AGENDA # <u>2.</u>

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 21, 2005		
TITLE: 802 Williamson Street – PUD(GDP-SIP),	REFERRED:		
Change of Building Materials/Façade Treatment – 6^{th} Ald. Dist.	REREFERRED:		
freument of fild. Dist.	REPORTED BACK:		
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:		
DATED: September 21, 2005	ID NUMBER:		

City of Madison, Wisconsin

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Todd Barnett, Robert March, Bruce Woods, Michael Barrett, Ald. Noel Radomski, Jack Williams, Lisa Geer and Lou Host-Jablonski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 21, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of alternative building materials/façade treatment for a previously approved PUD(GDP-SIP) on property located at 802 Williamson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was John Sutton, architect. Sutton explained to the Commission that the material changes consisted of a request to eliminate the previously approved use of cementitious panel siding combined with extruded aluminum trim joints in favor of the use of new generation EIFS on plywood panels overlying a moisture barrier wrap. In replacement of the extruded aluminum joint system deep grooving to create a shadow-line (v-shaped) is proposed. Sutton noted that the project's owners were not satisfied with the look of the previously approved cement panel system, along with concerns relevant to water tightness. The material replacement affected portions of all building elevations for the structure proposed at 808 Williamson Street. Sutton noted that masonry as previously proposed would be maintained. The Commission noted that there was concern with the application of the EIFS system in any areas which came down to grade; where Sutton noted that masonry would be applied in most publicly exposed areas. Host-Jablonski noted that the issue was the amount of EIFS on the building, being less quality and a less durable material.

ACTION:

On a motion by Host-Jablonski, seconded by Barrett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of alternative building materials/façade treatment on a unanimous vote of (9-0). The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (9-0). A prior motion by March, seconded by Ald. Radomski to grant approval as proposed was withdrawn by March. The motion required the application of synthetic stucco over cement board with joint and other finishing details as proposed and presented.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 5, 5, 5, 6, 6 and 6.

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	-	6	-	-	-	-	6	б
	-	6	-	-	-	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	5	5
	-	5	-	_	-	-	5	5
	-	4	-	_	-	-	-	-
	-	6	-	_	-	-	-	6

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 802 Williamson Street

General Comments:

- Go with the synthetic stucco, please.
- Change with cement board backing should be comparable.
- EIFS cheapens project. Approved system is acceptable.
- Like the recommended change.
- Too much EIFS and comes too close to the base of building.
- The proposed EIFS did not meet the quality as promised for siding.
- Too much EIFS; stucco on cement board better.