

**CITY OF MADISON
INTER-DEPARTMENTAL
CORRESPONDENCE**

REPORT OF THE PRESERVATION PLANNER & THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Date: July 23, 2012

To: Plan Commission

From: Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

Re: 100 Block State Street Development – Proposed exterior alterations to designated Landmarks at 120 West Mifflin Street (Schubert Building) and 125 State Street (Castle & Doyle Building), and new development adjacent to landmarks. 4th Ald. District
(Legistar #26725)

Ordinance: 28.12(12)(c)1.d. The Plan Commission shall consider the report of the City's historic preservation planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report submitted by the Landmarks Commission.

Report:

Attached is the memo of the historic value of the properties involved in this development proposal provided to the Plan Commission on March 18, 2012. The only change to the report that should be noted for consideration by the Plan Commission is that the Buell Building façade is not proposed to be retained and restored in the current development proposal. In reviewing this element of the current proposal, staff and the Landmarks Commission do not oppose the demolition of the Buell Building and believe that the development proposal should be approved.



Department of Planning & Community & Economic Development
Planning Division

Website: www.cityofmadison.com

Madison Municipal Building, Suite LL100
215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard
P.O. Box 2985
Madison, Wisconsin 53701-2985
FAX 608 267-8739
PH 608 266-4635

REPORT OF THE HISTORIC VALUE OF PROPERTIES PROPOSED FOR DEMOLITION :

To: City of Madison Plan Commission
From: Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner
Date: March 16, 2012
Regarding: 100 Block State Street Development - Proposed Demolition of Designated Landmark at 120 West Mifflin Street (Schubert Building), Exterior Alteration to Landmark at 125 State Street (Castle & Doyle Building), and Proposed New Development Adjacent to Landmarks. 4th Ald. Dist.
(Legistar #24480)

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

The purpose and intent of the Landmarks Ordinance (MGO 33.19) is as follows:

It is hereby declared a matter of public policy that the protection, enhancement, perpetuation and use of improvements of special character or special historical interest or value is a public necessity and is required in the interest of health, prosperity, safety and welfare of the people.

The Landmarks Ordinance does not address the determination of the historic value of properties proposed for demolition. The relevant Zoning Code section states:

28.12(12) Approval of Demolition (Razing, Wrecking) and Removal

- (d) The Plan Commission shall consider the report of the City's historic preservation planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report submitted by the Landmarks Commission.

General Information:

During its review of the Block 100 Foundation proposal, the Landmarks Commission found that numerous buildings being proposed for demolition hold historic value and that this information should be conveyed to the Plan Commission for its review of the development proposal. As the Preservation Planner, I agree with the findings of the Landmarks Commission and have provided a summary of the historic value for each building proposed for demolition. In addition to the historic value of individual buildings, these buildings belong to the historic context of State Street and contribute to its overall sense of place.

The historic information contained below was compiled using the City preservation files and information from the National Register Historic District Nomination that was prepared in June of 1995. Although the nomination did not proceed, the historic district was determined to be eligible. Original sources are largely unknown.

117-119 State Street (Haswell Building) – The building exterior retains no historic value.

Constructed in 1916-1917, the original character of the exterior of the Haswell Building has been largely lost to renovations in the 1990s. The building was considered a non-contributing structure in the potential National Register Historic District nomination.

121-123 State Street (Buell Building) – The building has historic value, but staff does not oppose demolition and the retention and restoration of the existing façade.

Constructed in 1912, the Buell Building currently retains the original character of the exterior. The Craftsman style commercial building has been attributed to the architectural firm of Law, Law and Potter (akin to the present day Potter Lawson). The use of the Craftsman style for a commercial building may prove to be unusual in Madison. More historical research would be necessary to determine the level of historic integrity. The Buell Building was considered a contributing structure in the potential National Register Historic District nomination. While retention of the entire building is preferable, the retention and restoration of the historic façade is encouraged as it is adjacent to a designated landmark and contributes to the existing context of the State Street commercial district as an example (possibly rare example) of a Craftsman style commercial building.

127-129 State Street (Vallender Building) – The building has historic value, but staff does not oppose demolition.

Constructed in 1867, the Vallender Building has historic value. The Vallender Building is historically significant due to its German Romanesque Revival style, also called Rundbogenstil or "round arch style", which is rare in Madison. The building embodies the characteristics of a German-built structure and reflects the culture and history of the German influence in the development of Madison. The Vallender Building was considered a contributing structure in the potential National Register Historic District nomination. While restoration of the existing building is possible and would be preferable, due to the visible exterior envelope condition issues, it appears that it is not economically feasible to warrant restoration of the building and therefore staff does not oppose the proposed demolition.

122-124 West Mifflin Street (Stark/Fairchild Building) – The building has historic value and is probably worthy of landmark designation. Staff opposes demolition.

The Fairchild Building was designed by Philip Homer in the Neo-Classical Revival style that was made popular by the Columbian Exposition and was constructed in 1925 for the Paul E. Stark Company. The building was one of the first attempts of any Madison realtor to dignify and make permanent his business by the erection of a fine building designed exclusively as a real estate office. The Neo-Classical Revival style conveyed permanence and stateliness and the simple execution of the proportion and detail expresses Philip Homer's ability to master the style. In addition, it is important to note that the Fairchild Building was constructed within the context of two other buildings in Classical Revival styles; the Kessenich's Building (designated landmark) at the corner of Fairchild and State Streets which was largely demolished for the Overture Center and the Madison Gas and Electric Building at the corner of West Mifflin and Fairchild which was demolished for the Overture Center. More historical research should be conducted to determine the level of historic integrity, but Staff believes this building is probably worthy of landmark designation based on its social history and architectural significance. The Fairchild Building was considered a contributing structure in the potential National Register Historic District.

120 West Mifflin Street (Schubert Building) – This building has historic value and is a designated landmark. Staff opposes demolition.

The Schubert Building was designed by Architect Ferdinand Kronenberg in the Queen Anne style and was constructed in 1908. It was designated a local landmark by the Common Council in February of 2008 based on its architectural significance as a Queen Anne commercial building. The Schubert Building is also one of the only remaining Queen Anne commercial buildings to retain its original storefront including leaded glass transom window. The Schubert Building was considered a contributing structure in the potential National Register Historic District nomination. A more detailed description of the historic value of the building is documented in the landmark nomination which is available in Legistar (#24480).