



Report to the Plan Commission

May 21, 2011

Legistar ID #26139

24 N Webster and 123 East Mifflin Street

Zoning Map Amendment – Planned Unit Development

Report Prepared By:

Kevin Firchow, AICP

Planning Division

Requested Action: The applicant requests approval to rezone 24 North Webster and 123 East Mifflin Street from C4 (Central Commercial District) to PUD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development-General Development Plan-Specific Implementation Plan) for the purpose of constructing a fifth floor addition to an existing mixed-use building.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This project is subject to the standards for zoning map amendments and planned unit developments. Section 28.12 (9) provides the process for zoning map amendments. Section 28.07 (6) provides the requirements and framework for planned unit developments.

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for zoning map amendments and planned unit developments are met and forward Zoning Map Amendment 3604, rezoning 24 North Webster and 123 East Mifflin Street from C4 (Central Commercial District) to PUD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development-General Development Plan-Specific Implementation Plan) to the Common Council with a recommendation of **approval**, subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Applicant / Contact: Anne Neujahr Morrison; Urban Land Interests; 10 E Doty St; Madison, WI 53703

Owner: Capitol Hill Apartments, LLC; c/o ULI; 10 E Doty St; Madison, WI 53703

Proposal: The applicant proposes to renovate the subject fire-damaged 24-unit mixed-use building and add a new fifth story. Upon completion, the project would include roughly 3,000 square feet of ground floor retail with 22 dwelling units located above.

Parcel Locations: The subject site is located at the corner of North Webster and East Mifflin Street, one block off of the Capitol Square. The property is in Aldermanic District 4 and within the limits of the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions: The subject site includes the fire-damaged 24-unit building.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: The 12-story, 67-unit Capitol Point Condominium development, zoned PUD-SIP;

South: One-story bank with drive-up service windows, zoned C4 (Central Commercial District);

East: Small two and three story residential buildings, zoned C2 (General Commercial District); and

West: The landmark Wakeley-Giles building, a three-story mixed-use building with the Bartell Theatre and Capitol Square, zoned C4, beyond.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan includes the subject site within the Downtown Core district. Recommended land uses include mixed-use buildings with first story commercial uses and upper story residential uses. High density residential uses with densities greater than 60 units per acre are also recommended.

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Zoning Summary: These properties are proposed to be rezoned to the “PUD” district.” As there are no predetermined bulk requirements, this project is being compared to the C4 standards for comparative purposes.

Bulk Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area	6,000 sq. ft.	6,138 sq. ft. existing
Lot width	50'	existing
Usable open space	TBD.	existing
Front yard	0'	existing
Side yards	0'	existing
Rear yard	10'	existing
Building height	TBD	5 story
Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number parking stalls	Central area, none required	No proposal
Other Critical Zoning Items	Urban Design Adjacent to a Landmark	

Table Prepared by Patrick Anderson, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Project Review, Analysis, and Conclusion

The applicant requests approval to rezone the subject property from C4 (Central Commercial District) to PUD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development-General Development-Specific Implementation Plan District). The purpose of this zoning change is to allow the applicant to proceed with renovations to a fire-damaged building. This request is subject to the Zoning Map Amendment and Planned Unit Development approval standards.

Summary of Proposal and Building Alterations

The subject building was substantially damaged by a fire on June 30, 2011 and has not been in a habitable condition since. Prior to the fire, the four-story building included 15 efficiencies, four (4) one-bedroom units, five (5) two-bedroom units and ground floor retail spaces. The proposed renovations include the addition of a new fifth story penthouse and changes to some of the existing window openings on the lower stories. The second, third, and fourth floors are being entirely reconfigured with modernized dwelling units. The proposed dwelling units range in size from roughly 570 to 800 square feet. There are approximately 3,000 square feet of ground floor commercial space in the renovated building.

The new fifth story addition is stepped back eight (8) feet along the East Mifflin and North Webster Street. With the addition, the building will have a height of just over 53 feet. The new upper story has

been designed with dark colored aluminum panels, intended to be complementary, yet visually distinct from the existing masonry structure. A horizontal trellis feature will project about thirty inches beyond the addition walls, above the windows. The feature, depicted as red in the colored elevation drawings, is intended to provide architectural interest along the top of the building and provide some shading to the building and adjacent patio spaces.

While most of the existing window openings are being maintained, one row of single windows along the Webster Street side are being widened to include side-by-side windows. This area is called out on the Webster Street Elevation drawing. A similar change is shown on the south elevation. The applicant also proposes to make all of the double hung windows consistent in style. The provided photos show that the building previously included a mixture of double hung styles including single and triple panes of glass over a single pane. The current plans show the windows with a simpler single pane over single pane design. Staff does not object to the proposed double hung windows, noting they have been approved by both the Urban Design Commission and the City's Preservation Planner. The motion of the Landmarks Commission requested the applicant considers using the triple over single pane style ("3 over 1") double hung windows.

While the height of the building is increasing, the proposed unit count is decreasing. Building code requires the applicant to install a new elevator, which has reduced the amount of space available for dwelling units.

Staff notes that no bike parking was previously provided for the 24 building and no designated bike parking is shown on the plans for the renovated 22-unit structure. A follow up memorandum regarding bike parking is provided by the Zoning Administrator regarding this issue. The applicant indicates there are challenges related to providing designated bike parking and will be requesting the Plan Commission remove this condition.

Mix of Dwelling Units

The renovated building will include 22 dwelling units on floors two through five. Dwelling units consist of one (1) efficiency, 16 one-bedroom, and (5) two-bedroom units.

To ensure a variety of housing types in the downtown area, the existing C4 (Central Commercial District) zoning establishes a point system based on the type of dwelling unit (efficiency, one-bedroom, etc). One point is provided for each bedroom of a unit (for example, a two-unit building equals two (2) points). A building's calculated average point value (points divided by the number of dwelling units) can not be less than 1.5. As proposed, the calculated value is 1.18. As such, the project as proposed could not be developed under the existing C4 zoning. Staff notes that the renovated building has more one bedrooms and fewer efficiency units than the original fire damaged structure which had a calculated value of 0.58.

In pre-application discussions, the applicant has indicated that this is their desired unit mix. As such, a rezoning or a variance would need to be approved for the project to proceed as proposed. Based on discussions with the Zoning Administrator and Planning staff, the applicant is pursuing a rezoning of the property to the Planned Unit Development district.

Planned Unit Development Standards

The project is proposed as a Planned Unit Development (PUD). Planned unit developments are intended to promote improved environmental and aesthetic design by allowing for greater freedom, imagination, and flexibility compared to conventional zoning districts. While this is a somewhat atypical

use of a Planned Unit Development (PUD), staff believe this is well-designed project and a thoughtful renovation and rehabilitation proposal that can likely meet the applicable standards, including the four PUD standards.

Recommendations from other City Commissions

The project has received favorable recommendations from both the Landmarks and Urban Design Commissions. On April 16, 2012, the Landmarks Commission unanimously approved a recommendation finding that the proposed development, including a change in window openings, installation of new storefront systems and construction of proposed fifth-story penthouse does not adversely affect the adjacent landmark (the Wakeley-Giles building, located on East Mifflin Street). As noted above, the Commission requested the applicant consider the alternative double hung window design, though that was not a formal requirement. The project also received a unanimous recommendation for Final Approval from the Urban Design Commission at its April 18, 2012 meeting. Minutes from these meetings are attached.

Public Comments

Staff is aware that concerns had previously been raised on this proposal from some residents at the Capitol Point Condominiums, located on the opposite side of Mifflin Street from this site. The applicant has indicated to staff that they have met with the residents of that building and she believes that the previously raised concerns on building height and lighting have been addressed. Staff have not received formal comments from Capitol Neighborhoods, but note that representatives of the neighborhood association have spoken favorably on this project at the aforementioned City Commission meetings.

Conclusion

The project is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan which recommends mixed-use and high density residential development for this site and surrounding properties within the identified "Downtown Core." While a somewhat atypical PUD request, staff believes that the standards are met and support this proposal that will aid in the restoration and renovation of the fire-damaged building. Staff believes the resulting building will be attractive and that the proposed fifth story addition will be complementary to the restored façades on the building's lower stories.

Recommendations and Proposed Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded
--

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Kevin Firchow, 267-1150)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for zoning map amendments and planned unit developments are met and forward Zoning Map Amendment 3604, rezoning 24 North Webster and 123 East Mifflin Street from C4 (Central Commercial District) to PUD-GDP-SIP (Planned Unit Development-General Development Plan-Specific Implementation Plan) to the Common Council with a recommendation of **approval**, subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by reviewing agencies.

The following conditions have been submitted by reviewing agencies:

City Engineering Division (Contact Janet Dailey, 261-9688)

1. The address type numbers shown on submittal plans do not conform to city address requirements. A prior site address plan for ground thru fourth floors was previously approved for this site and is on file with City Engineering. Submit a PDF floor plan file for the proposed fifth floor addition to Lori Zenchenko (LZenchenko@cityofmadison.com) so that an addressing plan can be developed, approved and implemented.

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Bryan Walker, 267-8754)

2. City of Madison radio systems are microwave directional line of sight to remote towers citywide. The building elevation will need to be review by Traffic Engineer to accommodate the microwave sight and building. The applicant shall submit grade and elevations plans if the building exceeds four stories prior to sign-off to be reviewed and approved by Keith Lippert, (266-4767) Traffic Engineering Shop, 1120 Sayle Street. The applicant shall return one signed approved building elevation copy to the City of Madison Traffic Engineering office with final plans for sign off.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 261-9658)

3. Provide an automatic fire sprinkler system, fire alarm system, and standpipe system in accordance with IBC Chapter 9.
4. Provide a stretcher size elevator in accordance with SPS 362.3002.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Pat Anderson, 266-5978)

5. Meet applicable building codes, including accessible requirements.
6. Provide 22 bike parking stalls in a safe and convenient location on an impervious surface to be shown on the final plan for the residential use and 2 bike stalls for the commercial use. NOTE: A bike-parking stall is two feet by six feet with a five-foot access area. Structures that require a user-supplied locking device shall be designed to accommodate U-shaped locking devices. Show the stalls on the plans.
7. Show addresses of tenant spaces on the building of the final site plan.
8. Signage approvals are not granted by the Plan Commission. Signage must be reviewed for compliance with Chapter 31 of the Madison General Ordinances. Signage must be approved by the Urban Design Commission and Zoning. Sign permits must be issued by the Zoning including temporary signs as reviewed in MGO 31.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, 261-9243)

9. All wells located on this property shall be abandoned if no valid well operation permit has been obtained from the Madison Water Utility. This property is not in a Wellhead Protection District. The Water Utility will not need to sign off the final plans, and not need a copy of the approved plans.

Parks Division (Contact Kay Rutledge, 266-4714)

This agency submitted are response with no recommended conditions of approval.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency did not submit a response to these requests.