PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

February 10, 2025

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name & Address:	**2006 Van Hise Avenue**
Application Type(s):	Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition
Legistar File ID #	86669
Prepared By:	Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared:	February 6, 2025

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact:	Lindsey Shotwell, Destree Architecture & Design
Requested Action:	The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition to the principal structure and alterations to the existing structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is located within the University Heights local historic district

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

(1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:

(a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

(b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

(c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.

(d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

(1) General

(b) Materials and Features

1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.

(5) Windows and Doors

(a) Openings

3. The new openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.

(c) Windows

3. Replacement multi-light windows shall use true divided lights or simulated divided lights with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
5. Incompatible, non-historic windows may be replaced with new windows compatible with the historic character of the building.
7. New windows that are compatible with the historic character of the building may be reinstated in openings that had previously been filled in.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

(1) General

(a) General

2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
5. Rooftop additions, decks, terraces, and mechanical and service equipment shall be located to be set back from elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way in order to minimize its visibility and impact on the historic character of the building.

(b) Materials and Features

1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.

(2) Building Site

(a) General

1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.

(3) Exterior Walls

(a) General

1. Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.

(4) Roofs

(a) General

1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.

(b) Materials

1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
2. Any roofing materials shall be permitted on flat or slightly sloped roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way.

(c) Skylights

1. Skylights not visible from the developed public right-of-way shall be permitted.

(e) Vents

1. Roof vents shall be minimally visible and as unobtrusive as possible.

(g) Rooftop Features

1. Rooftop decks or terraces and green roofs or other roof landscaping, railings, or furnishings shall be installed so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way.

(5) Windows and Doors

(a) General

1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.

(b) Windows and Storm Windows

1. Simulated divided lights are permitted with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.

(c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors

1. Doors shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
2. New door openings shall have a similar height to width ratio, components, and finish as the historic doors of the structure.

(d) Garage Doors

1. Garage doors shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.

(7) Building Systems

(a) Mechanical Systems

3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be placed in a location on an elevation not visible from the developed public right-of-way or on the roof. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way are prohibited, unless technically infeasible. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent materials.

(c) Lighting and Electrical Systems

1. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to remove the existing attached garage and deck on the back of the principal structure, construct a larger attached garage in the same location and construct additional space on the rear of the structure of more living space. The addition will not be visible from the developed public right-of-way and is in keeping with the architectural character of the building. It will be visually separated from the historic structure by a combination of changes in wall planes, separation of roof planes, and will be finished in a slightly different texture of stucco.

As part of the remodel of the house, the applicant would like to replace the windows in the previously infilled windows in what was once a covered porch. The new windows are more in keeping with the architectural character of the building and are designed to fit the historic openings. The plan is also to complete maintenance on the stucco of the structure, which is failing in several locations.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

(1) General

(b) Materials and Features

1. The alterations s appear to be in keeping with the original design and character of the building. The stucco work will match the historic.

(5) Windows and Doors

(a) Openings

3. The new openings and the windows or doors in them appear to be compatible with the overall design of the building.

(c) Windows

3. The replacement multi-light windows are proposed to be simulated divided lights with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
5. This work would replace incompatible, non-historic windows with new windows compatible with the historic character of the building.
7. The new windows that are compatible with the historic character of the building are to be reinstated in openings that had previously been filled in.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

(1) General

(a) General

2. The new addition would largely replace an existing rear addition and is designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
3. The addition is designed to be visually separated from the principal building with different roof lines, changes in wall planes, and a different style of stucco.
4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition appear to be similar to those of the historic building.
5. The new rooftop deck above the garage will largely replicate the current rooftop deck and will not be visible from the developed public right-of-way.

(b) Materials and Features

1. A new addition is proposed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.

(2) Building Site

(a) General

1. Exterior additions to historic buildings appear to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district, per the application materials and previous precedent of projects approved in this district by the Landmarks Commission.

(3) Exterior Walls

(a) General

1. The stucco proposed for exterior walls of the addition will be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.

(4) Roofs

(a) General

1. The form and pitch of the addition roof appear to be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.

(b) Materials
1. The visible roof materials appear be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
2. Any roofing materials shall be permitted on flat or slightly sloped roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way.

(c) Skylights
1. The new skylights are not visible from the developed public right-of-way.

(e) Vents
1. The proposed roof is to have a low-profile ridge venting.

(g) Rooftop Features
1. The replacement rooftop deck above the rear garage is designed to be inconspicuous and minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way.

(5) Windows and Doors

(a) General
1. Openings and the windows or doors in them appear to be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
2. The new openings have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.

(b) Windows and Storm Windows
1. The new windows will have simulated divided lights with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.

(c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
1. Doors appear to be compatible with the overall design of the building.
2. New door openings have a similar height to width ratio, components, and finish as the historic doors of the structure.

(d) Garage Doors
1. Garage doors appear to be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.

(7) Building Systems

(a) Mechanical Systems
3. We need more information on the proposed vent for range hood. There is no information on any new mechanical systems that will be included with this project.

(c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
1. There is no information about any exterior lighting proposed for the addition.
2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Final venting specifications to be approved by staff.

2. Lighting and mechanical alterations must be approved as part of a Certificate of Appropriateness, but can be separate from this current approval.