Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

Petitioners, Lester A. Pines ("Pines") and Roberta Anne Gassman ("Gassman"), are the owners of the property located at 1915 Arlington Place, Madison, Wisconsin which is within 200 feet of the boundaries of 1908 Arlington Place, Madison, Wisconsin. They have signed this Petition below and are joined in this Petition by additional owners of property within 200 feet of the boundaries of 1908 Arlington Place who have signed the attached signature pages, which are incorporated herein by reference, and who in combination with Pines & Gassman are hereinafter referred to as "the Petitioners".

Pursuant to Chapter 41.20, et seq of the Madison General Ordinances (MGO) the Petitioners hereby appeal to the City of Madison Common Council ("the Common Council") the February 12, 2024 decision by the City of Madison Landmarks

Commission approving a certificate of appropriateness for a land division at 1908

Arlington Place, Madison. As grounds for this appeal, the Petitioners respectfully state as follows:



The Petitioners Qualification to Appeal

- 1. There are twenty-nine properties that are within two hundred (200) feet of the boundaries of the subject property, 1908 Arlington Pl., Madison, Wisconsin, as verified by a copy of an Excel spreadsheet that was provided to Pines by email on February 15, 2024 by Heather L. Bailey, Ph.D, the City of Madison's Preservation Planner in the Neighborhood Planning, Preservation & Design Section of the Department of Planning, Community, & Economic Development, Planning Division, a copy of which is attached hereto and incorporated herein by reference as Exhibit A.
- 2. Pursuant to MGO 41.20(1), the Petitioners are qualified to file this Petition because they comprise a group of owners consisting of at least twenty percent (20%) of the number of parcels of property within two hundred (200) feet of the boundaries of 1908 Arlington Place as shown on Exhibit A.

The Petitioners Grounds for Appeal

- 3. On February 12, 2024, the Madison Landmarks Commission ("the Commission") approved a certificate of appropriateness for a land division at 1908 Arlington Place which is within the University Heights Historic District.
- 4. When considering a certificate of approval for land division the Commission must follow the requirements of MGO 41.18(4) which states:

<u>Land Divisions and Combinations</u>. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for land divisions, combinations, and subdivision plats of landmark sites and properties in historic districts, unless it finds that the proposed lot sizes adversely impact the historic character or significance of a landmark, are incompatible with adjacent lot sizes, or fail to maintain the general lot size pattern of the historic district.

- 5. The Commission, on February 12, 2024, when considering the request for a certificate of appropriateness for a proposed land division at 1908 Arlington Place did not comply with MGO 41.18(4) because it:
 - a. Failed to determine before the hearing the general pattern of lot sizes in the University Heights Historic District to determine if the proposed lot deviated from that general pattern.
 - b. Then, during the hearing, relied on a cursory review of a map of lots in University Heights which did not contain any numerical dimensions or other information regarding the size of the lots on the map, while ignoring other more relevant maps provided in advance in a written communication from a neighbor of the property.
 - c. Defined the word "adjacent" in the MGO41.18(4) as meaning only "adjoining," a truncated and incorrect interpretation of the ordinance because "adjacent" also means "nearby."
 - d. Used the truncated definition of the word "adjacent" to exclude any consideration of whether the proposed land division was incompatible with the non-adjoining lots on the west, east and south sides of Arlington Place.
 - e. Relied on the orientation of a home at the corner of Chamberlain Ave. and Forest Street, as the basis, in part, for its determination that the proposed two small lots for 1908 Arlington Place were compatible with the larger lots that surround it on its west, east and south sides.
 - f. Improperly compared the new proposed lot sizes for 1908 Arlington Place only to lots located on Kendall Ave., which are below and, therefore, not on the same plane as those on Arlington Place.

Conclusion and Request for Relief

The Petitioners respectfully request that the Common Council reverse the February 12, 2024 decision of the Madison Landmarks Commission to approve a certificate of appropriateness for the proposed land division at 1908 Arlington Place, Madison and to deny a certificate of appropriate for that proposal.

Respectfully submitted,

Lester A. Pines

Roberta Anne Gassman

and those property owners whose signatures are found on the attached signature pages.

JACOBSON, ERIK IVEY, MICHAEL E THOMAS, CHRISTOPHER M LIVORNI, ERNESTO ALD REGINA VIDAVER	STITELEY LIVING TRUST PINES, LESTER A	GIFFEY, JESSICA	KAHN, BRUCE W	SHOHET, J LEON & AMY L	ZAHED, SOFIA REFETOFF	NEUJAHR, HILDEGARD	1908 ARLINGTON PLACE LLC	PARKS LIVING TRUST	COTTINGHAM, DAVID JOHN	DIBO, ALAYNA	KIEFFER REV LIV TRUST,	MCBAIN, MARTIN OILIBHER	DELISLE, KENNETH W	FOREST, CARY BRETT	KARRAS PROPERTY	PANCZENKO, RUSSEL & PAULA	REDFORD, JOSIAH T	PASSMORE, BEN HILL	VERNON, MARY K	CHANDLER, JEFFREY C	REAM, EDWARD K	Owner_1
& MONICA L MESSINA	& ROBERTA A GASSMAN	& JOSHUA E GIFFEY	PATRICIA M PATTERSON						JEAN MARIE HALFERTY	& MICHAEL P MARTOCCIO	BRUCE D & MONICA M	CATHERINE ARABELLA MCBAIN	& JILL M DELISLE	KATRINA THOMPSON FOREST	MANAGEMENT LLC		SARA E REDFORD	SUSAN RACINE PASSMORE			& REBECCA REED	Owner_2
1925 KENDALL AVE 526 W LAKESIDE ST 1915 KENDALL AVE 1917 KENDALL AVE 2314 CHAMBERLAIN AVE	1921 KENDALL AVE 1915 ARLINGTON PL	210 PRINCETON AVE 163 N PROSPECT AVE	1911 KENDALL AVE	1937 ARLINGTON PL	1918 KENDALL AVE	168 N PROSPECT AVE	1908 ARLINGTON PL	302 CHAMBERLAIN AVE	629 HARVARD ST	1913 KENDALL AVE	1914 ARLINGTON PL	1920 ARLINGTON PLACE	1924 KENDALL AVE	115 ELY PL	BOX 333	160 N PROSPECT AVE	1914 KENDALL AVE	2002 CHAMBERLAIN AVE	1900 ARLINGTON PL	1902 ARLINGTON PL	166 N PROSPECT AVE	Address
MADISON MADISON MADISON MADISON	MADISON MADISON	MADISON MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	WILMETTE	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	ELKART LAKE	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	MADISON	City
<u> </u>	≦ ≦	₹ ₹	<u> </u>	<u>×</u>	∑	≦	≦	≦	=	≦	≦	₹	≦	≦	₹	≦	≦	×	≦	×.	<u>₹</u>	St
53726 53715 53726 53726 53726	53726 53726	53705 53726	53726 53726	53726	53726	53726	53726	53726	60091	53726	53726	53726	53726	53726	53020	53726	53726	53726	53726	53726	53726	Zip

ExhibitA

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Many K Vernon

Name

1900 Arlington Place, Madison W1 53726

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Name

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

MARTIN REED -MOBBIN

1920 ARLINGTON PL, MADISON, WI S3726 Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

CAMERINE REED - MCBAIN

Name

1920 ARCINGTON PLACE, MADISON, WI, 53726

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Jean M. Parks
Name
302 Chamberlain Ave, Madison WI 53726

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Brian M. Parks Name 302 Chamberlain Ave. Mad, W1 53706

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Name

1919 Artington Place, medison, W/ 53724 Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Name

J. Cottingham lington Place, Madison, WI 53726

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Name

166 N. Prospert Ave

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Name

Address - 11

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

MONICA L. MESSINA

Name

1917 KENDALL AVE, MADISON, WI 53726

Address

Manual Messina

Signature

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PÉTITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

ERNESTO LIVORNI

Name

1917 KENDALL AVE, MADISON WI 53726

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

LOVISA JONES WALLER

Name

222 Princeto Are, Madora WI 53726

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Name

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Ben Passmore

Name

2002 Chamberlain Ave, Malison 53726

Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Name

1924 KENDAIL NUR

Address

Address

Signature

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Christopher Thomas Name

1915 Kendall Ave Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights Historic District

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIO APPEAL:	NER IN THE ABOVE-ENTIT	LED PETITION OF
Katrina Forest	ar a r , , , , a r T f	
Name		
115 Ely Place, Madison WI 53726	<u> </u>	
Address		
0		
Kate J. Forest 2/19/	24	
Signature		

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Alayna Dibo Name 1913 Kendall Ave. Address

Petition of Appeal of the Decision of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission Approving on February 12, 2024 a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1908 Arlington Place LLC for a Land Division at 1908 Arlington Place in the University Heights **Historic District**

I HEREBY JOIN AS A PETITIONER IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED PETITION OF APPEAL:

Michael Martoccio Name 1913 Kendall Ave

Address