Regarding:	1908 Arlington Place - University Heights Local Historic District – Exterior alteration involving the modification of original door pair to windows. 5th Ald. District. Contact: Barry Stoner (Legistar #27813)

Date:	October 1, 2012
Prepared By:	Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

General Information:

The Applicant is proposing to remove an original pair of doors on the side elevation and infill the opening with a pair of casement windows. The wall below the windows will be infilled with stucco to match the adjacent stucco texture.

Relevant Sections of the Landmarks Ordinance:

33.19(12)(d) <u>Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs in R2 and R4A Zoning Districts.</u>

6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Additions visible from the street, including additions to the top of buildings or structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing building in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations and additions shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing building or of other buildings in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing building where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)

Staff Comments and Recommendations:

Staff does not believe that the proposed design meets the criteria in the Ordinance as the design destroys architectural features. Staff suggests the following two alternate solutions for consideration:

- 1. Repair the existing doors and make them weather-tight. Install new storm doors to further aid in the weather-tightening and securing of the opening. This solution would meet the Ordinance criteria and be eligible for tax credits.
- 2. Repair door opening (trim and sill) as needed. Install the windows in the opening on a new sill and fill the remaining wall space with a panel instead of stucco. This solution would allow a portion of the original architectural feature to remain and would meet the Ordinance criteria. See sketch below.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alteration are able to be met with design revisions and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the above alternate solutions as conditions of approval.

