



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Monday, June 1, 2009

4:45 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room LL-130 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 7 -

Bridget R. Maniaci; Daniel J. Stephans; Stuart Levitan; Robin M. Taylor;
Michael J. Rosenblum; Christina Slattery and Erica Fox Gehrig

APPROVAL OF May 18 MINUTES

A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to Approve the Minutes of the May 18, 2009 meeting. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment

CONSIDERATION OF ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 1. [14892](#)** 936 Jenifer Street - Third Lake Ridge Historic District
Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new backyard garage.

Contact: Andre Jones, Mid-West Garage Builders

Dick Guyot, 936 Jenifer Street, gave a brief overview of the project. He stated that he would have liked to build a stable-type garage, but the zoning code height limit of 15 feet would not allow it, forcing him to build a more standard suburban garage type.

Ms Taylor asked about the size of the garage, and whether or not it would meet zoning requirements due to the square footage.

A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Slattery, to Approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new backyard garage with the following conditions:

 - 1. The garage design must comply with all zoning requirements**
 - 2. The applicant must submit the design of the garage doors, access door, and windows to City Planning staff for review and approval.**

The motion passed by voice vote/other.
- 2. [14893](#)** 1934 Regent Street - University Heights Historic District
Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a back porch deck.

Contact: Ryan McKnight

Ryan McKnight, 1934 Regent Street, gave a brief overview of the house and stated that he was okay with the staff conditions that all lattice work would be fully framed and that the deck would be moved in 6 inches to comply with zoning requirements.

Dennis McKnight, 34 N Ritter, Indianapolis, Indiana, and Elizabeth Kerwin, 1 N Prospect Ave, Madison, registered in support and were available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by Rosenblum, to Approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a back deck with the following conditions:

1. All lattice work must be fully framed-in
2. The deck must be moved in six inches further from the property in order to meet the zoning code requirement of a seven foot side yard.

The motion passed by voice vote/other.

3. [14894](#)

113 Bascom Place - University Heights Historic District

Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed roofing material.

Contact: Sue Thering

Lou Host-Jablonski, 2088 Atwood Ave, briefly described the project and proposed roofing material. He stated that this house was originally the carriage house for the Bradley House, designed by Louis Sullivan. The house is hidden in the woods and often not recognized as a Sullivan design. He noted that at first he was also wary of the Ecoshake material, but having experiences with it over the last eight years has shown him the material's durability.

Mr. Stephans asked about the color fading and mold resistance of the material. Mr. Host-Jablonski relayed that he has seen no color difference on an 8-year old roof. He also noted that the plastic sheen that is a little visible on the new material dulls over time to look like more real wood shake. The material can withstand tree limbs, hail and other potential hazards better than the wood shakes that are currently available, and that the material is very mold resistant.

A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to Approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the roof material as proposed. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

4. [14895](#)

2122 Van Hise Avenue - University Heights Historic District

Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacements on a street-facing facade.

Contact: Matthew Speer, Associated Housewrights

Richard Porst, 3972 Plymouth Cir, Madison, briefly described the proposed project.

Ms. Taylor noted that the last time the Commission approved an applied lead for windows, it didn't turn out well.

Mr. Stephans asked about the durability of the proposed materials. Mr. Porst stated that the contractor who does this work has been very happy with the results and durability.

Ms Slattery asked for clarification about whether the Commission or staff routinely approves applied exterior wood muntins in the place of true divide lights, and whether or not this is similar. Staff replied that they do currently often approve applied exterior muntins.

The Commission discussed the importance of leaded windows as architectural features of historic districts and the balance of energy efficiency, windows condition, and design. Mr. Rosenblum noted that at a historic preservation conference he attended last week, he learned that often it is more sustainable to restore, rather than replace windows.

Mr. Stephans asked about the condition of the windows and whether restoration was possible

and what the cost differential would be for restoration over replacement. Mr. Porst noted that while weather stripping and other repairs could be done, he didn't know how long it would last. Mr. Porst added that the cost to fully remove and restore the windows could cost as much as the new replacement windows.

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Taylor, to Approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the wood windows with new windows that included exterior applied muntins for the non-lead-ed windows, and required that the owner repair and restore the lead-ed glass windows, instead of the proposed replacement windows. The Commission noted that if the repair and restoration is not possible due to the condition of the windows, then the owner should return to the Landmarks Commission for further review and consideration. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

OTHER BUSINESS

5. [08717](#) Buildings proposed for demolition

At the time of the meeting, there were no additional buildings proposed for demolition that the Commission hadn't already seen. Ms Maniaci noted that she has been talking to the Stonehouse Inc. about their project on East Johnson and the potential moving of houses proposed for demolition. Stonehouse has told her that they would be willing to put the cost of demolition into the cost of moving the house if there is someone interested in any of them. Ms Maniaci has been trying to find vacant lots. Mr. Levitan wondered if the CDA had any empty lots in Allied Drive development, or if the County had any lots available. Ms Maniaci mentioned that the demolition is scheduled for September 2009.

6. [07804](#) Secretary's Report

Staff noted that due to the City of Madison's current hiring freeze, the position of the Preservation Planner will not be filled until further notice. The Commission asked that staff put an item on the next agenda where the Commission could talk about the vacant position and the effect on outreach and other issues that will be difficult to pursue without a full-time Preservation Planner.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to Adjourn at 6:00 p.m. The motion passed by voice vote/other.