

From: [M. E. Braun](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#); [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Legistar #77016, in support of protecting Isthmus Path Prairie Garden
Date: Tuesday, May 9, 2023 9:14:39 PM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Subject: Legistar #77016, in support of protecting the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden

Dear Plan Commission members,

The Isthmus Path Prairie Garden is one of Madison's gems, enhancing the path and nearby area for all who pass through, and visit or live nearby. The culmination of more than twenty years of restoration work led by volunteers, the Garden is full of flowering plants, pollinators, birds and wildlife, paths, and well-sited picnic tables. A welcome contrast to the ever-increasing construction on the East side, the Garden provides pleasure and a flourishing environment for so many. And it is beautiful!

To ensure that the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden is protected and will continue to provide enjoyment for Madison residents and visitors, I urge the Plan Commission to adopt the conditions for approval suggested by the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden.

<https://app.box.com/s/3ft80ticjvxnn6gdkgfpcttdoudvmy>

Respectfully,
Mary Elizabeth Braun
903 NW 35th Street
Corvallis, OR

M. E. Braun, Corvallis, Oregon "Ride the ultimate sport utility vehicle: A bicycle"

From: [Ariana McJunkin](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Subject: Please protect our polinators and our city
Date: Tuesday, May 9, 2023 8:04:55 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Legistar # 77016 - in support of protecting The Isthmus Path Prairie Garden

Dear Plan Commission members,

We need our pollinators! Please protect the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden. As our city and neighborhoods work to build up vs out our natural resources is too often taken for granted. It is imperative that we protect the green spaces and the pollinators and native flowers and plants in order to protect our city, food, and planet. Please protect this path for humans, animals and the earth by making IPPG's requests conditions of approval for the development proposed at 826 Williamson and 302 Paterson.

Please add the requested conditions listed in the letter from the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden, to the Plan Commission's Conditions of approval for this project. The Friends of IPPG letter can be found at this link.

<https://app.box.com/s/3ft80ticjvxnc6gdkgfpcottoudvmy>

Thank You.

Respectfully,

Ariana McJunkin
150 Corry St. Apt 2
Madison, WI 53704

From: [Karolyn Beebe](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Subject: Please Protect the Bike Path Prairie
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 5:34:43 PM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Members, of the Plan Commission

I have loved this bit of prairie for years, and wish you could plan to expand it further along the path.

Please be sure that any new development nearby is done in ways that protect it far into the future.

Thank you,
Karolyn Beebe
220 Merry Street
53704

From: [Gary Tipler](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#); [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Retain and protect bike path prairie landscape plantings
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 4:40:32 PM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dealer Alder Rummel and Plan Commissioners,

As a neighborhood participant in the creation and improvements to parks and public open spaces for decades I urge you to call for protections for the existing bike path prairie landscape on the 800 block of the East bike path.

Thank you.

Gary Tipler
Jenifer Street, Madison

From: [John](#)
To: [Field, Derek](#); [Duncan, John](#); [Figueroa Cole, Yvette](#); kianespencer@gmail.com; mcsheppard@madisoncollege.edu; tony.fernandez5@gmail.com
Cc: [Wells, Chris](#); [Rummel, Marsha](#); [tyler krupp](#); [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Subject: Plan Commission agenda item #15 & Isthmus Path Prairie Garden
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 3:51:30 PM
Attachments: [IPPG Struck-Irwin PC2023-05-08 r.pdf](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Commission members,

You may have noticed emails/comments in support of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden (IPPG). I am glad to report that recent conversations with Mr. Krupp resulted today in agreement on all the points in fact or in principal. While the conditions agreed on with Mr. Krupp are slightly different than those in the letter from the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie garden (submitted to PC May 3 and attached) they achieve the same results.

We are asking that you incorporate as conditions of approval the agreements between Threshold Development Group and the Friends of the IPPG. If incorporation as Plan Commission approval conditions is not possible, we request that the agreed items be memorialized, on the record, in some other way, as requested by Alder Rummel in her comment email of today.

Conditions agreed on by Threshold Development Group and the Friends of the IPPG re: development of 302 S. Paterson

- 1) Matching of grade between the project and the public space will leave the public space undisturbed.
- 2) There will be no staging or parking of equipment north of the property line.
- 3) The existing fence within the public right-of-way will remain during construction. The existing fence on the property line will be removed and replaced with fence panels within 4 feet of the property line.
- 4) A short path will be constructed by Friends of IPPG through the garden from the project to the bike path at a mutually agreed upon location.
- 5) A low fence or other mutually agreed upon landscape feature will be established at the property boundary to indicate the line between public and private property.
- 6) There will be minimum of 3-4 pet waste disposal station in the project.
- 7) Efforts will be made to give residents access to the 20 foot green space setback on the south-west end of the property for pet exercise.
- 8) Lighting and security cameras will not impinge on the public right-of-way.
- 9) There will be no use of salt on surfaces that drain to the IPPG. If salt must be used on surfaces, those will drain away from the IPPG or to storm drains.
- 10) There will be no snow disposal on the IPPG because of the salt that gets mixed with the snow.
- 11) All landscaping and maintenance of the IPPG is to be conducted by IPPG volunteers.
- 12) There will be further discussion of the feasibility of some roof runoff being routed to the IPPG for use in 1 or 2 raingardens.

Thank you,

John Coleman with Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden

.





John Coleman
413 S. Dickinson St.
Madison, WI 53703
608-256-8164 or 715-209-1616

From: [Truly Remarkable Loon](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#); [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: 5/8/23 Plan Commission Agenda Items 14 & 15
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 11:20:47 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Planning Commission,

During the demolition and construction proposed at 826 Williamson Street and 302 S Paterson Street please require the developer to preserve and protect the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden, located along the Capital City bike path between S. Paterson and S. Livingston. This bit of green space is a priceless asset to the citizens of Madison and especially bikers like myself that use the bike path.

Thank you. T. R. Loon

--

Truly Remarkable Loon trl@trloon.com www.trloon.com (608) 256-3307

"Life consists with wildness. The most alive is the wildest"

-Henry David Thoreau

From: [Richard Castelnuovo](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Cc: [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Protect the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden (IPPG)
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 11:02:28 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Madison Plan Commission

Please protect the IPPG and I support the conditions asked for by the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden. Without protection, the IPPG may be damaged during and after construction of the new development at the Struck & Irwin site. The garden abuts the development and the simple conditions that the Friends of the IPPG ask for in their letter (at: <https://app.box.com/s/3ft80ticjvxnn6gdkgfpcttdoudvmy>) will ensure that the garden is not damaged.

Richard Castelnuovo
1609 Jenifer St, Madison, WI 53704

From: [joanna_donovan](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Cc: [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Agenda item #15, Legistar #77016 5/8/23
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 10:28:46 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Plan Commission
Meeting of May 8, 2023
Agenda item #15, Legistar #77016

Dear Plan Commission members,

I am writing to urge the Madison Plan Commission to support the conditions asked for by the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden to preserve and protect the Isthmus Path Prairie during and after construction of the new development at the Struck & Irwin site on the 600 block of Williamson. The garden abuts the development and the simple conditions that the Friends of the IPPG ask for in their letter (at: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__app.box.com_s_3fr80tjcvxnn6gdkgfpccottoudvmy&d=DwlCaQ&c=byefhD2ZumMFFQYPZBagUCDuBiM9Q9twmxaBM0hCgII&r=EQgg7uY6gXl1mVjfbnHVDc8f-JggwxtZapC762N-w&m=WG4c5E_p9FDQV3wFuOEDTW4tBRoh81E-wXsWc17c49IZ1WZpDL3FSrNjQmbp_V8M&s=-N7sKaRyt94B9nND-59I5coJC78dgB8dnX94RQb6JA&e=) will ensure that the garden is not damaged and continues to thrive.

The Isthmus Path Prairie Garden is an amazing asset to our neighborhood and enjoyed by literally 1000s of people some days in the summer months! In fact, I find this prairie such a wonderful part of our city that I organized a group of neighborhood youth to extend the established prairie onto the 700 block of the bike path about 10 years ago. With the support of City Parks and numerous local businesses, including MG&E, we planted the 1/3 acre parcel with established donated native plants, and native grass and plant seeds. Unfortunately the prairie was not protected during the construction of the development at 722 Williamson. The plot was used for construction related activities and was eventually planted over with annual grass turf and is now mowed regularly.

While I believed the developers at the Struck & Irwin site are in agreement that the prairie is an asset to the city, the neighborhood and their new development, I think it is important the Madison Plan Commission incorporate protection of the prairie into your approval.

Thank you for your consideration,

Joanna Donovan
1338 East Wilson
Madison, WI
53703

From: [Lindsey Lee-CC](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Subject: Legistar # 77016 (Struck & Irwin)
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 10:28:28 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear members of the Plan Commission,

I would like to encourage you to include as conditions the ones delineated in the letter sent to you by the Friends of the Ishmus Path Prairie Gardens for the proposed project planned for the old Struck & Irwin site. They seem more than reasonable.

Thank you,
Lindsey Lee
731 Williamson St.

Sent from my mobile phone

From: edl@diliscialaw.com
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Cc: [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Legistar # 77016 - in support of protecting The Isthmus Path Prairie Garden
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 9:55:14 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Plan Commission members,

I am a former resident and frequent visitor to Madison. I ask that you protect the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden. One of the things I loved about Madison is its bits of nature mixed in with the city. The path is a green strip that runs through the Isthmus. As such, it provides respite for people, which is necessary for any healthy city. As a 20 year restoration of natural resources, the Prairie Garden's habitat should be protected for plants and pollinators as well as people.

Please protect this path by making IPPG's requests conditions of approval for the development proposed at 826 Williamson and 302 Paterson. These are:

- (1) The applicant shall not use the right-of-way for any construction related activity including, but not limited to, staging, storage, or equipment access. Except, the area between the property line and the existing chain link fence may be used. The existing chain link fence in the right-of-way will remain in place until after construction is completed. It takes years to establish a prairie garden – some plants can take 15 years to become fully established.
- (2) The easterly 99 feet of chain link fence on current Lot 8 and Lot 9 is on the property line. If applicant removes this section of fence, it shall install temporary fencing in the right-of-way to provide a line of demarcation in order to ensure the right-of-way is not used or disturbed during construction. This temporary fencing may be placed in the right-of-way, but no more than 4 feet from the property line.
- (3) Applicant shall install at least two dog waste stations, with a bag dispenser and a waste can. One shall be installed in the grassy area near the bike racks at the rear entry to 302 S Paterson. One shall be installed in the grassy area at the entrance to the 6' setback area (near the "match line" on page L101 of the plans).
- (4) No excessive exterior lighting may spill over into the prairie garden (right-of-way).
- (5) Applicant shall not use the prairie garden (right-of-way) to deposit snow from the fire access lane or from other salted surfaces.
- (6) Runoff from the 302 S Paterson fire access lane and other salted surfaces shall not drain into the right-of-way.
- (7) At completion, a low fence shall be installed along the property line between the project and the City right-of-way. The fence shall have at least one and no more than two openings so that residents can have access to the prairie garden.

Thank you,
Eleonora di Liscia
5333 Madison St.
Skokie, IL 60077
1-847-568-0160

From: [Graham Jonaitis](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Cc: [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Support for the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 8:46:42 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

As a neighborhood resident who appreciates biodiversity and pollinator habitat, I think it's imperative that the conditions asked for by the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden be added to the Plan Commission's conditions for approval of the proposed development on the current Struck & Irwin site.

Thank you!

-Graham Jonaitis
604 Rogers

Sent from my iBanana

From: [Mike Kohn](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Subject: Preserve Isthmus Bike Path Prairie Garden
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 8:23:12 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Committee Members,

I also support the conditions requested by The Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden.

Sincerely,
Mike Kohn DVM
Williamson St. Resident and Business Owner since 1981

From: [A Z](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#); [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Legistar # 77016 - in support of protecting The Isthmus Path Prairie Garden
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 6:45:31 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Plan Commission members,

We need our pollinators! Please protect the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden. This more than 20 year restoration of natural resources is too often taken for granted. Please support the IPPG's requests for conditions of approval for the development proposed at 826 Williamson and 302 Paterson.

Thank you!

Arlene Zaucha

350 S. Hamilton St, #1102, Madison, 53703 Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden are asking that the Plan Commission specify conditions for the 302 S. Paterson portion of the proposed development at the Struck & Irwin site. These minor but important conditions will ensure that the garden is protected and will continue to provide enjoyment for Madison residents and visitors.

Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden are asking that the Plan Commission specify conditions for the 302 S. Paterson portion of the proposed development at the Struck & Irwin site. These minor but important conditions will ensure that the garden is protected and will continue to provide enjoyment for Madison residents and visitors.

From: [Mary Ann McBride](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Cc: [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Isthmus Prairie Garden
Date: Monday, May 8, 2023 12:51:58 AM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Council,

I am writing to tell you how much I, my family, and my friends love the Isthmus Prairie Garden and how we anticipate its rebirth each year.

Our Marquette neighborhood is living through growth and change today. As renters and homeowners, we'd like to work with developers and continue to see our Marquette continue developing into the friendly, family, fun, human -oriented place we call home.

Please do all you can to guide the Strunk project to respect our prairie that abuts their property line.

Sincerely,

Mary Ann McBride
1310 Spaight St, Madison, WI 53703

--

Mary Ann

From: [Laurie Wermter](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Cc: [Rummel, Marsha](#)
Subject: Minimum Protection Needed for the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden
Date: Sunday, May 7, 2023 5:07:27 PM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Members of the Plan Commission, I ask that you put in place the basic protections for the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden at the new development which will be going up at the former location of the Struck & Irwin fence company (which will encompass frontage on both Williamson Street & South Paterson Street).

Please, please, please, give great consideration to the comments submitted by the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden—for their submitted comments, see “IPPG_Struck-Irwin_forPlanCommission2023-05-08.pdf.”

The neighbors in the Wil-Mar neighborhood have donated thousands of hours over the years to make this a pleasant, imminently livable area and the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden is one of the crowning jewels in this section of the incredibly ‘nature-deficient’ downtown.

Yours truly,

**Laurie Wermter
Resident, 800-block of Williamson Street
(One block from the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden)
laurie.wermter@wisc.edu**

From: [Dan Melton](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Subject: Isthmus Path Prairie Garden
Date: Sunday, May 7, 2023 4:12:27 PM

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Please protect the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden during and after construction of the new development at the Struck & Irwin site.

Much Thanks,

Dan and Julie Melton

2138 LaFollette Avenue

Plan Commission
Meeting of May 8, 2023
Agenda item #15, Legistar #77016

The conditions requested by the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden are reasonable conditions needed to preserve a public treasure.

Proposed conditions #1 and #2 are needed to prevent what happened at 722 Williamson. It will ensure that both the developer, and staff, know that the prairie garden cannot be used for construction activities.

- Retaining the existing fencing where that fencing is in the right-of-way will ensure that construction does not spill over into the prairie garden for about two-thirds of the property line. This existing fencing is about 5-9 feet (distance varies, but much is close to 9 feet) within the right-of-way, so the developer will have some excess room to work.
- Requiring temporary fencing, if the fence is removed where the fence is on the property line, no more than 4 feet into the right-of-way, will serve the same purposes as proposed condition #1.
- Since construction fencing will be needed, these conditions only specify the extent of the encroachment into the prairie garden.

I would like to propose that condition #2 be modified. The rear of the 302 S Paterson lot does not have fencing for about 66 feet, and this area also needs protection.

Proposed condition #2 (addition in *italics*): The easterly 99 feet of chain link fence on current Lot 8 and Lot 9 is on the property line. If applicant removes this section of fence, it shall install temporary fencing in the right-of-way to provide a line of demarcation in order to ensure the right-of-way is not used or disturbed during construction. This temporary fencing may be placed in the right-of-way, but no more than 4 feet from the property line. *The applicant shall also place temporary fencing, no more than 4 feet into the right-of-way, at the westerly end of the lot where there is not any existing fencing (current lot #4).*

Condition #29 in the staff report ("little to no access to the Capital City Trail/E. Wilson Unimproved Right of Way will be granted for construction purposes" and the applicant is "financially responsible to damages to any of the plantings") is inadequate.

- This language is similar to that for 802-826 Regent (Legistar 71245) in which the applicant was told in condition #60 that "little to no access to the public right of way on N Park Street or Regent Street will be granted for construction purposes." Yet the sidewalk, terrace and a traffic lane on the north 800 Regent block are closed so that the right-of-way can be used for construction purposes.
- It would seem that access to the right-of-way is allowed if it is determined that various forms of 'traffic' can continue. With the garden, 'traffic' would continue on the bike path even if almost all of the garden is used for construction purposes.
- Even short term limited access could be detrimental to the garden. For example, the use of heavy machinery for several days could leave ruts, smash and/or tear up plants – particularly if done when the ground is wet.
- Financial responsibility for the plants that are damaged has limited usefulness. Replacing damaged plants is like replacing a mature canopy tree with a sapling.

Proposed condition #3 regarding pet waste stations is needed. Most of the residents of this 133-unit building will find the rear entrance much more convenient to use since that is where the elevator is located. The damage done at 722 Williamson (Attachment #3 of the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden comment letter) is due to 96 apartments. Requiring pet waste stations is necessary to, hopefully, ensure that waste bags are properly disposed of, and that residents are directed to areas where they can relieve their dogs on-site (rather than in the garden).

Proposed condition #4, excessive lighting. The plans, Sheet number C-1.2, pdf page 18, only reflect two lights near the bike path, neither of which casts any light into the garden. It would be nice to keep it this way (since ordinances would allow 0.5 horizontal footcandles 4 feet above the ground 10 feet into the garden).

Proposed condition #5, no depositing of snow into the garden, is in accord with City ordinances. MGO 10.23(2) prohibits a property owner from depositing snow upon non-adjacent private property (including any portion of the public right-of-way) without consent. This condition makes clear to the developer, and staff, that consent to deposit snow in the garden will not be granted. This is particularly important since the fire lane (26' wide and about 195' long) abuts the garden. This fire lane will need to be salted to be kept clear, and that could be a lot of salt added to the garden.

Proposed condition #6, prohibiting runoff into the garden, particularly from the fire access lane, will also protect the garden from salt, since the fire access lane is on the property line.

Proposed condition #7, installation of a fence, will separate the private space from the public space. The Plan Commission has approved fencing requirements in the past when private property abuts City parks. See, for example (requiring fencing of lots that back onto land that is being dedicated as parkland):

https://www.cityofmadison.com/planning/projects/plat/documents/FirstAddnto1000OaksRZGDe moPrelimFnlPlat_DispoLetter.pdf

It has been suggested that many of these conditions are best handled voluntarily by the developer. In the past, this has not worked for the neighborhood. The 902/906 Williamson developer entered into an agreement with the neighborhood association to provide two affordable housing units, one at the 60% income level and one at the 80% income level, as a condition of MNA support. Those units never materialized. Without the requested conditions being added to the conditions of approval, the Isthmus Path Prairie garden will not be protected. The investors in this development may choose to not honor any voluntary agreement – after all, who wants to see their own lawn areas decimated by dog urine? And without conditions #1, #2, and #5, staff would likely proceed within the usual parameters – allowing use of the right-of-way for construction activities (like 722 Williamson), and allowing snow to be dumped in the right-of-way (since it would not have any apparent impact during the winter).

Respectfully Submitted,
Linda Lehnertz

Landmarks Commission Denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness

MGO 16.23(3)(a)4. requires Landmarks Commission approval before any land can be divided or combined. The Landmarks Commission is required to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for land combinations unless it finds that “that the proposed lot sizes ... are incompatible with adjacent lot sizes, or fail to maintain the general lot size pattern of the historic district.” MGO 41.18(4)

Landmarks denied the Certificate of Appropriateness for a lot combination of the proposed 826 Williamson and 302 S Paterson, Legistar 73458. Staff explained that, if approved, the site would be a single lot, but remain as two separate tax parcels (since 302 S Paterson is in a TIF district). The purpose of the land combination, as explained to Landmarks, was “to build a single, larger underground parking structure that for all intents and purposes would never be seen by anyone.” (Minute 45 of the 10/10/22 Landmarks meeting).

The Landmarks discussion included: the combination would not maintain the general lot size pattern; and, since Landmarks denied expanding the front property to include 14 feet of the back property, it is hard to justify adding the full lot. Mention was also made that the large lots at the west should not proceed east since it could erode the existing historic fabric and that as lots get larger so do buildings.

- As a side note, the proposed 826 Williamson and 302 S Paterson are a total of 78,408 square feet. Only three parcels in the historic district are larger – two are MG&E plant parcels, the other is the Fauerbach condos (with 5 buildings 2-4 stories). The average lot size for commercial properties (which includes apartment buildings and mixed-use buildings) is 13,650 square feet.

One question is whether deeming the two lots (per the proposed CSM) a “zoning lot” constitutes a land “combination” requiring Landmarks approval. (The staff report, page 4, states that the project site is one “zoning lot.”) A “land combination” has a broader meaning than a “lot combination.” A “land combination” includes, or should include, two lots being combined into a single zoning lot.

A second question is whether the single zoning lot will have a historic district suffix. MGO 28.146(1) requires a historic suffix “be appended to the current and any future zoning district classification of each *zoning lot* so affected ...” MGO 28.146(4) states: “the HIST-TL suffix applies to all *zoning lots* located within the Third Lake Ridge Historic District ...”

- Although a lot (a tract of land, designated by metes and bounds, land survey, minor land division or plat, and recorded in the office of the county register of deeds) may have split zoning, there is not any ordinance provision which permits split zoning on a “zoning lot.”
- Will the entire parcel have a historic suffix, bringing the proposed 302 S Paterson lot into the historic district?
 - If so, then the Landmarks Commission should have approval of the proposed 302 S Paterson building.

- The alternative would be to remove the 826 Williamson property from the historic district. It would then become the only property on Williamson that is not part of the historic district.
 - This would set a bad precedent. The Comprehensive Plan has an action to “complete, adopt, and implement a Historic Preservation Plan” and that adopted plan says one of the fundamental functions of historic preservation is “preserving and protecting designated historic resources, such as locally designated landmarks and historic districts.”

Approving this request for a single zoning lot would almost certainly constrain any future action the Landmarks Commission could take on an application for a lot combination of the 826 and 302 lots. In determining whether to approve a lot combination, Landmarks has looked at whether the lots have operated as a single parcel. Certainly two lots operating as a “zoning lot” are operating as a single parcel.

Relevance of BUILD II

The Comprehensive Plan emphasizes the importance of neighborhood plans. The Comp Plan states that sub-area plans, such as BUILD II, provide more detailed planning recommendations and should be given substantial weight. In fact, if an inconsistency exists between a sub-area plan and the Comprehensive Plan, one of the plans should be amended to eliminate the inconsistency.

- “These related plans can provide detail and specific implementation actions, fine tune larger concepts, and react to rapidly developing issues, and provide in-depth analysis not possible at a citywide level.” (page 7)
- “Sub-area plans frequently offer more detailed height and design standards, and should be referred to in addition to this Plan.” (page 17)
- “In many instances, the recommended land use pattern is refined in sub-area plans that may include more detailed land use categories that generally fit within the broad categories within this Plan, as well as design guidelines that respond to the specific surrounding context.” (page 17)
- Sub-area plans adopted as a supplement to the Comprehensive Plan “reflect their function and status in providing more detailed planning recommendations than are often needed to effectively implement the Plan.” (page 124)
- “If an inconsistency is identified between this [Comprehensive] Plan and a reasonably contemporary sub-area plan, substantial weight should be given to the sub-area plan.” (page 125)

BUILD II was created with the specific goal of defining appropriate infill that maintains the continuity of the original community fabric. In particular, the historic fabric – a fabric that does not change with the times. Build II contains guidelines, and contains criteria for review of new construction. These criteria are clearly neighborhood plan recommendations. Two of the criteria are height and massing. (The Landmarks Commission only considers whether new construction is visually compatible, it cannot consider BUILD II.)

Height of the 302 S Paterson wing

The staff report discusses how the 5-story wing (1) “is consistent with the more contemporary Comprehensive Plan’s recommendations” and (2) that “that the context between these properties

[two 5-story buildings on the 700 block] are similar and height relationship to Williamson Street is arguably similar.”

Comprehensive Plan

Certainly the Comprehensive Plan is more contemporary than BUILD II. However, the Comp Plan provides for 2-6 story buildings in the Community Mixed-Use land category, so both a 4-story (in accordance with BUILD II and TOD) and a 5-story building fit within the general land use specifications. And, as discussed above, the Comp Plan recognizes the importance of neighborhood plans. One of the purposes of TSS zoning is to “facilitate preservation, development or redevelopment consistent with the adopted goals, objectives, policies, and recommendations of the Comprehensive Plan and of adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.”

Context of 5-story buildings

The two 5-story buildings cited as precedence in the staff report are in a different BUILD II height category. Those buildings are in “Zone IV” while 302 S Paterson would be in “Zone II.”

- Zone IV permits a 5-story/54’ building, with additional bonus floors (for affordable housing, preservation or structured parking) not to exceed 85’ in height from the street grade or 7 floors, whichever is less. The building at the back of 722 Williamson is 55.25’ in height (159.8’ to the top of the screen wall), but that building also involved the preservation of the Olds Building and structured parking. The 302 S Livingston building is 60 feet, and was also entitled to the structured parking bonus.
- Zone II permits a 3-story building with one potential bonus story for affordable housing, preservation or structured parking.

The context of the 700 and 800 blocks differs.

- The 700 block backs up to MG&E’s Blount Street generating station, a more industrial area with massive buildings one-half block away.
- The 800 block backs up to a block that is primarily an MG&E equipment storage lot, and a 2-story water utility office. The largest building on that block is at the furthest corner, a 4-story parking garage.
- The properties along the bike path on the 700 block are all large buildings. The properties along the 700 block of Williamson were all commercial uses, though new construction has resulted in two mixed-use properties.
- 302’s immediate neighbor along the bike path is a 3-story apartment building. The properties at the northeast corner along Williamson are a 2-unit and a 4-unit (both 2 stories), a 3-story tavern at the corner with 13 units, and a 1½ story tavern.

Height of the 826 Williamson wing

The majority of the 826 lot is in “Zone 1” under BUILD II. Zone 1 provides that new buildings shall be no higher than 2-1/2 stories except, on the north side of the 800 and 900 blocks, flat-roofed three story structures are permitted. Zone 1 does not provide for bonus stories.

NEW CONSTRUCTION: HEIGHT ZONES F 600 TO 1100 BLOCKS OF WILLIAMSON AND WIL



The red outline is the Stuck & Irwin building. Zone 1 runs to the middle of the S&I building, or about 78' back from the property line. Zone II, which allows for a 4th story bonus, is the back 186 feet of the block.

Massing of the 826 Williamson wing

BUILD II, pages 33-34 address the massing criteria.

"New buildings shall be designed to reflect the patterns and rhythm of masses and spaces within the visually related area. The total mass of a new building shall be compatible with that of surrounding buildings. A building of larger than typical mass may be appropriate if it is broken into elements that are visually compatible with the mass of surrounding buildings.

And with respect to mixed-use buildings:

"b. Massing of commercial, and mixed-use buildings in Zones 1 and 1a. Articulation and breaks in the facade of commercial and mixed-use buildings must be sufficient to maintain the rhythm of masses and spaces of existing commercial and mixed-use buildings in the visually related area.

No building shall be wider than 60 feet."

826 has two segments: (1) the commercial side (about 50' wide) and (2) the residential side (about 70' wide), which are separated by about a 13' segment that is setback 8' from the commercial side and 4' from the residential side.

The 70' residential segment does not maintain the rhythm of masses and spaces of nearby commercial and mixed-use buildings. Most buildings are 20-30 feet in width, with a few at about 45-50 feet (Biederstaedt Grocery and the tobacco warehouse). Although the residential segment could arguably provide some articulation through use of the projecting window bays on the second and third floors, there are not any breaks in the façade to create a sense of space.

Respectfully Submitted,
Linda Lehnertz

Wells, Chris

From: Lewis Koch <lewiskoch@yahoo.com>
Sent: Sunday, May 07, 2023 11:26 AM
To: Plan Commission Comments
Cc: Latimer Burris, Amani
Subject: in support of protecting The Isthmus Path Prairie Garden

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Plan Commission, and Alders,

I am a Madison resident (and taxpayer), and a frequent user of Capital City bikepath.

I am writing in support of protecting The Isthmus Path Prairie Garden.

Spaces like this are essential to the city-- they add to the biodiversity of the urban landscape, and bring beauty into the lives of those who experience it.

Please help protect this rare space.

Thank you,

Lewis Koch
2661 East Johnson St
Madison, WI 53704

Wells, Chris

From: Erin Jonaitis <emjonaitis@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, May 07, 2023 10:47 AM
To: Plan Commission Comments; Rummel, Marsha
Subject: Isthmus Path Prairie Garden

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

To whom it may concern — I support the conditions requested by the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden for the development proposal you're considering for the property abutting the path.

Sincerely,
Erin Jonaitis
604 Rogers St, Madison, WI 53703

Wells, Chris

From: Tracy Doreen <myrealibrary@icloud.com>
Sent: Sunday, May 07, 2023 8:51 AM
To: Plan Commission Comments
Subject: Legistar # 77016 - in support of protecting The Isthmus Path Prairie Garden

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Plan Commission members,

We need our pollinators! Please protect the isthmus Path Prairie Garden. This more than 20 year restoration of natural resources is too often taken for granted. Humans are pollinators too! Please protect this path for humans, animals and the earth by making IPPG's requests conditions of approval for the development proposed at 826 Williamson and 302 Paterson.

Please add the requested conditions listed in the the letter from the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden, to the Plan Commission's Conditions of approval for this project. The Friends of IPPG letter can be found at this link:

<https://app.box.com/s/3ft80ticjvxnn6gdkgfpcottoudvmy>

Thank You.

Respectfully,

Tracy Doreen Dietzel
515 S Paterson
Madison, Wi

Wells, Chris

From: Jean Whitcomb <hannahwhitcomb@yahoo.com>
Sent: Sunday, May 07, 2023 11:28 AM
To: Plan Commission Comments
Cc: Rummel, Marsha
Subject: comments re: new development at Struck and Irwin site

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I support the conditions asked for by the Friends of the Isthmus Path Prairie Garden during and after construction of the new development at the Struck & Irwin site

Jean Whitcomb
941 Harvey Terrace
hannahwhitcomb@yahoo.com