

AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: September 16, 2009

TITLE: 8133 Mansion Hill Avenue – Signage Package, Amended PUD(GDP-SIP) for a Nursery School/Day Care. 1st Ald. Dist. (05667)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: September 16, 2009

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 16, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of an Amended PUD(GDP-SIP) signage package located at 8133 Mansion Hill Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were John Brigham, Phil Carlson and Don Busch, all representing Kiddos Learning Center.

Staff noted that the signage package under consideration is for a recently approved nursery school/daycare center as part of a PUD(GDP-SIP) rezoning; the signage package was not considered with the project as originally approved. The signage package consists of four signs, two driveway entrance signs, a wall sign on the building's front elevation and a wall sign on the upper back elevation adjoining a city park. Staff noted that the record for the original approval of the project noted the Commission's lack of support for any potential signage facing the adjoining park. Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- The park side sign is not appropriate and too large.
- The ground signs look cheap based on the past approval.
- The sign on the clear story not acceptable.
- The entry signs are okay, but need better integration with architecture. In addition, the front elevation sign appears to be tacked on, need something more elegant.
- Consider cantilevering out from the beam structure with the front elevation wall sign in addition to consider use of a monument-type signs which would provide better integration utilizing features of the building's architecture.
- Sign needs to be more substantial.
- Look at gable end area as location of front wall sign.
- Utilize a graphic on the door and suspend the wall graphic from the structure on the gable end.
- Provide a substantial ground sign at each entry that ties back to the building architecture.
- Use stone as the base of the building that ties back with other features of the building materials at the same time move ground signs a little closer to the sidewalk.
- Consider a wall sign hung from the gable end with rods smaller and on the more elegant side.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Weber, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). Motion required the address of the above-stated concerns with further consideration of the project in addition to notification of the adjoining neighbors regarding the sign package proposal.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 3, 4, 4, 4/5 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 8133 Mansion Hill Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	4/5	-	-	4/5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3
	-	-	-	-	47	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	3	-	-	3
	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Seems appropriate to building’s context – except sign facing park.
- No signage facing park.
- Reconsider total concepts.
- Proposed signage poorly thought out and disrespects quality architecture that is a result of much hard work.
- Sign facing park is simply advertising and not justified.
- Please make nicer ground signs, use stone.