

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

May 23, 2022

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1225 Spaight Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [70747](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: May 17, 2022

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Leah Stargardter, Sawdust and Love LLC

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an existing rear porch and construction of a new two-story rear porch addition.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing rear porch and construct a new two-story rear porch addition. The Queen Anne style structure was designed by architect Ferdinand Kronenberg for Jacob and Lena Togstad.

The proposal is to demolish the existing rear porch and construct a two-story rear addition. Both floors will function as enclosed porches. The new windows on the addition will be of comparable dimensions to those found on the historic building and the new exterior door is period appropriate. The addition will be clad in smooth-surfaced fiber cement to match the narrow clapboards on the rest of the structure. the hipped roof will allow the addition to tuck under the gable roof of the historic building, and the shingles are proposed to match those on the rest of the house. The railing for the stairs is proposed as a Trex aluminum railing, which is in keeping with the style of the house, but will read as a new alteration.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. The height of the addition is less than the height of the historic building and is in keeping with the height of comparable addition on structures in the vicinity.
 - 2. N/A
 - 3. The location of the rear addition that is stepped back from the sides of the existing structure and is nested under the existing roof allows the addition to not interrupt the standard rhythm of masses and spaces on the parcel.
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) N/A
 - (d) No changes to the existing roof.
 - (e) N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.