



Project Name/Address: 1840 Chadbourne Avenue

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations

Legistar File ID # [34763](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Louisa Kamps and Tim Pierce

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to a residence in the University Heights Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

Sec. 33.19(12)(d)3. Repairs. Materials used in exterior repairs shall duplicate the original building materials in texture and appearance, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the existing building materials where the existing building materials differ from the original. Repairs using materials that exactly duplicate the original in composition are encouraged.

Sec. 33.19(12)(d)4. Restoration. Projects that will restore the appearance of a building or structure to its original appearance are encouraged and will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if such repairs are documented by photographs, architectural or archeological research or other suitable evidence..

Sec. 33.19(12)(d)6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Additions visible from the street, including additions to the top of buildings or structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing building in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations and additions shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing building or of other buildings in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing building where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.

Sec. 33.19(12)(d)7. Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. Additions and exterior alterations that are not visible from any streets contiguous to the lot lines upon which the building or structure is located will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if their design is compatible with the scale of the existing building and, further, if the materials used are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color

and architectural details. Additions and alterations shall harmonize with the architectural design of the building rather than contrast with it.

Analysis and Conclusion

As described in the submission materials, the proposed work is divided into numerous smaller projects. This staff report will follow the numbering system found in the submission materials to address each project.

1. Disassemble existing west chimney down to roofline and reconstruct using existing brick and new flashing and cap. Flashing will be added to existing east chimney also. This work is a repair and will reuse existing materials.
2. Tear off existing shingles and install new sheathing on west side of roof and install new shingles on entire roof. This work is a repair and will install materials that match the existing materials.
3. Remove existing wall mounted air conditioning units and infill wall areas with siding. The infill of the wall areas is considered a repair and will use siding that matches the existing adjacent siding.

Install two new air conditioning units. One unit is proposed to be located on the roof of the 1 story mud room roof. The other unit is proposed to be located on the east side toward the front corner where it can be obscured by greenery. The location of the new units is considered an alteration. The unit located on the east side near the front corner would be visible from the street if the greenery was not present. The unit located on the roof of the 1 story mud room roof is hidden from view, but will probably be seen from Chadbourne and a bit of it will be seen over the roof from N Roby. The roof appearance is not being altered to accommodate the location of the unit.

There will be a 3" diameter hole in the exterior wall to each unit and wiring to each unit will be placed along obvious architectural breaks on the non-street sides of the house to minimize the appearance.

4. Install three skylights on the east roof slope. This work is considered an alteration and would be visible from the street, but would not be located on a street façade. Skylights have been added to other roofs in the historic district and are elements that can be installed without altering the existing structure and that can be removed in the future.
5. Replace three existing attic windows with new windows. The windows are located on street facades. The replacement of the north and south windows with units that restore the original size is an alteration that is compatible with the architectural design and with the proportion of widths to heights of window sizes. The windows will not have divided lites.

The submission materials also note that after the house is painted, the shutters will not be reinstalled. The removal of the shutters is an alteration since shutters are significant architectural elements, but in this case the shutters are already non-wood replacements and the installation of shutters on the paired windows is not historically appropriate.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The chimney shall be reconstructed in the exact configuration that currently exists which means each stepped course shall be replicated to achieve the existing profile, width and height.
2. The mortar used in the chimney reconstruction shall be of a mix that is softer than the brick and that has a profile and joint width that closely resembles the existing profile and joint width.

3. The applicant shall describe any alternate locations for the air conditioning unit instead of the location on the 1 story roof.