



**Project Name/Address:** 129 W Gorham; Rectory Building at Holy Redeemer Church

**Application Type:** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration on a landmark site and in a historic district

**Legistar File ID #** [52226](#)

**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** July 3, 2018

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** James Moser, Brown House

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed exterior alterations which include the replacement of basement windows and other items at the Rectory Building of Holy Redeemer Church.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location:** The subject site is located on a landmark site in the Mansion Hill historic district.

**Relevant State Statute Section:**

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

**Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:**

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## **Analysis and Conclusion**

The building at 129 W Gorham was constructed in 1894 in the Queen Anne style as the convent for the nuns who taught at Holy Redeemer School. The building at 129 W Gorham is located on a landmark site which also includes the Holy Redeemer Church and until recently, the Holy Redeemer School which was subdivided from the site, but remains a landmark. The applicant is proposing to install new windows in the basement, construct three window areaways, and install shotcrete/waterproofing below grade.

The Mansion Hill standards for review in the Historic Preservation Ordinance (Section 41.22(4)) do not address the replacement of historic materials. The Commission shall use standard 41.18(1)(d) and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation to determine if a Certificate of Appropriateness should be granted for this work. In addition, the Commission shall use State Statute 62.23(7)(em)2m. This staff report will look at each alteration related to the applicable standards in the discussion below.

### Replacement of windows

The replacement of original windows may not frustrate the public interest, but replacement of basement windows with windows that do not replicate the original window appearance may frustrate the public interest and would not meet the Statute. Deteriorated windows should be repaired instead of being replaced. The Commission requires documentation to determine if the deterioration is beyond repair. The proposed replacement window is manufactured by Marvin. The drawings note that the windows are aluminum clad and from the Infinity line. The Infinity line is fiberglass and would not be aluminum clad. The Infinity line may not have a similar appearance to the existing windows. For example, the replacement window muntin should

replicate the profile and width of the existing muntin which appears to be 5/8" wide. The Infinity muntin seems to be wider than 5/8" and the profile seems flat. Staff could not determine if a narrower muntin is available in the Infinity line. This is an image of the muntin that is provided in the Infinity line. One window sill is proposed to be raised on the west elevation which will change the proportion of the double hung window compared to adjacent double hung windows.



**Simulated Divided Lite**

#### Installation of areaways

The proposed areaway material is corrugated metal. Areaways currently are not present so they would not need to replicate existing materials. In this case the Commission shall determine if corrugated metal is "compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment." Because the areaways are held below grade and would really only be seen from the interior, the integrity of the property is protected.

### **Recommendation**

Staff believes the standards for replacing the basement windows may not be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission discuss the items below with the Applicant and consider approving the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall confirm that the proposed replacement windows are fiberglass. The drawings note that the windows are aluminum clad and Infinity. The Infinity line is fiberglass and may not have a similar appearance to the existing windows.
2. The replacement windows shall have muntins that replicate the configuration and appearance of the existing windows. The replacement window muntin should replicate the profile and width of the existing muntin which appears to be 5/8" wide. The muntin shown below seems to be wider than 5/8". Staff could not determine if the Infinity window offers a narrower muntin.
3. The Applicant shall confirm that the replacement windows will be installed within the existing window frame which includes the existing window trim.

Staff believes the standards for constructing three corrugated metal window areaways and installing shotcrete/waterproofing below grade are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall confirm that the corrugated metal areaway material is not visible above grade.
2. The Applicant shall confirm that the shotcrete/waterproofing will not be visible above grade.