

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

August 29, 2016



PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 834 Prospect Place (District 2 - Ald. Zellers)
Application Type: Conditional Use
Legistar File ID # [43794](#)
Prepared By: Jessica Vaughn, AICP, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted

Summary

Applicant & Contact: Andrew Braman-Wanek; Ginkgo House Architecture; 3157 Milwaukee St.; Madison, WI 53714

Property Owner: Paul Hick and Lisa Grant; 834 Prospect Pl.; Madison, WI 53703

Requested Action: The applicant requests approval of a Conditional Use for an accessory building in excess of 576 square feet on a lakefront lot in a TR zoning district.

Proposal Summary: The applicant is seeking approval of a Conditional Use to construct a 1.5-story, 1,072-square-foot, two-car garage (663 square-feet) with attic space above (409 square-feet). The proposed garage will replace the existing one-car garage (313 square-feet). The proposed garage is sited and oriented in the same manner as the existing garage, maintaining existing building relationships and access as well as minimizing any impact to the waterfront.

The material palette and building design, including side gable roof configuration with front facing dormer, painted masonry with cedar soffit brackets and lap siding on gable ends and wood garage door, matching the principle building.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Pursuant to Section 28.131(b), MGO, no individual accessory building or structure shall exceed 576 square feet in size in a TR zoning district except as approved through Conditional Use. Pursuant to Section 28.138(2)(a), MGO, a new accessory building on a lakefront lot requires Conditional Use approval. This proposal is subject to the standards pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO, the Supplemental Regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO, for accessory buildings and structures, and because the project site has frontage along Lake Mendota, this proposal is subject to the standards for Lakefront Development pursuant to Section 28.138, MGO.

Review Required By: Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the Conditional Use standards are met and **approve** the request to for a 1,072-square-foot detached accessory building at 834 Prospect Pl. This recommendation is subject to the input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The project site is located mid-block on the west side of Prospect Place along the east shoreline of Lake Mendota. The project site is located within the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood and is comprised of approximately 12,640 square-feet (0.29 acres).

The site is in Aldermanic District 2 (Zellers), the Madison Metropolitan School District, and within the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Plan planning area.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: Currently the project site is comprised of a 2.5-story single-family residence that was constructed in the early 1900's, according to the City Assessor's records. The existing residence architecturally resembles a colonial era home with side gabled roof with front facing dormer, paired end chimneys, multi-pane windows and ornamented roof eaves and cornices.

Also on the project site is a one-story, one-car garage with a simple rectangular footprint measuring 14' x 22'-4" and 313 square-feet in size with a flat roof configuration. In its current location, the existing garage holds the building setback line along the street, and is in-line with the principle structure. The existing garage is primarily comprised of painted masonry materials.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning: The project site is zoned Traditional Residential-Consistent 2 (TR-C-2). Pursuant to Section 28.041, MGO, the Traditional Residential Consistent zoning districts' general purpose and intent statement speaks to:

- Promote the preservation, development and redevelopment of traditional residential neighborhoods in a manner consistent with their distinct form and residential character.
- Ensure that new buildings and additions to existing buildings are designed with sensitivity to their context in terms of building placement, facade width, height and proportions, garage and driveway placement, landscaping, and similar design features.
- Facilitate the preservation, development or redevelopment goals of the comprehensive plan and of adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.

North: Single-family residential; TR-2 zoning;

South: Single-family residential; TR-C2 zoning;

East (across Prospect Place): Single-family residential; TR-C3 zoning; and

West: Lake Mendota; no zoning.

Zoning Summary:

Zoning Criteria		
Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	4,000 sq. ft.	12,640 sq. ft.
Lot Width	40'	79'
Front Yard Setback	20'	29'-5" (Zoning Condition No. 2)
Maximum Front Yard Setback	30' or up to 20% greater than block average	29'-5"
Side Yard Setback	One-story: 5' Two-story: 6'	5' (south)
Rear Yard Setback: Accessory Building	3'	96'-4" (from shoreline)
Usable Open Space	750 sq. ft.	Adequate
Maximum Lot Coverage	65%	25%
Maximum Lot Coverage within 35' of OHWM	20%	Less than 20%
Maximum Building Height: Accessory Building	15'	14'-11"
Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	1 (location only)	2 proposed garage stalls (Zoning Condition No. 3)
Number Bike Parking Stalls	None	None
Building Forms	None	Accessory Building

Other Critical Zoning Items	
Yes:	Floodplain, Utility Easements, Wellhead Protection District (WP-24, 1,200-foot buffer)
No:	Urban Design, Historic District, Adjacent to Park, Barrier Free (ILHR 69), Wetlands

Zoning Table prepared by: Jenny Kirchgatter, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Comprehensive Plan: The Comprehensive Plan recommends Low Density Residential (LDR) development for the project site. As defined in the Comprehensive Plan, LDR development is categorized for its low density (0-15 dwelling units/acre), primarily single-family detached residential development.

Adopted Neighborhood Plan: The project site is located within the planning area boundary of the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Plan (the "Plan"). The Plan identifies the project site as being within an area recommended for Low Density Residential Development (LDR), consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. Generally, the design standards in the Plan speak to new development that generally speak to restoring and preserving the existing residential character of the neighborhood and maintaining consistency with the existing architectural character, massing and scale. The Plan does include design guidelines, in the Land Use Section (Pages 11-35), that speak to the siting of garages: Garages should not be set in front of residences, but rather should be flush with the structure or set back from the main structure (Page 15, Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Plan).

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site not within a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicant is requesting approval of a Conditional Use to construct a 1.5-story, two-car garage totaling 1,072 square-feet in size. The proposed garage is a replacement structure that will provide two vehicle parking spaces (664 square-feet) and an attic space (409 square-feet). The applicant has not indicated the intended use of the proposed attic space. To note, use of the attic space as an accessory dwelling unit would require a Conditional Use approval. Approval of such is not part of this application.

The proposed garage will be located and oriented in the same manner as the existing garage, maintaining existing building relationships and access as well as minimizing any impact to the waterfront.

The proposed building design and material palette will match that of the existing residence, including side gable roof configuration, front facing dormer with painted masonry, cedar soffit brackets, lap siding on gable ends and wood garage door.

Analysis and Conclusion

Pursuant to Section 28.131, "*General Regulations*," MGO, no individual accessory structure shall exceed 576 square feet in the TR zoning districts except as approved through Conditional Use. In addition, because the project site has frontage along Lake Mendota, this proposal is subject to the standards for Lakefront Development pursuant to Section 28.138, MGO. Pursuant to Section 28.138(2)(a), MGO, a new accessory building on a lakefront lot requires Conditional Use approval. This proposal is subject to the standards for Conditional Uses pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO, and the Supplemental Regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO for accessory buildings and structures.

The applicable Supplemental Regulations pursuant to Section 28.151, MGO identify the parameters for determining when Conditional Use approval is required for accessory buildings and structures, including those in excess of 576 square-feet of floor area in the TR zoning district. The Conditional Use application satisfies the supplemental regulations.

Generally, the intent of a Conditional Use review is to determine if a particular site is an appropriate location for a proposed use, to evaluate the compatibility of that use with surrounding uses and development, and to mitigate potential nuisance impacts to surrounding properties. In order to approve the Conditional Use request, Plan Commission must find that the proposed Conditional Use approval standards pursuant to Section 28.183(6), MGO have been met, including those related to normal and orderly development, consistency and compatibility with the existing development.

Planning Division staff believes that the proposed Conditional Use meets the Conditional Use approval standards given that:

- The area is characterized by its predominantly residential character with a mix of single- and multi-family dwellings with a mix of one- and two-car, one-story garages, some with rooftop decks. The existing neighborhood character will not be significantly impacted given that the principal single-family residential land use will remain. In addition, the proposed accessory building, being a garage, is an accessory building and use that is commonly associated with residential uses and that is incidental, and subordinate to the principal use (Standards #1-7).
- The proposed accessory building is located on the site in a manner that is sensitive to existing building relationships and consistent with the design guidelines identified in the adopted neighborhood plan,

which encourages garages to be located either flush with the front facades or behind principle structures. While the proposed garage undoubtedly results in an accessory building that is a larger building overall (1,072 square-feet total) than what is existing (313 square-feet), the size difference can be primarily attributed to the attic space (409 square-feet). There is only a slight increase in the overall building to lot ratio (a three percent increase in lot coverage from 22 percent to 25 percent), a resulting number that is significantly below the maximum (65 percent). The historic building placement on the project site will be maintained as well as the general development patterns that are present in the area along Prospect Place, with garages being located in close proximity to the street (Standard #4).

- Overall, the proposed building design is consistent in terms of style and form with that of the principle building, with a side gable roof and front facing dormer. The building material palette consisting of traditional materials, including painted masonry with cedar details to match the house. The proposed garage will maintain a similar design aesthetic that is already present on the project site (Standard #9).

At the time of report writing, no public comment has been received.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Jessica Vaughn, (608) 267-8733)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the Conditional Use standards are met and **approve** the request to for a 1,072-square-foot detached accessory building at 834 Prospect Pl. This recommendation is subject to the input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Jessica Vaughn, (608) 267-8733)

1. Prior final approval and building permit issuance, the Applicant shall submit final plans for review and approval by staff, and shall include the following revisions:
 - a. Revise the site plan (Sheet 1) to include a north arrow, lot dimensions and lot coverage calculations, including the overall square footages of the paved areas, building footprints.

City Engineering Division (Contact Brenda Stanley, (608) 261-9127)

The agency reviewed this request and has recommended no conditions of approval.

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Eric Halvorson, (608) 266-6527)

The agency reviewed this request and has recommended no conditions of approval.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608) 266-4429)

1. Provide a complete site plan for final review, including property dimensions and garage dimensions.
2. Verify the measurement of the front setback to the proposed garage. The minimum front yard setback is twenty (20) feet and shall be measured from the front lot line.

3. Show the width of the driveway on the site plan. The maximum driveway width measured at the front lot line is twenty-two (22) feet wide.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, (608) 261-9658)

The agency reviewed this request and has recommended no conditions of approval.

Parks Division (Contact Janet Schmidt, (608) 266-4714)

The agency reviewed this request and has no recommended no conditions of approval.

Water Utility (Contact Adam Wiederhoeft, (608) 266-9121)

1. All operating private wells shall be identified and permitted by the Water Utility in accordance with MGO 13.21.
All unused private wells shall be abandoned in accordance with MGO 13.21.

Metro Transit (Contact Timothy Sobota, (608) 261-4289)

The agency reviewed this request and has recommended no conditions of approval.

City Engineering Review Mapping (Contact Jeff Quamme, (608) 266-4097)

1. The site plan shall identify lot and block numbers of the recorded Plat and also the dimensions of the property subject to this application.
2. The site plan shall include all lot/ownership lines, property dimensions, existing building locations, proposed building additions, demolitions, driveways, sidewalks (public and/or private), existing and proposed utility locations and landscaping.
3. The site plan shall include a full and complete legal description of the site or property being subjected to this application.
4. It is recommended, if not already accomplished, that the Applicant have a boundary survey completed by a Professional Land Surveyor to assure the proposed improvements are correctly located on the property.