

## AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

|  |   |
|--|---|
| REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION   | <b>PRESENTED:</b> August 19, 2009                               |
| TITLE: 1252 Williamson Street – PUD(GDP-SIP)<br>for a Mixed-Use Building with 31<br>Residential Units with 2,400 Square Feet<br>of Commercial Space. 6 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist.<br>(15686) | <b>REFERRED:</b><br><b>REREFERRED:</b><br><b>REPORTED BACK:</b> |
| AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary  | <b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>                                     |
| DATED: August 19, 2009   | <b>ID NUMBER:</b>   |

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Jay Ferm, Mark Smith, Ron Luskin and Todd Barnett.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of August 19, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 1252 Williamson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were J. Randy Bruce, representing Scott Lewis; Lindsey Lee, and Fae Dremock. The project provides for the redevelopment of a former gasoline station with convenience food sales which has been unoccupied for a number of years outside of an operating remediation building. The proposal provides for the development of 31 apartment units on 3 levels along with lower level underground parking of 24 stalls. The first floor level along the property's Williamson Street frontage is intended to provide for multiple tenant commercial/retail use with the remainder of the first floor frontage primarily along South Baldwin Street providing for the development of residential units outside of the corner feature with the two upper levels to be developed with apartments. Bruce provided a review of the proposed development plans, noting that the project also features 9 surface parking stalls and will include within its boundaries two existing homes, each is located either on South Baldwin Street and Williamson Street. The existing homes will be renovated in association with the project. Following presentation of the plans Lee, representing the MNA Board, Preservation Steering Committee spoke in favor of the project with Dremock noting a favorable recommendation to the MNA Board. Following testimony the Commission noted the following:

- Provide screening at the rear parking and eliminate dead end.
- Relate ground plane better to the entry at the corner and balance green and hardscape at the corner.
- Massing and scale very comfortable for the location.
- Take out green at corner on both streets and place lawn area asymmetrically in areas beyond.
- Use large scale trees and beef up landscaping in other areas, define more function and design of infiltration area, do more than typical foundation plantings.
- The project fits Willy Street well, keep terrace on Baldwin Street for potential outdoor eating area which may limit green areas as proposed.
- Concern with Baldwin Street façade but like Williamson Street flow; building needs the ground to street at Baldwin.
- Corner element lacks detailing and care such as other brick buildings in the area.

- Landscaping needs more attention, place a tree on the back corner of the surface parking lot.
- Concern with corner element, needs to be more unique and have more identity.
- Not convinced that the 3-building appearance on Williamson Street works, although OK look at commercial below with a level of residential above appearance.
- Not sold on canted elements, a placeholder for doing something different, look at alternatives.
- Provide a model or blow up details of building.
- Like the reference of the break-up with small façades instead of one large façade along Williamson Street.
- Need to ground the other 2/3 of the building along Baldwin Street.
- Complete the Baldwin Street elevation with the creation of a front entry feature.
- Provide walk up entry on Baldwin Street.
- On the Williamson elevation study bringing horizontal metal panel all the way down to distinctly read old, new and modern.
- Extend canopy all across with adjustment of windows on the 3<sup>rd</sup> story level and provide a 1-foot brick return at change in materials.
- Play up the old and the new such as a different profile for the metal cornice versus that of the brick.
- Consider creating balconies that satisfy a residential need, make larger or provide a French balcony. It is a great amenity to provide a balcony with adequate space.
- Large balconies look more suburban, small are urban.
- Bring in current proposal when returning with modifications for comparison. Eliminate tacked on Baldwin Street balconies.

**ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7, 7, 7 and 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1252 Williamson Street**

|                       | Site Plan | Architecture | Landscape Plan | Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc. | Signs | Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular) | Urban Context | Overall Rating |
|-----------------------|-----------|--------------|----------------|--------------------------------|-------|-------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|
| <b>Member Ratings</b> | 6         | 7            | 5              | -                              | -     | 5                                   | 7             | 7              |
|                       | 6         | 7            | -              | 6                              | -     | -                                   | 7             | 7              |
|                       | 6         | 7            | -              | -                              | -     | 6                                   | 7             | 7              |
|                       | 6         | 5            | -              | -                              | -     | 6                                   | 7             | 6              |
|                       | -         | -            | -              | -                              | -     | -                                   | -             | 7              |
|                       | 8         | 7            | 6              | 7                              | -     | 7                                   | 8             | 7              |
|                       |           |              |                |                                |       |                                     |               |                |
|                       |           |              |                |                                |       |                                     |               |                |
|                       |           |              |                |                                |       |                                     |               |                |
|                       |           |              |                |                                |       |                                     |               |                |

General Comments:

- Excellent start, nice infill for long blighted space.
- Architecture nicely fits neighborhood. Landscape ideas less so.
- Building mass and scale comfortable. Study site further. Narrow balconies with French doors would make usable. Study balance of historical reference in modern dialog.
- Better relate ground treatment to building at intersection. Screen southwest end of parking lot.
- Architecture is OK – would like to see more of a corner celebrated. Willy and Baldwin seems weak – make it something. Canted bays seem off. Walk up on Baldwin Street?