

#### VIA EMAIL and HAND DELIVERY

January 17, 2012

Mayor Paul R. Soglin Office of the Mayor 210 Martin Luther King Jr Blvd., Room 403 Madison, WI 53703-3345

Alder Lauren Cnare, President City of Madison Common Council 210 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd, Room 417 Madison, WI 53703

Dear Mayor Soglin, President Cnare and Members of the Common Council:

Attached please find a chart compiled by Cordelia Gallo comparing the Fant and Klebba/Waugh proposals, using information contained in written submissions since November 7, 2011, and in oral presentations made at the James Madison Park Surplus Property Disposal Committee's public meeting on December 15, 2011, available online. <a href="See">See</a><a href="http://www.cityofmadison.com/planning/jmpsurplus.html">http://www.cityofmadison.com/planning/jmpsurplus.html</a>, then go to Submitted Proposals - 704 East Gorham.

The online chart entitled "9470 - James Madison Park Proposals Review (704 East Gorham Street)" and Klebba/Waugh's oral presentation at the JMPSPD Committee meeting on December 15, 2011, asserted that their proposal is the only one with a ground rent escalator. That is incorrect. Barbara Fant's proposal states that her land lease payment would follow the city assessor's annual valuation of the land and the improvements on it. Thus, her ground rent would increase with the value of the land. Dan Rolfs, Office of Real Estate Services, Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development, who served as staff for the JMPSPD Committee and created the aforementioned online chart, verbally agreed with Ms. Fant at the Committee meeting on December 15; but the error has not been corrected.

Below is a direct link to the JMPSPD Committee's scores for the proposals (one page):

http://legistar.cityofmadison.com/attachments/50d24ca6-29c8-4f55-bd28-2ba362de1323.pdf

### Michael Best & Friedrich LLP Attorneys at Law

One South Pinckney Street Suite 700 Madison, WI 53703 P.O. Box 1806 Madison, WI 53701-1806 Phone 608.257.3501 Fax 608.283.2275

William F. White
Direct 608.283.2246
Email wfwhite@michaelbest.com



Mayor Paul R. Soglin Alder Lauren Cnare, President January 17, 2012 Page 2

Attached please also find some of the more dramatic photographs of Ms. Fant's prize-winning historic preservation work over the past thirty years.

Thanks very much for your kind attention and consideration.

Sincerely,

MICHAEL BEST & FRIEDRICH LLP

William F. White

cc:

Members of the Common Council

Lisa Veldran, Clerk, Common Council

James Madison Park Surplus Disposal Property Committee Members

Michael P. May, City Attorney

Barbara G. Fant

Cordelia and Mark Gallo

030569-0001\10840601.1

# COMPARISON OF TWO TOP-SCORING PROPOSALS PRESENTED AT JAMES MADISON SURPLUS PROPERTY DISPOSAL COMMITTEE MEETING DECEMBER 15, 2011

| 3  | Barbara Fant/Delia and Mark<br>Gallo Proposal   | Bob Klebba/David Waugh<br>Proposal   |
|--|---|--|
| Offer For Purchase of House:   | \$185,000   | \$130,000  |
| Offer For First Year's Ground<br>Rent, Subject To Change In<br>Future Years: | \$5,830   | \$4,500  |
| Who WIII Live In House:  | Gallo family (2 children) full-time;<br>Barbara Fant (grandmother) part-<br>time.   | Klebba/Waugh family full-time; Bed<br>and Breakfast guests in 4<br>bedrooms.   |
| Proposed Business:   | Farm to Fork Catering Company offering classes/workshops from commercial kitchen in basement.   | Bed and Breakfast  |
| Is This a Permissible Use?   | Yes, with a conditional use permit.   | No, prohibited by Madison General<br>Ordinances Sec.28.08(6)(b)5.d.<br>The Livingston Inn (landmark<br>Leitch House B&B) within 500 feet.                        |
| Experience Managing<br>Proposed Business:                                    | Gallos have 14 years' combined experience in farming, commercial cooking and catering.  | One innkeeper course, plus renting out a room in current home.   |
| Proposed Public Access:  | Open houses, tours by appointment, civic meetings and receptions, Farm to Fork events.  | Open to public as B&B throughout the year; events such as wedding receptions, civic meetings, and private "community dinners" for friends, family and neighbors. |
| Experience Restoring Historic Properties:                                    | Fant has 30 years, with award-<br>winning landmarks in 3 states, plus<br>rehab of former residence in<br>Madison.   | Remodeling of previous home.   |
| Proposed Improvements to<br>Energy Efficiency of House:                      | Work with Green Madison to<br>improve energy efficiency and earn<br>LEED certification.   | Install a geothermal heating and cooling system.   |
| Plans for Facade Protected<br>by Landmarks Commission<br>Statute:            | Historic structures report to determine "as built" form and first finishes, to be archived at the Wisconsin Historical Society. Museum-quality restoration. | New front porch floor, rebuilt knee wall, restructured canopy, and tuckpointing.   |
| Parking Area:  | Replace 3 of the 6 parking stalls with kitchen garden and make others permeable to reduce run-off.  | Eleven "bores" 200 feet into<br>parkland for new geothermal heat<br>pump system, with six asphalt<br>parking stalls left intact.                                 |
| Modifications for Wheelchair<br>Access:                                      | First floor, including lavatory, to be made accessible.   | No plans.  |
| JMSPD Committee Score<br>(Total of 7 Categories):                            | 643   | 580  |

James Madison Park Surplus Property Process SCORES - 704 East Gotham St Dec 2011

704 E Gorham (Collins House) Criteria / Scoring Fant

| Criteria   | Points | Shaw | Points Shaw Clausius | Maniaci Clear Wallner Briski | Clear | Wallner | Briski | Bramen-Wanek | TOTAL |
|--|--------|------|----------------------|------------------------------|-------|---------|--------|--------------|-------|
| A commitment to creating an environmentally responsible rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the |        |      |                      |                              |       |         |        |              |       |
| structure  | 10     | 5    | 2                    | 6                            | w     | 9       | o      | æ            |       |
| Integration of public accommodation  | 25     | 20   | 25                   | 25                           | 10    | 20      | 24     | 22           |       |
| The proposed use is a permitted or conditional use   |        |      |                      |                              |       |         |        |              |       |
| under the current zoning code  | Ŋ      | 2    | ĸ                    | 2                            | 2     | 2       | 6      | Ŋ            |       |
| Proposed use is compatible with the neighborhood   | 10     | 10   | 9                    | 10                           | 10    | 10      | 10     | 9            |       |
| Financially sound proposal that will not require City  |        |      |                      |                              |       |         |        |              |       |
| funding  | 20     | 15   | 20                   | 8                            | 20    | 18      | 19     | 92           |       |
| Development schedule that is mindful of the City   |        |      |                      |                              |       |         |        |              |       |
| processes that will be required (referendum)   | 5      | 5    | 5                    | 9                            | 9     | 5       | 9      | თ<br>-       |       |
| Development team qualifications and experience   | 20     | 15   | 20                   | 20                           | 16    | 20      | 18     | 19           |       |
| TOTAL  | 100    | 82   | 100                  | 100                          | 79    | 93      | 95     | 91           | 643   |

704 E Gorham (Collins House) Criteria / Scoring
Klebba / Waugh

| Criteria   | Points | Shaw | Clausius | Maniaci | Clear | Wallner | Briski | Points   Shaw   Clausius   Maniaci   Clear   Wallner   Briski   Bramen-Wanek |
|--|--------|------|----------|---------|-------|---------|--------|--|
| A commitment to creating an environmentally responsible rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the |        |      |          |         |       |         |        |  |
| structure  | 10     | 5    | 5        | 7       | ø     | 2       | 9      | 9  |
| Integration of public accommodation  | 25     | 20   | 52       | 25      | 23    | ន       | 25     | 24   |
| The proposed use is a permitted or conditional use under the current zoning code                 | ß      | Ŋ    | S        | 0       | 2     | 'n      | ю      | 4  |
| Proposed use is compatible with the neighborhood   | 9      | 9    | 9        | 2       | 6     | 10      | 10     | 10   |
| Financially sound proposal that will not require City funding                                    | 20     | 5    | 5        | 5       | 14    | 17      | 17     | 16   |
| Development schedule that is mindful of the City processes that will be required (referendum)    | 9      | 5    | 5        | ı,      | 5     | 5       | 5      | თ  |
| Development team qualifications and experience   | 20     | 15   | 2        | 10      | 18    | 8       | 19     | 17   |
| TOTAL  | 100    | 8    | 75       | 62      | 84    | 92      | \$     | 96   |

580

704 E Gorham (Collins House) Criteria / Scoring

| Criteria   | Points | Shaw | Clausius | Maniaci | Clear | Wallner | Briski | Points   Shaw   Clausius   Maniaci   Clear   Wallner   Briski   Bramen-Wanek |
|--|--------|------|----------|---------|-------|---------|--------|--|
| A commitment to creating an environmentally responsible rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the |        |      |          |         |       |         |        |  |
| structure  | 5      | 9    | s        | ო       | လ     | 9       | 7      | 5  |
| Integration of public accommodation  | 25     | 5    | . 15     | 0       | 89    | 5       | 15     | 20   |
| The proposed use is a permitted or conditional use under the current zoning code                 | 5      | 2    | 2        | S       | S     | 'n      | Ŋ      | 5  |
| Proposed use is compatible with the neighborhood   | 10     | 10   | 0        | ო       | 7     | 80      | 80     | 80   |
| Financially sound proposal that will not require City  |        |      |          |         |       |         | :      | ,  |
| funding  | 50     | 20   | 15       | 20      | 9     | 20      | 8      | 19   |
| Development schedule that is mindful of the City   |        |      |          |         |       |         |        |  |
| processes that will be required (referendum)   | 5      | 0    | 9        | 5       | 9     | 9       | 9      | თ  |
| Development team qualifications and experience   | 20     | 10   | 15       | 10      | 14    | 20      | 16     | 16   |
| TOTAL  | 100    | 65   | 65       | 51      | 67    | 28      | 120    | 82   |

# 1517 Morrison Street, Madison, WI 53703

Before: 2002, upon purchase



After: 2004, upon sale



## Stevenson-Doggett House 303 Amelia Street, Fredericksburg, VA 22401



Restored exterior shutters, windows and trim with original finishes



Restored louvered lean-to (west side), one of two extant originals in the City of Fredericksburg

### The Coxe Place / Airliewood 385 E Salem Avenue, Holly Springs, MS 38635





1999 Restoration of historic gates by Robinson Iron Corp, Alexander City, AL, www.robinsoniron.com

Middlekauff Farm, Sharpsburg, MD 21782



1819 stone house before and after restoration
AIA (Potomac chapter) Historic Preservation First Award, 1982
under easement to the National Park Service

