Landmarks Commission
Meeting of August 14, 2023
Agenda #2, Legistar #79099

I would like to supplement my letter, specifically with respect to Standard #9 (new construction "shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment." The staff report concluded: "The new building will read as a building of its time, but it still compatible with the size and style of houses found in that part of the Nakoma neighborhood."

What matters is whether the proposed home is compatible with the Old Spring Tavern ("OST") and its environment. The language of Standard #9 conveys that concept, but it is further reinforced by the Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, guidelines which were developed to help apply the Standards. Those Guidelines have "Recommended" and "Not Recommended" actions. With respect to new construction:

- Recommended: Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction that are compatible with the historic character of the site and preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape.
- Not Recommended: Introducing new construction on the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, material, or color, which destroys historic relationships on the site …

The Guidelines also state, in part: "Generally, a new addition should be subordinate to the historic building. … The same guidance applies to new construction so that it does not negatively impact the historic character of the building or its site."

Some comparisons between the OST and the proposed new home.

1. Length of the building: OST approx. 57'; new 88' (54% longer)
2. Footprint of building's living area: OST 1281 sq.ft.; new 2156 sq.ft. (68% larger)
3. Total living area: OST 2373 sq.ft.; new 4450 sq.ft. (87% more)
4. Percent of lot covered by the living area: OST 7.7%; new 19.9%
5. Roof lines: OST a front gable roof; new 4 different levels of gable roof, 3 gable ends facing OST, and a steeper pitch
6. Façade: OST flat façade; new has an articulated façade with 6 sections on the façade facing OST
7. Color/material: OST reddish-pink brick; new white stucco (EIFS?)
8. The new home's roof line would be 18' higher than OST's roof line (which is almost half the height of façade facing OST)

The new home would not be subordinate to the OST in terms of massing, size and scale - it would be significantly larger. The white color would pop in comparison to the subdued brick color. The busy roof lines and façade articulation of the new home are not compatible with the OST's simple design.

Respectfully Submitted,
Linda Lehnertz

Bailey, Heather

From: hmpwis@charter.net
Sent: Monday, August 14, 2023 2:35 PM
To: PLLCApplications
Subject: Agenda Item # 79099 - Proposed New Construction on Old Spring Tavern Property

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Members of the Madison Landmarks Commission,

I am writing to urge you to deny the certificate of appropriateness for the proposed plan to build an oversized house on the property (Lot 2) of the Old Spring Tavern. The current plan for a 4,500-square-foot new construction does not protect the integrity of this landmark property that is enjoyed by so many who appreciate the Old Spring Tavern as one of the most significant historic properties in Madison. I am also puzzled by some comments that the proposed plan for new construction fits in with the rest of the neighborhood. That is not the point, nor is this issue personal about the current owners of Lot 2 or their intentions. The plan for new construction on Lot 2 should demonstrate adherence to the preservation standards and protect the integrity of the landmark Old Spring Tavern property. As currently proposed, the Old Spring Tavern property would not be protected.

If this proposal is allowed to go through, I would question the purpose of preservations standards and the Commission's efforts in protecting landmark properties.

Sincerely,
Heidi Pankoke
810 Ottawa Trail
Madison, WI 53711