PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

February 23, 2022



PREPARED FOR THE URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

Project Address: 7820-7874 Mineral Point Road

Application Type: Large Retail Development – Initial/Final Approval is Requested

Legistar File ID # 68156

Prepared By: Jessica Vaughn, AICP, UDC Secretary

Background Information

Applicant | Contact: Brad Koning, Sketchworks Architecture | Steve Doran, Oakbridge Commons Limited Partnership

Project Description: The applicant is seeking Initial/Final Approval for exterior renovations to the existing Oakbridge Commons retail center. The scope of work includes removal of the south-facing overhang, replacement of existing storefronts, new siding, a new sunshade, new tower elements, and staining of the existing brick.

Project Schedule:

• The UDC received an Informational Presentation on November 17, 2021.

Approval Standards:

The UDC is an **advisory body** on this request. Section 28.137(2)(e) of the Zoning Code requires that a planned multi-use site containing more than forty thousand (40,000) square feet of floor area and where twenty-five thousand (25,000) square feet of floor area is designed or intended for retail use or for hotel or motel use, shall require conditional use approval following a recommendation on the design of any specific proposal by the Urban Design Commission. Section 33.24(4)(f) of the Urban Design Commission ordinance states that proposals for additions, exterior building alterations, or site alterations to existing structures currently used for, or originally designed to accommodate, a retail development that has a floor area of forty thousand (40,000) or more square feet shall be approved pursuant to the applicable ordinances relating to the alteration of approved projects and shall comply with these requirements to the extent possible, given the constraints of the existing sites and structures.

Summary of Design Considerations and Recommendations

Staff recommends that the UDC provides feedback on the proposed alterations regarding the aforementioned standards related to the items noted below. As noted in the application materials, the proposed modifications are primarily to the building's street facing facades, though modifications to the sidewalk and parking adjacent to the building are also depicted. Unless it is determined by Zoning staff that the extent of the modifications will require further site or landscape improvements, staff does not believe most of the "Large Retail" site standards would be applicable at this time.

- Exterior Building Material and Composition. The material palette provided in the plan set notes a number of exterior materials, including multiple types of masonry, metal panels, as well as lap siding, fiber cement wall panel, and EIFS. Staff requests UDC's feedback on the proposed material palette, as well as creating design continuity across the front façade and all building sides.
- Pedestrian Plaza. Landscape design and amenities play a role in placemaking and softening hardscape areas. As noted on the plans, multiple landscape planters, outdoor seating and landscape materials are

Legistar File ID # 68156 7820-7874 Mineral Point Road February 18, 2022 Page 2

proposed along the pedestrian plaza along the front of the building. Staff requests UDC's input and guidance on the proposed plaza amenities and plant palette.

Summary of UDC Informational Presentation Comments

As a reference, the Commission's comments from the November 17, 2021, Informational Presentation are provided below:

- This building has a backside to it?
- At the Men's Wearhouse corner, was there any thought to making another tall anchor element so you don't have that issue?
- It's very stark looking, you're staining the brick gray, was there any consideration to a palette that would incorporate the existing color brick? Modernize the appearance but maybe keep that brick original color.
- Signage might liven that up a bit.
- You can see that centralized feature from the backside. That's a challenge of where you stop the renovation and how does it look between the old and the new. The northern elevation is very prominent, it's back of house but still making that transition of a singular design. You're going to see these colors and if they don't work well together, it's going to look like a patchwork building.
- The building is old with that huge roof, it's dated, but is this really an improvement? It has a ways to go, certainly with the color mentioned before and competing with areas you're not going to touch. I don't know that the main tower is an improvement at all. The corner piers at the main tall tower just go up and stop when I'm looking for them to come across over top to create a sign area. There's way too much EIFS here.
- While the colonnade has challenges for the tenants it does shade the building effectively, the canopies shown in comparison are flimsy. The whitewashing adds to that stark feeling. Those tower elements could have brick going up, a flat arch going over them and staying a bit more true to the brick masonry of the building around the sides, reducing all that EIFS and coming up with a more substantial and effective canopy system to provide shading on the building.
- This didn't strike me as an improvement. University Station has also recently undergone a major renovation, it has the same architecture and I find their approach more successful. They kept the brick color, added stone and a few other materials, it actually came out pretty nicely. I'd suggest that as another approach to renovating this dated building. I'm very concerned about the idea of front-to-back two buildings.
- Opportunities to add some greenery to this site. Some living things could create a nice balance from the starkness.
- To that point you'd be missing an opportunity to make some changes in landscaping, it would go a long way to softening the starkness of the current design. You have to make sure someone keeps up with the planters. That parking lot is very barren.
- The awnings and colonnade, we unfortunately see a lot of flatness of the façade and materiality, which is one thing the current building has going for it.

Legistar File ID # 68156 7820-7874 Mineral Point Road February 18, 2022 Page 3

Large Retail Development Approval Standards

33.24(4) (f) MGO

- 1. <u>Statement of Purpose</u>. The purpose for this section is to provide a regulatory framework to ensure that large-format retail development promotes the efficient use of land and preserves and enhances the urban fabric through a more urban site and building design. In applying this ordinance to the redevelopment, expansion, or remodeling of existing sites, it is the intent of this ordinance to seek improvements, while recognizing that existing constraints will likely make full compliance with all provisions of this section difficult or infeasible.
- 2. <u>Applicability</u>. All new retail development that is on a single zoning lot and has a total floor area of forty thousand (40,000) square feet or more shall be subject to this ordinance total floor area shall be calculated by adding the floor area of all buildings on a zoning lot. When applying the requirements below, the Urban Design Commission, Plan Commission, and staff shall consider relevant design recommendations in any element of the City's Master Plan or other adopted City plans.
 - a. Any single retail business establishment that has a total floor area of forty-thousand (40,000) or more square feet shall be subject to Paragraphs 3. through 8. below.
 - b. All development on a single zoning lot shall be subject to Paragraphs 4. through 8. below.
 - c. The Plan Commission may waive one or more of the requirements in Par. 3. through 8. below, if it determines that unique or unusual circumstances warrant special consideration to achieve a superior design solution.
 - d. Proposals for additions, exterior building alterations, or site alterations to existing structures currently used for, or originally designed to accommodate, a retail development that has a floor area of forty thousand (40,000) or more square feet shall be approved pursuant to the applicable ordinances relating to the alteration of approved projects and shall comply with these requirements to the extent possible, given the constraints of the existing sites and structures.
 - e. Proposals for alterations to existing developments that currently exceed or are proposed to exceed a one hundred thousand (100,000) building footprint, as described in Par. 3, below, shall be approved pursuant to the applicable ordinances relating to the alteration of approved projects and shall comply with these requirements to the extent possible, given the constraints of the existing sites and structure.
- 3. Requirements for Buildings in Excess of 100,000 Square Feet. A single new retail business establishment may only exceed a building footprint of one hundred thousand (100,000) square feet as defined by the exterior walls, as provided below. Other separately-owned retail business establishments, entertainment, office, and residential uses not associated with the proposed business establishment shall not be counted towards the size of the building footprint.
 - a. The Plan Commission may consider a single retail establishment exceeding one hundred thousand (100,000) square feet if the design includes one or more of the following elements:
 - i. Multi-story development.
 - ii. Mixed use development.
 - iii. Structured or underground parking facilities.

Customer Entrances.

- a. The side of a building that directly abuts the most traveled public or private right-of-way that provides vehicular and pedestrian access to the site shall feature at least one (1) customer entrance. The entry may utilize a pedestrian plaza, entry portico, or other community feature as described in Par. 8, below, between the building and sidewalk. Corner entrances may be considered to meet this requirement.
- 5. <u>Site Design</u>. A development must follow one of the following three (3) options adjacent to the street that is projected to have the most pedestrian activity associated with the building(s). The requirements may be met using any combination of buildings on the zoning lot. The site may be designed to utilize any combination of the three (3)

Legistar File ID # 68156 7820-7874 Mineral Point Road February 18, 2022 Page 4

setbacks, i. through iii., below. If a zoning lot directly abuts two (2) or more public or private rights-of-way, there are no requirements for additional street frontages.

- a. At least fifty percent (50%) of adjacent street frontage shall be occupied by building facades with a maximum setback of twenty (20) feet. This requirement may be met by using any combination of buildings on the zoning lot. No off street parking facilities shall be located between the façade(s) directly abutting the street and the adjacent street.
- b. At least sixty percent (60%) if adjacent street frontage shall be occupied by building facades with a maximum setback of sixty-five (65) feet. This setback shall allow for a only a single drive aisle and one row of perpendicular parking with building entrance access and required landscaped buffer as stated in Par. 6.a., below. This setback may be extended to a maximum of seventy-five (75) feet, if traffic circulation, drainage and/or other site design issues are shown to require additional space.
- c. At least seventy percent (70%) of adjacent street frontage shall be occupied by building facades with a maximum setback of eighty-five (85) feet. This setback shall allow for only a single drive aisle and two rows of perpendicular parking with building entrance access and required landscaped buffer as stated in Par. 6.a., below. This setback may be extended to a maximum of one hundred (100) feet, if traffic circulation, drainage and/or other site design issues are shown to require additional space.
- 6. <u>Parking</u>. The following requirements apply to the entire zoning lot.
 - a. Off street parking facilities shall be located at least ten (10) feet from any property line and/or right-of-way and utilize a landscape buffer that includes trees, shrubs, decorative fencing, benches, flowerbeds, ground covers, or other high quality materials.
 - b. Transportation Demand Management. Any single retail business establishment of forty thousand (40,000) square feet or more with one hundred (100) or more full-time employees or full-time equivalents is required to have a Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Plan, or participate in a Transportation Management Association (TMA), if one is available in the geographic area of the establishment. This requirement shall also apply to any such existing retail business establishment proposing an addition or alteration, and that will have one hundred (100) or more full-time employees or full-time equivalents.
 - i. The TDM Plan shall generally describe the applicant's intent with respect to reducing the number of single-occupant automobile trips and list the methods the applicant intends to use. These methods shall be based on the transportation choices available and indicate if the applicant will provide for either the full price to purchase a monthly bus pass from Madison Metro, or provide for three (3) or more of the following options to all employees: ridesharing/car pool matching; preferred parking for ridesharers; secured bicycle parking, showers and lockers; employee commuting subsidies or awards; emergency ride home program; employer-subsidized bus passes; provision of real-time transit information; or other options proposed by the employer to discourage the use of single-occupant vehicles, and as approved by the City.
 - ii. The employer shall make the provisions in its Plan available to all employees.
 - iii. The Plan shall describe the traffic/parking impacts of the development and shall provide specific details on the measures the employer will use to monitor the traffic/parking impacts.
 - iv. The Plan shall be periodically updated at intervals not to exceed every two years.
 - v. The Plan shall be reviewed by the Traffic Engineer in concert with the Planning Division Director. The Traffic Engineer shall provide comments and suggestions for how the Plan might be improved.
- 7. <u>Pedestrian Circulation</u>. The following requirements apply to the entire zoning lot.
 - a. Sidewalks shall be provided along all sides of the site abutting a public or private right-of-way. Public sidewalks within the right-of-way may be used to meet this requirement.
 - b. Continuous internal pedestrian walkways at least six (6) feet in width shall be provided from the public sidewalk or right-of-way to the principal customer entrance of all buildings on the site. At a minimum, walkways shall connect focal points of pedestrian activity such as, but not limited to, transit stops, street crossings, building and store entry points. Walkways shall have adjoining landscaped areas along at least

fifty percent (50%) of their length. These areas shall include trees, shrubs, benches, flowerbeds, ground covers, or other such materials.

- c. Sidewalks at least eight (8) feet in width shall be provided along the full length of the building facade featuring a customer entrance, and along any façade abutting parking areas and shall provide at least eight (8) feet in width clear from any merchandise, vending, or other obstructions. These sidewalks shall be located at least six (6) feet from the facade to provide planting beds for foundation landscaping, except where features such as arcades, entryways, or community features, as defined in Par. 8., below, are part of the facade.
- d. Internal pedestrian walkways provided in conformance with subparagraph b., above, shall have weather protection features, such as awnings or arcades within thirty (30) feet of all customer entrances and shall be constructed parallel to the façade of the building but need not extend into driving aisles or parking areas
- e. All internal pedestrian walkways and crosswalks shall be distinguished from driving surfaces to enhance pedestrian safety and comfort, as well as the attractiveness of the walkways. Walkway materials shall be of durable, low-maintenance surface materials, such as pavers, bricks, or scored concrete. Signs shall be installed to designate pedestrian walkways.
- f. Sidewalks shall connect transit stops on or off-site as well as to nearby residential neighborhoods.
- 8. <u>Central Features and Community Spaces</u>. The following requirements apply to the entire zoning lot.
 - a. At least one (1) of the following central features and community spaces shall be provided for each forty thousand (40,000) floor area of building on the zoning lot. A minimum of two (2) is required and each central features and community space shall each occupy a minimum of 400 square feet in area. (Am. by ORD-15-00033, 4-8-15)
 - i. Patio/seating area.
 - ii. Pedestrian plaza with benches.
 - iii. Transportation center.
 - iv. Window shopping walkway.
 - v. Outdoor playground area.
 - vi. Kiosk area.
 - vii. Water feature.
 - viii. Planter walls.
 - ix. Other deliberately shaped area and/or focal feature or amenity that adequately enhances the community and public spaces.
 - x. Outdoor employee amenities, such as a break area.
 - b. All of the above, except outdoor employee amenities, shall have direct access to the public sidewalk network and shall not be constructed of materials that are inferior to the principal materials of the building and landscape.