PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

July 26, 2023

PREPARED FOR THE URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

Project Address: 4716 Sheboygan Avenue

Application Type: Informational Presentation for a New Hotel in Madison Yards in Urban Design District

(UDD) 6

UDC will be an Advisory and an Approving Body

Legistar File ID #: 78595

Prepared By: Jessica Vaughn, AICP, UDC Secretary

Background Information

Applicant | Contact: Kyle Strigenz, HKS Holdings, LLC | Ethan Skeels, Kahler Slater

Project Description: The applicant is proposing the construction of a five-story, approx. 85,000 GFA, 144-room hotel on Block 4, Madison Yards at Hill Farms.

Project Background:

- The UDC recommended approval of the Madison Yards at Hill Farms Planned Development General Development Plan (PD-GDP) on July 11, 2018 (Legistar File ID 48873).
- On April 23, 2018, Plan Commission recommended approval, and Common Council subsequently approved the Madison Yards at Hill Farms PD-GDP on May 1, 2018 (Legistar File ID 50130). Common Council approval of the PD-GDP established the zoning text and development standards within the Planned Development (recorded PD-GDP attached below).
- UDC received an Informational Presentation on March 11, 2020, for a residential/commercial mixed-use building on this site, "Block 4." (Legistar File ID <u>59852</u>).

Approval Standards: The UDC will be an **approving body** on this request when a formal application comes forward. The site is located in Urban Design District 6 ("UDD 6"), which requires that the Urban Design Commission review the proposed project using the design standards and guidelines for that district in MGO Section 33.24(13).

The UDC will also be an **advisory body** on the Planned Development request. For Planned Developments the UDC is required to provide a recommendation to the Plan Commission with specific findings on the design objectives listed in Zoning Code sections 28.098(1), Statement of Purpose, and (2), Standards for Approval (PD Standards Attached), including PD Standard (e), which generally speaks to coordinating "...architectural styles and building forms to achieve greater compatibility with surrounding land uses and create an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area and the statement of purpose of the PD District."

Zoning Related Information: The project site is located within the Madison Yards at Hill Farms Planned Development District, Block 4. As noted in the Madison Yards at Hill Farms PD Zoning Text, hotel uses are considered permitted uses, and in Block 4 building heights are required to be between two and eight stories (20-95 feet), with gross floor area ranging from 30,000-160,000 square-feet. In addition, the text also include guidelines related to the building location, orientation, massing and articulation, materials, and landscaping and open space design, among other design-related considerations.

The project site is also located within the recently adopted TOD Overlay zone. The TOD Overlay requires that 30 percent of the building shall be within 20 feet of the primary and secondary streets, which in this case is Sheboygan Avenue and Gardener Road, respectively. As proposed, the building appears to meet this standard as setbacks along Sheboygan Avenue are a maximum of 18'-6" and 12' along Gardener Road.

Legistar File ID #78595 4716 Sheboygan Ave 7/26/23 Page 2

In addition, the TOD Overlay requires that principal building entrances on all new buildings shall be oriented towards their primary abutting street (Sheboygan Avenue) and be located within the maximum setback (20 feet), and that parking shall not be located between the primary street building façade and the primary street. As proposed, while a building entry is oriented towards Sheboygan Avenue, the Zoning Administrator will ultimately determine whether the proposed entry meets the design parameters outlined in the TOD Overlay for principal building entries. With regard to the surface parking location, as designed it does not comply with the existing TOD Overlay requirements. As such, the proposed surface parking could only be approved if an exception were granted as part of the PD approval process.

Staff notes that a comprehensive zoning analysis will be completed when a formal application for PD-SIP is submitted. Ultimately, the Zoning Administrator will determine compliance with the TOD Overlay requirements.

Summary of Design Considerations

Planning Division staff requests that the UDC review the proposed development and provide comments based on the standards for Planned Developments and UDD 6 requirements and guidelines, including the design considerations noted below. Additionally, the approved designed guidelines that were approved as part of the General Development Plan are attached to this memo as a reference.

Building Orientation. The project site is unique in that it is bounded on all sides by public and private streets, with Sheboygan Avenue and Gardener Road being the primary and secondary street, respectively. As such, consideration should be given to maintaining a positive building orientation to all adjacent streets, in particular the primary and secondary streets, including incorporating an enhanced design aesthetic at the pedestrian level and locating active building uses along those streets.

As proposed, the primary abutting street is a public street and fronted with a surface parking lot and a seemingly secondary building entry, and the secondary street is void of activity or significant architectural detailing. Staff believes that consideration should be given to relocating, reconfiguring, or reducing the surface parking area. Doing so could result in an improved site and building orientation to the primary street, as well as with surrounding development.

Staff requests UDC provide feedback related to the building orientation as it relates to the surrounding streets and development, as well as the architectural detailing and design at the pedestrian level. Consideration should be given to the location of active building entryways, location, design and connectivity of open spaces, location and screening of parking and back-of-houses uses, etc.

Building Design. Staff requests the Commission provide feedback on the overall building design and
composition as it relates to the UDD 6 guidelines and requirements, as well as the PD standards, especially
those that speak to maintaining consistency and compatibility with intended character, utilizing an
enhanced design aesthetic, especially at the ground level and across all four sides of the building,
minimizing blank walls, etc.

In addition, while not shown on the elevations, consideration should be given to potential HVAC louvers, including wall pack units, which are commonly associated with lodging uses. It has been the current practice to not locate such units on street facing facades, though they have been approved in some situations when found to be well integrated into the façade's design. Staff requests the Commission's feedback on potential HVAC louvers/wall pack units.

Legistar File ID #78595 4716 Sheboygan Ave 7/26/23 Page 3

- Building Materials. The building material palette is comprised of masonry, metal panel and fiber cement
 board with wood accents. Staff requests the UDC provide feedback on the proposed material palette,
 especially as it relates to the PD standards, including those that speak to maintaining consistency and
 compatibility within the Planned Development and creating enhanced aesthetic desirability. In addition,
 consideration should be given to the UDD 6 guidelines and requirements which generally speak to utilizing
 high-quality, durable materials that are sensitive to context, minimizing blank walls, and utilizing four
 sided architecture and design detailing, etc.
- Landscape and Screening. UDD 6 Landscaping guidelines and requirements generally speak to providing landscape that is functional as well as aesthetic, providing year-round screening, color and texture. Staff requests the UDC provide feedback as it relates to proposed landscape concept, including screening, breaking down blank walls, and adding pedestrian interest along street frontages.

ATTACHMENT PD Zoning Statement of Purpose and Standards

28.098 (1) Statement of Purpose.

The Planned Development (PD) District is established to provide a voluntary regulatory framework as a means to facilitate the unique development of land in an integrated and innovative fashion, to allow for flexibility in site design, and to encourage development that is sensitive to environmental, cultural, and economic considerations, and that features high-quality architecture and building materials. In addition, the Planned Development District is intended to achieve one or more of the following objectives:

- (a) Promotion of green building technologies, low-impact development techniques for stormwater management, and other innovative measures that encourage sustainable development.
- (b) Promotion of integrated land uses allowing for a mixture of residential, commercial, and public facilities along corridors and in transitional areas, with enhanced pedestrian, bicycle and transit connections and amenities.
- (c) Preservation and enhancement of important environmental features through careful and sensitive placement of buildings and facilities.
- (d) Preservation of historic buildings, structures, or landscape features through adaptive reuse of public or private preservation of land.
- (e) Provision of more adequate, usable, and suitably located open space, recreational amenities, and other public facilities than would otherwise be provided under conventional land development techniques.
- (f) Facilitation of high-quality development that is consistent with the goals, objectives, policies, and recommendations of the Comprehensive Plan and adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.

28.098(2) Approval Standards for Project

The standards for approval of a zoning map amendment to the PD District, or any major alteration to an approved General Development Plan, are as follows:

- (a) The applicant shall demonstrate that no other base zoning district can be used to achieve a substantially similar pattern of development. Planned developments shall not be allowed simply for the purpose of increasing overall density or allowing development that otherwise could not be approved unless the development also meets one or more of the objectives of (1) above. Conditions under which planned development may be appropriate include:
 - 1. Site conditions such as steep topography or other unusual physical features; or
 - 2. Redevelopment of an existing area or use of an infill site that could not be reasonably developed under base zoning district requirements.
- (b) The PD District plan shall facilitate the development or redevelopment goals of the Comprehensive Plan and of adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.
- (c) The PD District plan shall not adversely affect the economic health of the City or the area of the City where the development is proposed. The City shall be able to provide municipal services to the property where the planned development is proposed without a significant increase of the cost of providing those services or economic impact on municipal utilities serving that area.
- (d) The PD District plan shall not create traffic or parking demands disproportionate to the facilities and improvements designed to meet those demands. A traffic demand management plan may be required as a way

Legistar File ID #78595 4716 Sheboygan Ave 7/26/23 Page 5

to resolve traffic and parking concerns. The Plan shall include measurable goals, strategies, and actions to encourage travelers to use alternatives to driving alone, especially at congested times of day. Strategies and actions may include, but are not limited to, carpools and vanpools; public and private transit; promotion of bicycling, walking and other non-motorized travel; flexible work schedules and parking management programs to substantially reduce automobile trips.

- (e) The PD District plan shall coordinate architectural styles and building forms to achieve greater compatibility with surrounding land uses and create an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area and the statement of purpose of the PD District.
- (f) The PD District plan shall include open space suitable to the type and character of development proposed, including for projects with residential components, a mix of structured and natural spaces for use by residents and visitors. Areas for stormwater management, parking, or in the public right of way shall not be used to satisfy this requirement.
- (g) The PD district shall include suitable assurances that each phase could be completed in a manner that would not result in an adverse effect upon the community as a result of termination at that point.
- (h) When applying the above standards to an application for height in excess of that allowed in Section 28.071(2)(a) Downtown Height Map, except as provided for in Section 28.071(2)(a)1. and Section 28.071(2)(b), the Plan Commission shall consider the recommendations in adopted plans and no application for excess height shall be granted by the Plan Commission unless it finds that all of the following conditions are present:
 - 1. The excess height is compatible with the existing or planned (if the recommendations in the Downtown Plan call for changes) character of the surrounding area, including but not limited to the scale, mass, rhythm, and setbacks of buildings and relationships to street frontages and public spaces.
 - 2. The excess height allows for a demonstrated higher quality building than could be achieved without the additional stories.
 - 3. The scale, massing and design of new buildings complement and positively contribute to the setting of any landmark buildings within or adjacent to the project and create a pleasing visual relationship with them.
 - 4. For projects proposed in priority viewsheds and other views and vistas identified on the Views and Vistas Map in the City of Madison Downtown Plan, there are no negative impacts on the viewshed as demonstrated by viewshed studies prepared by the applicant.
- (i) When applying the above standards to an application to reduce or eliminate stepbacks required by Section 28.071(2)(c) Downtown Stepback Map, the Plan Commission shall consider the recommendations in adopted plans, including the downtown plan. No application to reduce or eliminate stepbacks may be granted unless it finds that all of the following conditions are present:
 - 1. The lot is a corner parcel.
 - 2. The lot is not part of a larger assemblage of properties.
 - 3. The entire lot is vacant or improved with only a surface parking lot.
 - 4. No principal buildings on the lot have been demolished or removed since the effective date of this ordinance