

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

**REPORT OF:** URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION      **PRESENTED:** May 2, 2012

**TITLE:** 531 West Mifflin Street – PUD(SIP-SIP),  
Building Demolition and Relocation of an  
Existing House to the Site. 4<sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist.  
(25979)      **REFERRED:**  
**REREFERRED:**  
**REPORTED BACK:**

**AUTHOR:** William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary      **ADOPTED:**      **POF:**

**DATED:** May 2, 2012      **ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Dawn O’Kroley, Tom DeChant, Melissa Huggins, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, John Harrington, Henry Lufler and Richard Slayton.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of May 2, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 531 West Mifflin Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Brandon Cook and Matt Aro. Appearing and speaking in opposition was Scott Kolar, representing Capitol Neighborhoods, Inc. Cook addressed the Commission’s previous comments on the project. The trash and recycling has been moved to the back of the lot. The parking has been moved out slightly to address the tree in the backyard. They are proposing permeable paving that would allow some of the stormwater to drain. Access to the laundry has been moved to the backside due to concerns with the doorway; this necessitates taking the steps from the back porch and aligning them out from the building as opposed to the side. The building itself will be resided with fiber cement siding and the walls. The windows in the basement are approximately 3-4 feet high but they can’t go down much lower on the drive side. They have deeper windows on the east side for the lower unit. Bicycle and moped parking has also been moved to allow for less pavement. Scott Kolar stated that since the last Urban Design Commission meeting, the steering committee has decided not to support approval of this particular project. The basis for this decision stems from Mr. Cook’s capacity to be able to complete the project in a reasonable amount of time as it would be approved. Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- The small green area should be a planting bed or ground cover rather than grass. To make this really nice you could actually put in some kind of narrow vertical upright plants in here, even just ornamental grasses or perennials. The Clethra isn’t going to do well for you at that location. I would find a different shrub.
- If the dormer is in disrepair it should be restored. Same for the entry doors.
- The plans show siding with mitered corners instead of corner boards.

## **ACTION:**

On a motion by O’Kroley, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-1) with Rummel voting no. The motion passed with the following conditions:

- The existing dormer and exterior doors shall be restored.
- Staff approval of a revised landscape plan to address the concerns above.
- Fiber cement siding is used, including mitered corners.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 4, 5, 6 and 6.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 531 West Mifflin Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	6	-	5	-	-	6	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	5	-	5	-	-	6	6	6

General Comments:

- Appreciate effort to save nice 3-flat but loss of 1894 vernacular house would be an issue in a neighborhood with a sensibility of historic assets. The scale of 444 West Johnson appears to dominate neighbors in photo rendering.