Restroom with original light fixtures



Image 8 Built in cabinets, first floor



Image 9 Typical wood window



Image 10 Original light fixture, main entry, first floor



Image 11 Main Entry



Image 12 Datestone and concrete watertable



Image 13, View to Main Sanatorium from Northport. Dormitory for Help is shielded from view by trees and shrubs