

## PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 18, 2024

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



**Project Name & Address:** 2020 Eastwood Drive

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations

**Legistar File ID #** [82211](#)

**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** March 14, 2024

### Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Sean Meyers, Sean Meyers Architect Inc

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to make alterations to a designated landmark

### Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject property is a designated landmark, Hoffman-Kennedy Dairy Horse Barn.

#### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

#### 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
  - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

#### Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to create a new ground-level side entrance to the building, make alterations to the existing pedestrian entrance, alter the nonhistoric windows in the former hayloft openings, replace existing skylights, add two new skylights, and create a rooftop patio area on the single-story wing that would be accessed by a new dormer. The Hoffman-Kennedy Dairy Horse Barn was designated in 1986 for its historic associations with commercial activity in the early 1900s and as a nonresidential horse barn.

The barn was constructed in 1904 and it originally served as a horse barn, with the horses operating commercial wagons to transport goods. The Kennedy Dairy bought the property in 1925 and the horses hauled milk wagons. As the operation phased out horse-drawn wagons for trucks, the barn space was converted to a milk plant and the additions were gradually added to the building, with the first visible on the 1937 aerials. By the 1940s, the Vogel Fish & Oyster Company owned the property and completed more concrete block additions, and used the space for cold storage. The building continued use for different warehouse operations in the subsequent years.

The building was remodeled in 1985 and put back into use. The changes involved replacement of all windows, relocation of the pedestrian entrances, installation of skylights, and introduction of windows into the hayloft openings. The nomination emphasizes the horse barn core of the building is the character-defining feature of the landmark site.

The proposed adaptive reuse will create a separate residential space above the commercial space. The new entries and the dormer are significantly stepped back away from the street façade of the structure. The dormer and the entrance canopies are very modern in design, but utilize an industrial character that speaks to the history of the site without creating a false sense of history or conjectural details. The wood slate railing for the rooftop patio area introduces a simple feature that also uses an architectural vocabulary that blends with the site. The alterations to the hayloft windows simplify the window configuration to allow those spaces to read more as voids. The new entrance and the new doors for the pedestrian entrances are utilizing simple doors and configurations that will blend with the building. The cumulative effect of the alterations are minimal and allow the building and site to continue to convey their historic associations.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

**Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. The building is proposed for adaptive reuse to a mixed use with residential above and commercial below. The shift in programming involves the introduction of a new ground-level entrance and a new rooftop patio area on a portion of the structure that is not the character defining feature of the site.
2. The alterations are sensitive to the historic character of the property with minimal alterations to existing features and materials.
3. The changes will read as a product of their time and not create a false sense of history.
4. The single-story concrete block wings of the existing structure are a part of the history of the property and will remain, and the character of the 1980s rehabilitation of the barn will also be retained and preserved with this project.
5. While new entries are proposed for the building, the distinctive materials and features of the building and site will be preserved.
6. N/A
7. N/A
8. N/A
9. The new dormer and the ground-level entrance canopies are significantly stepped back away from the public right-of-way and are differentiated from the historic materials and features while still being compatible.
10. The essential form of the historic horse barn and dairy will be retained as part of this work.

**Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Any exterior lighting will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.