AGENDA # <u>14</u>

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: January 9, 2008		
TITLE: 89 East Towne Mall - New Building	REFERRED:		
Addition to a Planned Commercial Site for Buffalo Wild Wings. 17th Ald. Dist.	REREFERRED:		
(08547)	REPORTED BACK:		
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:		
DATED: January 9, 2008	ID NUMBER:		

City of Madison, Wisconsin

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, Bonnie Cosgrove, Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of January 9, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. Appearing on behalf of the project were Russ Kowalski, CBL & Associates Properties; and Paul Berlin. The project as proposed provides for the development of a "Buffalo Wild Wings" restaurant addition along the front façade of the East Towne Mall adjacent to the food court area. The proposed addition is approximately 7,000 square feet in size and features a separate entrance from the food court. The addition replaces a portion of screened service court, in addition to requiring reconfiguration of the front drive aisle at the face of the building. The building façade features the use of clear glass windows on its two exterior public sides, in combination with a cultured stone base and vertical columns including the use of EIFS on portions of the upper elevation. A greater than two-story tower element provides an enhancement to the entry of the building, as well as the location of high exposure. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Nice building but addition to existing mall should be elsewhere on existing lot; need to repair the urban fabric.
- Yellow tower element sticks up; a billboard-like sign.
- Yellow tower element just a box, a cartoon, not architectural.
- Create more of a reception area for drop-off to incorporate the couple of benches.
- Provide consideration for building working at a 2-story and make the yellow box functional.
- Look at parking with tree islands at an interval of every 10-12 stalls with the area designed that reflects the scope of the least terns with CBL (mall owners).

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-1) with Ferm voting no. The motion for referral required address of the above, in addition to support for the general concept, provide further address of the following:

- Resolve issue with the need to provide for additional landscaping within the specific area of the site assigned for the restaurant according to its lease terms to provide for additional tree islands at an interval of every 10-12 stalls, including a landscape worksheet.
- Development of an exterior drop-off area at the entry with seating amenities.
- Look at a 2-story building or alternative where parts of the building are at two levels.
- Reexamine yellow tower element in regards for its use for signage and function, as well as its integration with the overall architecture of the addition.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 1, 4, 4, 4.5, 5, 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 89 East Town	e Mall
--	--------

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	4	-	2	5	4	4.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	1	7	7	-	_	1	1	1
	-	6	6	-	6	-	-	6
	5	6	-	-	4	5	4	4
	-	_	-	-	-	-	-	4

General Comments:

- Yellow area of building is not a building and needs to be removed. More trees in parking lot.
- Needs work.
- Consider second story. Address landscaping.
- New buildings in mall land should repair the urban fabric rather than add to the dysfunction.
- Need to ensure that the yellow portion is not just a sign.
- Good use but architecture of vertical element needs development/integration.