Regarding:	727 Jenifer Street – Third Lake Ridge Historic District Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness (Legistar #19449)
Date: Prepared By:	August 4, 2010 Amy Scanlon

General Information:

The owner is proposing to make alterations to the exterior of the 727 Jenifer Street. According to information and photographs in the files, this c. 1850 2-story structure is of a typical vernacular style with a gable roof. The gable faces the street and there is a small porch with shed roof at the front door. Historic references show that there was once a full width porch across the front elevation with hip roof (see attached photo).

The applicant began work on this house without a building permit for front façade alterations or Landmarks Commission Approval. Staff has included a recent photo, before this work was started. This work included:

- Removal of original picture window and replacement with sliding glass patio doors on the front façade.
- Construction of pressure treated front deck.
- In addition, the owner received a work order for both foundation repair and other miscellaneous repair work. This work was also begun without consultation from preservation staff or the Landmarks Commission.

Upon later discussions with City staff, the applicant is now appearing before the Commission to ask for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the exterior of the house. The proposed alterations may include the following:

- Removal of the front deck, and reconstruction of the front porch with columns and low pitched roof that extends across the width of the front elevation.
- Installation of an additional door on the front elevation or approval of previously installed sliding patio doors.
- Installation of stone veneer on the foundation.
- Replacement of siding.
- Construction of rear decks.

Applicable Landmarks Ordinance sections:

33.19(11)(i) <u>Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic</u> <u>District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.</u>

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.01(11)(g) (*Referenced below for your information.*).

- 2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
- 3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
- 4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
- 5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) <u>Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic</u> <u>District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.</u>

- 1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
- 2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
- 3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- 4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Staff Comments:

Although the submitted plans are not to scale and inaccurate, staff has agreed to allow the applicant to appear before the Commission in order to help facilitate the resolution of the outstanding Building Inspection work orders.

Alteration #1: Removal of the front deck, and reconstruction of the front porch with columns and low pitched roof that extends across the width of the front elevation.

The applicant has not submitted any plans for the new front porch; however they have submitted several photographs of porches that they would like emulate. Staff has enclosed a historic photo of the house with an earlier more appropriate porch. Staff recommends that this photo be used as a basis for the new porch design, noting the need for a code-compliant railing.

Alteration #2: Request for installation of an additional door on the front elevation or approval of previously installed sliding patio doors.

Noting both the recent and historic photo, staff recommends the re-installation of the original window configuration, and would not support the approval of the sliding glass doors.

Alteration #3: Installation of stone veneer on the foundation.

From conversations with the applicant, staff believes that they intend to unify the remaining stone foundation and the new concrete block foundation repair with a thin stone veneer. While unifying the two materials is important, staff believes that this could be done with a simple parge coat that matches the parge coat currently used on other sections of the existing foundation. The coursing style, stone type, and stone size of the proposed stone veneer could potentially be inappropriate due to the illusion of a false historic building material. If the Commission does approve a veneer that is compatible with the historic finishes, the materials should be submitted to staff for final approval.

Alteration #4: Siding replacement

Staff would approve the replacement of siding as long as the new siding matches the existing or historic siding exposure.

Alteration #5: Construction of rear decks.

All rear deck plans must be submitted to staff for approval, and/or review by the Landmarks Commission at a future date. Any new doors, or other rear façade alterations to accommodate the deck must also be submitted.

Enclosures:

- o Assessor's Record photo
- Historic photo in Capital Times article dated October 12, 1947
- (5) Existing condition photos

Applicant's attached submittal includes:

Proposed floor plans and front elevation design sketch Applicant's submitted photos of neighboring buildings with similar porch features.

Applicant's photos of house at 2109 Chamberlain Avenue with similar reconstructed porch.

727 Jenifer Street: Assessor Database Photo



Capital Times Historic Photo from 1947

Sunday Morning, October 12, 1947 MADISON THE CAPITAL T

Baas Tells History of Modest Frame House On Jenifer Street Here Where He Was Born

Recalls "Happiest Years of Life" In **Boyhood Dwelling**

Boyhood Dwelling By ALEXIUS BAAS TODAY'S "OLD HOUSE" story concerns a modest frame house at 727 Jenifer at. It is the house where I was born and where I spent the first 17 years of my life — probably the the happiest part of it. The old house, though well kept and well preserved, makes no pre-tense to magnificence, or to archi-tectural grandeur. But so long as i live, whenever I hear or use the word "home," its picture flashes on that inward eye which the poet calls "the bliss of solitude." It will always be home to my ipner thought. And therefore I hope I may be pardoned if I write of it today.

JUST HOW OLD the house is I do not know. But it was quite a venerable structure when my fath-er, Stephen C. Baas, bought it in shout the year 1830. So it must go back to the 1850's at least. At any rate its purchase was g great event in the lives of father and mother. And so, I remember, was the eventful day (I was then about a 10-year-old lad) when the mort-gage was finally paid and de-stroyed. In the autumn of 1902 father

In the autumn of 1902 father



Existing Photos





