AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	**PRESENTED:** May 25, 2011
TITLE: 117 North Charter Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) for Charter Street Heating Plan Upgrades. 8th Ald. Dist. (16323)	**REFERRED:**
	REREFERRED:
	REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	**ADOPTED:** **POF:**
DATED: May 25, 2011	**ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn O'Kroley, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, R. Richard Wagner, Melissa Huggins and Jay Handy.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 25, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL/FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 117 North Charter Street. Appearing in support of the project was Alan Fish. Appearing in support and available to answer questions were Jeff Niesen, Doug Haas and Bill Patek, representing Boldt AMEC; and Cassie Goodwin, representing JJR. Appearing neither in support nor opposition was Dan Murray, representing the Department of Commerce. Fish presented simplified plans for using all natural gas due to the change in administration. The 60 year old coal fired plant will change to all natural gas for 80-85% cleaner emissions and carbon outputs. The combination of this plant and the change of the Charter Street MG&E plant going to natural gas will significantly reduce the particulate matter in Dane County. There is a large amount of surface parking on purpose; the next generation working on Charter Street may choose to put solid fuel in this plant so they are leaving room for another boiler in the parking lot, as well as all the room across the street that had been planned for solid fuel storage. So the parking lots become a place holder for expansion and a new approach to fuel sourcing in the next 20-30 years. Changes to the north elevation include the addition of glass where an overhead door is no longer needed, and the west transfer tower for biomass is no longer there. The south side of the building is the location for the future addition as well as water treatment and cooling tower. The reddish brown brick is a match to what is currently used, along with a lighter brick to complement the existing plant. Goodwin presented revised elevations and perspectives featuring the new screen wall containing the entire yard being used for truck traffic and deliveries within the plant, so the whole area is secured. The landscape plan includes grasses and low maintenance materials. The chain link fence will be replaced by a decorative black fence. Large landscape boulders have been added to protect a glass curtain wall as well as any errant vehicle from the intersection. Barnett reminded the applicant that the parking lot would require tree islands, and he would like to see islands or bookends on the triangular piece instead of having a void. He also inquired about the Commission's previous review of the project and how those changes to the base of the building and the windows have been brought through this latest iteration of the plans. In response it was noted that the mullions and base have been stretched to follow the building without changing the pattern. O'Kroley stated that because this is a temporary parking lot there could be some leniency in the tree islands; trees that would remain permanently could be planted along the bike path. She asked for a path connecting the east end to the bike path for Badger fans. She asked about the fencing and whether it was a security issue; Brigham replied that it is a security as well as a fire issue. They have to have a car proof barrier (decorative

stone on the Dayton Street side), and the fencing on the other side will be changed to black decorative fencing. She asked the applicant to look at ways to open it up more, or ways along the bike path to see through to the cooling tower. Slayton stated he finds the materials somewhat somber. Rummel thanked the applicant for their hard work during this difficult time of the change in administration. Smith wondered why there was a need to maximize the parking in a temporary lot; maybe this is a chance for them to have a little greenspace; the trees along the bike path could be looked at in a more permanent way. He thought that the corrugated metal really pulled all of the other building materials together in a very nice composition on that elevation. But what they have now is something very static from an architectural point of view; he strongly feels the previous elevation was much more successful.

ACTION:

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by Smith, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-0). The motion provided for the following conditions:

- The applicant has the option to reexamine the elevation in regards to the previous submittal that was approved.
- Increasing the trees along the bike path.
- Lower ground cover in the openings along the bike path.
- Additional tree islands added to the parking lot.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 1, 5, 6, 6 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 117 North Charter Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	6	6	-	6	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	4	-	4	-	-	5	4	1
	5	5	5	-	-	-	6	5
	8	7	8	7	-	-	8	8

General Comments:

- Previous scheme had an architecture that was more thoughtful. Treat parking lot as permanent.
- Sad to revisit this project because of change in administration.
- A flagrant and heinous crime is being committed by the State Department of Administration at the direction of the Governor. Bad scene man, bad scene.
- Nice urban use in urban context.

JOINT WEST CAMPUS AREA COMMITTEE

REPORT of ACTION

June 8, 2011

Agenda Item / Project Name:	UW-Madison Charter Street Heating Plant
Street Address:	117 N. Charter Street & 115 N. Mills Street
Project Contact(s)/Phone #'s:	Gary Brown, 608-263-3023
Date of JWCAC meeting(s):	June 8, 2011
JWCAC Members in Attendance: Shiva Bidar-Sielaff, Connie Brachman, Sue Ellingson, Nan Fey, Alan Fish, Karl Frantz, Rob Kennedy, Sherwood Malamud, Brad Ricker, Laura Rose, Caitlin Siefert, Mark VanderWoude, Liz Vowles, Robbie Webber.	
Committee staff present:	Gary Brown

Brief Project Description: The University of Wisconsin-Madison is in the process of renovating and building an addition to the Charter Street Heating Plant on campus. The facility will include four natural gas fired boilers, new and relocated cooling towers, a fuel oil back-up storage building and new surface parking.

Action or Recommendation by JWCAC:

ACTION: Motion by Sherwood Malamud and seconded by Caitlin Siefert to recommend approval of the proposed PUD/GDP/SIP for the Charter Street Heating Plant to the City of Madison Plan Commission as presented. All in favor. Motion approved unanimously with Nan Fey abstaining. Sue Ellingson and Shiva Bidar-Sielaff were not present for the vote.