# PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

January 11, 2023



PREPARED FOR THE URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

Project Address:339 W Gorham StreetApplication Type:Approval of a Planned Development (PD) Alteration for Exterior Modifications to the<br/>Previous Approval Building – UDC is an Advisory BodyLegistar File ID #:75281Prepared By:Jessica Vaughn, AICP, UDC Secretary

## **Background Information**

Applicant | Contact: Brent Pflederer, Core Madison, Gorham, LLC | Brian Munson, Vandewalle & Associates

**Project Description:** The applicant proposing exterior modifications to a previously approved building in a Planned Development (PD). The proposed modifications before the Commission include those noted below:

- Modifications to the entry canopy profile and projection,
- Replacement of the masonry detailing inside the curve of vertical masonry elements and endwalls both related to the main entry and along Broom Street,
- Modifications to the storefront canopies along State Street, and
- Residential garage door height and configuration of lites.

The applicant is also proposing modifications that will decrease the rooftop stormwater management systems and addition solar panels, as well as changes to the second floor, floor plan to remove a residential unit and increase the fitness room area.

**Approval Standards:** The UDC is an **advisory body** on the Planned Development request. For Planned Developments the Urban Design Commission is typically required to provide a recommendation to the Plan Commission with specific findings on the design objectives listed in Zoning Code sections 28.098(1), Statement of Purpose, and (2), Standards for Approval (PD Standards Attached). However, in this case, this item is anticipated to be considered as an administrative amendment, not requiring Plan Commission review. As such, the UDC is advisory to the Director of Planning (28.098(6), MGO).

**Adopted Plans:** The project site is located within the <u>Downtown Plan</u> (the "Plan") planning area in the State Street district. The Plan identifies State Street as "...Madison's premier street – a unique and special environment that has been created over the past 40 years." As noted in the Plan's recommendations, the goal of the State Street district is to maintain and enhance the unique sense of place that is characterized by a distinctive pedestrian-oriented streetscape and human-scale developments actively engaging the street.

### Summary of Design Considerations

While a number of modifications to the Oliv Building have been administratively approved through the Site Plan Review process as design progressions, including the organization of fenestrations as a result of interior layout changes, parapet wall heights, replacing glass railings with metal, removal of balconies, etc., staff believes that UDC review and recommendation of some of the proposed modifications is warranted given the potential impact to key pedestrian scaled design elements and streetscape environments. Legistar File ID #75281 339 W Gorham Street 01/11/2022 Page 2

Staff requests that the UDC review the exterior building modifications and make findings based on the aforementioned standards, including the PD standards that speak to creating "...an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area...", and as it relates to the impact the proposed modifications may have on the overall building design and detailing, streetscape and pedestrian environment, especially with regard to the items as noted below:

**Main Building Entry.** As noted on the plans, adjustments have been made to both the entry canopy profile and the design of the masonry end walls. The front entrance canopy has been significantly increased in profile and reduced projection from what was originally approved and the masonry detailing inside the curve of the endwall is proposed to be replaced with a painted steel plate.

**Broom Street Elevation.** Similar to the main entrance endwalls, the masonry detailing inside the curve of the vertical elements is also proposed to be replaced with a painted steel plate.

**Storefront Canopies – W Johnson, Gorham and State Street Elevations.** The applicant is proposing to replace the previously approved solid steel canopies with aluminum louvered canopies. The original canopies were mounted at a downward angle, which provided a pedestrian scaled element to the building, along with a much thinner profile. As proposed the aluminum canopies have a thicker profile and will be mounted as a horizontal projection from the building, much higher off the street.

**W** Johnson Street Elevation. As shown on the plans, the height of the residential garage door is being reduced and the garage door lites on both doors are being adjusted/reduced per the manufacturer standards. Originally, the residential garage door height matched that of the adjacent utility door. As a result, the brick detailing will be increased to infill the area.

### ATTACHMENT PD Zoning Statement of Purpose and Standards

#### 28.098 (1) Statement of Purpose.

The Planned Development (PD) District is established to provide a voluntary regulatory framework as a means to facilitate the unique development of land in an integrated and innovative fashion, to allow for flexibility in site design, and to encourage development that is sensitive to environmental, cultural, and economic considerations, and that features high-quality architecture and building materials. In addition, the Planned Development District is intended to achieve one or more of the following objectives:

- (a) Promotion of green building technologies, low-impact development techniques for stormwater management, and other innovative measures that encourage sustainable development.
- (b) Promotion of integrated land uses allowing for a mixture of residential, commercial, and public facilities along corridors and in transitional areas, with enhanced pedestrian, bicycle and transit connections and amenities.
- (c) Preservation and enhancement of important environmental features through careful and sensitive placement of buildings and facilities.
- (d) Preservation of historic buildings, structures, or landscape features through adaptive reuse of public or private preservation of land.
- (e) Provision of more adequate, usable, and suitably located open space, recreational amenities, and other public facilities than would otherwise be provided under conventional land development techniques.
- (f) Facilitation of high-quality development that is consistent with the goals, objectives, policies, and recommendations of the Comprehensive Plan and adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.

#### 28.098(2) Approval Standards for Project

The standards for approval of a zoning map amendment to the PD District, or any major alteration to an approved General Development Plan, are as follows:

- (a) The applicant shall demonstrate that no other base zoning district can be used to achieve a substantially similar pattern of development. Planned developments shall not be allowed simply for the purpose of increasing overall density or allowing development that otherwise could not be approved unless the development also meets one or more of the objectives of (1) above. Conditions under which planned development may be appropriate include:
  - 1. Site conditions such as steep topography or other unusual physical features; or
  - 2. Redevelopment of an existing area or use of an infill site that could not be reasonably developed under base zoning district requirements.
- (b) The PD District plan shall facilitate the development or redevelopment goals of the Comprehensive Plan and of adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.
- (c) The PD District plan shall not adversely affect the economic health of the City or the area of the City where the development is proposed. The City shall be able to provide municipal services to the property where the planned development is proposed without a significant increase of the cost of providing those services or economic impact on municipal utilities serving that area.

Legistar File ID #75281 339 W Gorham Street 01/11/2022 Page 4

- (d) The PD District plan shall not create traffic or parking demands disproportionate to the facilities and improvements designed to meet those demands. A traffic demand management plan may be required as a way to resolve traffic and parking concerns. The Plan shall include measurable goals, strategies, and actions to encourage travelers to use alternatives to driving alone, especially at congested times of day. Strategies and actions may include, but are not limited to, carpools and vanpools; public and private transit; promotion of bicycling, walking and other non-motorized travel; flexible work schedules and parking management programs to substantially reduce automobile trips.
- (e) The PD District plan shall coordinate architectural styles and building forms to achieve greater compatibility with surrounding land uses and create an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area and the statement of purpose of the PD District.
- (f) The PD District plan shall include open space suitable to the type and character of development proposed, including for projects with residential components, a mix of structured and natural spaces for use by residents and visitors. Areas for stormwater management, parking, or in the public right of way shall not be used to satisfy this requirement.
- (g) The PD district shall include suitable assurances that each phase could be completed in a manner that would not result in an adverse effect upon the community as a result of termination at that point.
- (h) When applying the above standards to an application for height in excess of that allowed in Section 28.071(2)(a) Downtown Height Map, except as provided for in Section 28.071(2)(a)1. and Section 28.071(2)(b), the Plan Commission shall consider the recommendations in adopted plans and no application for excess height shall be granted by the Plan Commission unless it finds that all of the following conditions are present:
  - 1. The excess height is compatible with the existing or planned (if the recommendations in the Downtown Plan call for changes) character of the surrounding area, including but not limited to the scale, mass, rhythm, and setbacks of buildings and relationships to street frontages and public spaces.
  - 2. The excess height allows for a demonstrated higher quality building than could be achieved without the additional stories.
  - 3. The scale, massing and design of new buildings complement and positively contribute to the setting of any landmark buildings within or adjacent to the project and create a pleasing visual relationship with them.
  - 4. For projects proposed in priority viewsheds and other views and vistas identified on the Views and Vistas Map in the City of Madison Downtown Plan, there are no negative impacts on the viewshed as demonstrated by viewshed studies prepared by the applicant.
- (i) When applying the above standards to an application to reduce or eliminate stepbacks required by Section 28.071(2)(c) Downtown Stepback Map, the Plan Commission shall consider the recommendations in adopted plans, including the downtown plan. No application to reduce or eliminate stepbacks may be granted unless it finds that all of the following conditions are present:
  - 1. The lot is a corner parcel.
  - 2. The lot is not part of a larger assemblage of properties.
  - 3. The entire lot is vacant or improved with only a surface parking lot.
  - 4. No principal buildings on the lot have been demolished or removed since the effective date of this ordinance.