



Madison Water Utility

Tom Heikkinen – General Manager
Alan L. Larson P.E. – Principal Engineer

119 E. Olin Avenue
Madison, Wisconsin 53713
Telephone: 608 266-4651
FAX: 608 266-4426

MEMORANDUM

Date: August 27, 2013

To: Water Utility Board

From: Al Larson
Principal Engineer

Re: **Lakeview Reservoir**
Recommendation to the Board for Engineering Services

Background

The Lakeview Reservoir currently is undersized at 55,000 gallons and has reached the end of its useful life. The reservoir was inherited by the Utility when the area was annexed to the City. The 2006 Water Master Plan identified Pressure Zone 5 as an area that does not meet current Utility fire flow capacity standards. The 2006 Master Plan also identified a storage deficiency in the north end of the system within Pressure Zone 6E. This deficiency in Zone 6E was confirmed during the 2011/2012 East Side Water Supply evaluation of the system. It is proposed to provide 300,000 gallons of storage to Zone 5 and 1,000,000 gallons of storage to Zone 6E.

Request for Proposal (RFP) and Advertising

A request for engineering design services was prepared for the project. The RFP was electronically transmitted to the standard engineering firm distribution list which includes over 30 different companies. The RFP was posted on the Utility web page and it was advertised on two separate days in the Wisconsin State Journal.

Proposals

Four proposals were received on August 16, 2013 and distributed that same day to a review committee of three Water Utility employees with expertise and knowledge of the project, Al Larson and Dennis Cawley from Engineering, and Joe DeMorett from Supply.

Review

The proposals were all reviewed and rated independently by each member of the committee. The committee then met on Thursday August 22nd. The proposals were very evenly matched in quality and qualifications. The proposals were evaluated on two main categories:

1. Project Understanding
 - a. Why the project is needed
 - b. Public Participation needs
 - c. Schedule
 - d. Understanding of the Madison process
2. Project Qualifications
 - a. Project Team
 - b. Work Experience
 - c. Project Management
 - d. Cost controls
 - e. Work samples
 - f. Madison approval process

Submitted hours were considered as a part of the evaluation as a demonstration of the effort expected and as a demonstration of project understanding. Submitted hours and costs are as follows:

	Hours	Costs
SEH, Inc	1970	\$245,000
Baxter Woodman	1152	\$127,500
Strand Assoc.	1690-2450	\$245,000-\$345,000
AECOM	710	\$109,423

Based on all information received, the proposals were ranked as follows:

	#1	#2	#3
SEH, Inc	1	1	1
Baxter Woodman	2	2	2
Strand Assoc.	3	3	3
AECOM	4	4	4

Recommendation

Based on all of the information submitted, SEH Inc. was judged by all reviewers to be the most qualified Firm for this project. They have recent and very relevant experience with utility water tower construction. Projects listed include: Superior WI, Winona MN, LaCrosse WI, and Inver Grove Heights MN.

SEH Inc. provided a comprehensive description of the project and a detailed work plan that clearly demonstrated their understanding of the project, MWU needs, the

challenges that we will face in completing the project, and all of the tasks needed to gain approval and acceptance of the project by the regulating authorities and the neighborhood.

The costs and projected hours submitted by SEH with their proposal further reinforced their depth of understanding of the project and the challenges of developing a project that will meet the Utility's needs. While their proposal did not include the lowest projected hours and cost, it was supported by the detail provided in the work plan and the anticipated effort to complete this complicated project.

Following a comprehensive evaluation of all materials submitted the committee unanimously recommends that SEH, Inc. be retained for project development, design and construction services for the reconstruction of the Lakeview Reservoir.