

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: August 12, 2013

TITLE: Buildings Proposed for Demolition -
2013

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: August 12, 2013

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Stuart Levitan, Chair; David McLean, Christina Slattery, Erica Fox Gehrig and Michael Rosenblum.

SUMMARY:

Do we as a Commission see any change in the status quo as a bad thing in the context of the Lamp House? If the Commission ultimately advises the Plan Commission that this is so large as to be visually intrusive and recommend against it on its merits, to have pre-judged it and say any change by definition could cast some doubt on the Commission's independent evaluation of the project on its merits. If we oppose any demolition on Webster Street because it's going to destroy the historical context, then how could we have independently judged the proposal as submitted?

The historic value of these buildings needs to stand alone, and it is adjacent to a historic landmark.

And the fact that this historic building has unique siting and views.

The precedence of what comes next when those houses comes down is sitting blocking the east and southern exposures and viewsheds from a landmark, which was not intended as originally built. There's some uniqueness to these houses relative to the landmark adjacent.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 17, 19, 25 North Webster Street and 201 East Mifflin Street do have historical value. The Commission deeply regrets the continued threatened loss of the historical fabric, especially given the architectural consistency and contemporaneous construction of the properties. The Commission is further deeply concerned about the demolition in light of the proposed major project adjoining the historic landmark site which was originally constructed in light of its land context.

Dorschner and Associates has done mitigation and reuse studies on the building at 1206 Northport Drive. The neighborhood wishes to see an interpretive space/gathering area in place of the nurses' dormitory. It's zoned Conservancy. This property was evaluated and found to not be significant enough to be named a landmark property. This is a contributing structure on the site of the Lakeview Sanitarium for the National Register. The

Commission calls the Plan Commission's attention to the fact that this is a contributing building in a National Register District. Given what the Commission has learned about the trails, the water feature, the separation from the buildings and the purposeful siting of buildings, demolition would significantly alter the historical landscape. Given the limited amount of time the Commission has had to review this property, they could have formed a more educated opinion.

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the neighborhood has requested a gathering space and Dorschner and Associates is going to put together numerous options for what that gathering space may become (1206 Northport Drive). One of those options could be the retention of the foundation, then the foundation and exterior walls become this "thing" that is interpreted in the landscape. It sits into the hill so it would need a decent handrail, but there is some way to retain the building in a smaller, lower form as part of this garden outdoor gathering space. We note with concern that the proposed demolition of a contributing structure in a historic district and urge that if the demolition is approved that the gathering space and interpretive use preserves the historical existence of the structure into the gathering space. The consultants shall photo document the building before demolition. The motion passed by a voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 425 West Washington Avenue has no known historic value and no known preservation file. The Commission further welcomes the more intensive use and redevelopment of the property. The motion passed by voice vote/other.