PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

February 9, 2022

OF MADE

PREPARED FOR THE URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

Project Address:3005 University AvenueApplication Type:New Mixed-Use Building in Urban Design District (UDD) No. 6 –
Initial/Final Approval is RequestedLegistar File ID #68731Prepared By:Jessica Vaughn, AICP, UDC Secretary

Background Information

Applicant | Contact: John Flad, Flad Development & Investment Corp. | Kevin Burow, Knothe & Bruce Architects, LLC

Project Description: The applicant is seeking initial/final approval for the development of a new 5-story mixeduse building to include 59 residential apartments, approximately 1,340 square feet of first floor commercial space, structured parking, and a rooftop amenity space.

Project Schedule:

- The Urban Design Commission received an Informational Presentation on December 15, 2021.
- The Landmarks Commission provided an advisory review for the Demolition Permit request at their January 10, 2022 meeting. The Commission's recommendation to the Plan Commission noted that the building at 3005 University Avenue has historic values based on its cultural significance as a supper club, an important part of social and cultural traditions in Wisconsin's history.
- The Plan Commission is scheduled to review the related demolition request on February 21, 2022. Note, only the demolition is before the Plan Commission and based on the current request, UDC is the only City Commission reviewing the building design.
- The Common Council is scheduled to review the related CSM on March 1, 2022.

Approval Standards:

The Urban Design Commission ("UDC") is an **approving body** on this request. The site is located in Urban Design District 6 ("UDD 6"), which requires that the Urban Design Commission review the proposed project using the design standards and guidelines for that district in <u>MGO Section 33.24(13)</u>.

Summary of Design-Related Adopted Plan Recommendations:

The current <u>Comprehensive Plan</u> recommends "Community Mixed Use" uses for the subject property, which generally include two to six story building forms, with more residential units and commercial space compared with development in Neighborhood Mixed Use (70-130 dwelling units per acre). Generally, the recommendation specifies that development and design within CMU areas should enhance walkability, maintain positive building orientation to the street, be transit-oriented, and well connected to adjacent development.

Staff notes that the project is within the <u>Hoyt Park Area Joint Neighborhood Plan</u> (the "Plan") planning area. The Plan includes the subject site as part of block G.2, the Hill Street Mixed Use Focus Area, which is recommended for mixed-use buildings with up to five stories.

Summary of Design Considerations and Recommendations

Planning Division staff requests that the UDC review the project, make findings, and base their decision on the aforementioned standards and guidelines for UDD 6. As part of this review, staff recommends consideration be given to the following:

- Ground Floor Elevations. The ground floor elevations on three sides of the building are primarily inactive, blank walls that ultimately provide screening for parking. The current plans have been revised based on previous comments and Staff requests UDC's feedback on the proposed ground floor elevation details, especially along Schmitt Place as it relates to the proposed decorative metal screens, façade articulation and detailing, and minimizing blank wall expanses.
- **Building Commercial Entrance.** As shown on the site plan, the commercial entrance is accessed from University Avenue, by a series of steps. Staff requests UDC provide feedback on the location, accessibility, and orientation of the entrance of the ground floor commercial space.
- Vision Triangle Encroachment. As noted on the site plan, a vision triangle encroachment is being requested for the proposed red canopy detail at the corner of University Avenue and Schmitt Place. Vision triangle encroachments are administratively reviewed and approved by City Traffic Engineering. Evaluation of the proposed vision triangle encroachment is ongoing with City Traffic Engineering. Modifications to the building design as a result of City Traffic Engineering review will be subject to additional review by either the UDC or staff, depending on the scope of the modifications.
- Material Palette and Detailing. As noted in the plans, the exterior material schedule includes a composition of composite siding, masonry both brick and stone elements, and metal panels. Staff requests UDC's feedback on the overall material palette, as well as ornamentation and detailing. Members of the Commission provided different feedback on these details at the informational presentation.
- Site Landscape and Screening Details. Staff requests UDC's feedback on the overall landscape plan and screening elements, specifically with regard to planting palette, planter box details/design, fence material and details, and providing adequate screening and buffer along the south side of the project site.
- **Consideration of Future Signage Areas.** UDD 6 provides guidelines and requirements for signage. Staff requests UDC provide feedback on proposed future sign location areas.

Summary of UDC Informational Presentation Comments

As a reference, the Commission's comments from the December 15, 2021, Informational Presentation are provided below:

- The staff memo notes concerns about the commercial entry prominence and the articulation along Schmitt Place underneath the parking. That is a pretty brutalistic façade at the moment.
- I like the look of this building, it is more modern and attractive than next door. I'm a fan of the color accents, although it could be a darker red.
- The parking garage foundation wall could certainly be made much more attractive with landscaping beds of shrubs and grasses along that whole expanse.
- Nice looking project to replace the late great Smoky's Club.

Legistar File ID # 68731 3005 University Ave February 4, 2022 Page 3

- This could be simplified in materiality. I'm not a fan of the bright color accents that might be a trend that's a little bit on its way out.
- If it just turned the corner, simple enough that would be perfect.
- Color is pretty subjective.
- University Avenue is rather drab, maybe color isn't a bad thing.
- I like the color, I also agree with not needing that many materials. Keep the red but you don't need four other ones; the articulation and push and pull does enough for the massing without having the white, red, gray.
- The four story expression could be a different read, with the fifth story being masonry. Could be a nice head and tail to the building.
- I like the framing, not married to the color. Agree with one less material.
- The front has a nice setback but the back is right up against single-family residential. I wonder about the denseness and proximity to that.
- This is such a great part of the city that doesn't have much rental housing for families. Three-bedrooms would be nice to see here.
- The base along Schmitt Place needs to be more activated. One solution is using glass block in a more generous fashion at the first level parking.
- If you could do more of a screening like a typical open air garage that might get more to the rhythm of the building, the doors and windows above, and might give it more character than those really small punched openings that don't seem to fit.
- You have a deep terrace where landscaping can do a lot for that.
- If you were with a group of friends with one in a wheelchair who had to go in through a different entrance, ADA should just be built in. Making somebody go around to the backside just isn't very inclusive.
- Any way the commercial could stretch along University and have the lobby entrance off of Schmitt?
- When you look at the commercial you don't really see an entrance to it.
- Might be hard for whatever business goes in there, it needs an entrance off University but most will come in via parking. Deciding which side is the front of the commercial becomes difficult.
- Using that bold red as a design element could also signal an entrance.
- Maybe the whole bold red and white fronts the entire University Avenue with commercial, bring in your office and lobby back behind off Schmitt Place.