

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

JULY 27, 2016 URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

AUGUST 8, 2016 PLAN COMMISSION



Project Address: 115-117 S. Bassett Street (District 4 – Ald. Verveer)
Application Type: PD-SIP Alteration
Legistar File ID # [43001](#)
Prepared By: Kevin Firchow, AICP and Timothy M. Parks, Planners, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted
Reviewed By: Jay Wendt, Principal Planner

Summary

Applicant and Owner: Brandon Cook; PO Box 694; Madison

Contact: Matt Aro; Aro Eberle Architects; 116 King Street; Suite 202; Madison

Requested Action: Approval of an alteration to an approved Planned Development–Specific Implementation Plan for 115-117 S. Bassett Street to approve site, utility, landscaping and exterior building plan alterations to 2 existing residences.

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes six (6) alterations to the existing residential structures at 115 and 117 S. Bassett Street. Alterations proposed for both properties/structures include changes to roofing materials, modification of site landscaping, and surface changes to the driveway and parking lot. In addition, changes specifically proposed to the 117 S. Bassett property include changes to the sump pump discharge, relocation of a rear basement window, and relocation of a first floor window. Unlike previous requests for this site, no new building development is proposed in the rear of the current buildings.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for Planned Developments in Section 28.098(2) of the Zoning Code. The Urban Design Commission (UDC) is required to make a recommendation to the Plan Commission with specific findings on the design objectives listed in subsections 28.098(1) and (2) and the other requirements of this subchapter.

Review Required By: Urban Design Commission and Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for Planned Developments are met and **approve** the requested alterations for 115-117 S. Bassett Street subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions from reviewing agencies beginning on page 5 of this report.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject property is located on the east side of S. Bassett Street, between W. Main and W. Doty Streets; Aldermanic District 4 (Verveer), Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The subject property includes two existing buildings: a two-unit residence containing seven bedrooms at 115 S. Bassett Street and a four-unit residence containing 10 total bedrooms at 117 S. Bassett Street. The site includes an un-striped gravel parking area, which is not consistent with the previously approved plans. As discussed in the body of the report, several approved site and building elements have not been installed per the approved plans.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: Apartment buildings including an adjacent 30-unit building zoned DR-2 (Downtown Residential-2);

South: Three-unit residences, zoned DR-2 and PD;

East: Backyards of one- and two-unit homes (with some three and four-unit homes beyond), zoned DR-2; and

West: One- and two-unit homes with some larger apartments beyond, zoned DR-2.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan, adopted in 2006, includes this site within the Mifflin-Bassett Downtown Sub District. That plan recommends buildings be two to four stories in height and recommends residential densities up to 60 dwelling units per acre. A key issue in this sub-district is whether redevelopment is consistent with the predominant (two and three story scale) of buildings in the area.

The Downtown Plan, adopted in 2012, includes this site within the Bassett District. That plan identifies the neighborhood as a potential neighborhood conservation district, a tool in the zoning ordinance to help ensure consistent development patterns and design features are conserved. The plan calls for the rehabilitation of some structures as well as selective redevelopment that is compatible with the scale and character of the existing buildings. Slightly larger buildings are recommended to the ends of the blocks.

The Bassett Neighborhood Master Plan, adopted in 1997, includes this area within the “Bassett Residential District.” The plan recommends “residential rehabilitation and new infill development in scale with the existing neighborhood. Improvements to residential streets, zero-lot line buildings and blocks dominated by rear parking lots will be necessary to create an environment that will attract owner occupants and long-term renters.”

Zoning Summary: The site is zoned PD. The proposed PD-SIP alteration will be reviewed in the following sections.

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project History

The two subject properties were rezoned to the Planned Unit Development (PUD) zoning district [1966 Zoning Code] in January 2010. The applicant sought this rezoning after having been denied a variance to approve foundation work not done in compliance with building permits for the existing structures. Both the foundations at 115 and 117 S. Bassett Street were raised approximately 18 inches in order to accommodate new basement dwelling units. This modification brought the site out of conformance with the property’s then R6-General Residence District zoning.

That 2010 rezoning approval provided conforming zoning and allowed the applicant to convert 115 S. Bassett Street from a single-family home into a two-unit structure and to convert 117 S. Bassett Street from a three-unit to a four-unit structure. While the applicant’s initial rezoning request included a 6-unit, 16-bedroom rear-yard apartment building, that portion of the request was not approved.

In December 2010, the applicant applied for an amended PUD to add a slightly smaller three-story rear-yard apartment building. That request was placed on file-without prejudice by the Common Council at the request of the applicant. Issues included concerns from the Fire Department and the history of unresolved zoning

compliance issues on the subject site and the applicant's other properties. While acknowledging the slightly smaller building was an improvement, the Planning Division raised concerns on the building's density, mass, and the overall desirability of the basement unit.

A similar zoning map amendment request was made in June 2015 to again to build a four-bedroom apartment at the rear of the site. At the request of the applicant, that request was also placed on file without prejudice on February 23, 2016.

At this time, the City has been prosecuting the property owner for work that has not been completed in accordance to approved plans.

Project Description, Analysis, and Conclusion

The applicant requests approvals of several alterations to an approved planned development. This planned development currently includes two residential structures (115 and 117 S. Bassett Street), as described above. This request is subject to the standards for Planned Developments.

The specific changes are listed in the letter of intent and include the following:

- **Roofing Material Change.** The applicant seeks approval of the as-built condition. As part of the alterations approved in 2010, both subject buildings were approved with metal roofs. While new roofs were installed, asphalt shingles were installed instead of the approved metal roofs.
- **Landscaping Modifications.** The applicant proposes some modifications to the site landscaping. Based on staff's review of the approved plans, proposed modifications include the following:
 - 1) Reducing the number of "Cradle of Liberty" perennial from five (5) to four (4) along north side of 115 building;
 - 2) Adding three Emerald Gold Arbor Vitae near the front of 117 S. Bassett Street;
 - 3) Removing two salvia perennials along southern bay window for the 117 building;
 - 4) Removal of seven perennials at the rear of the 117 building to accommodate relocated door;
 - 5) Addition of eight deciduous "Summersweet" shrubs at the southeastern edge of the lawn;
 - 6) Reducing the number of redbud trees at the rear of the property from three (3) to two (2); and
 - 7) Replacing an area adjacent to the parking stalls on the eastern edge of the site from "Bishop's Weed" to lawn.
- **Sump Pump Discharge Change.** The applicant proposes to discharge the sump pump from the 117 building into the stormwater drain that currently runs along the side of that building. As a condition of approval, the City Engineering Division has requested additional information from a professional engineer or master plumber regarding the adequacy of the sizing of this connection.
- **Driveway and Parking Area Surface.** The site is currently surfaced in gravel. As part of the 2010 approval, approved plans showed an asphalt driveway and parking area. As part of this alteration request, the applicant seeks to surface these areas in concrete (based on a letter of intent dated May 13, 2016).

- **Rear Basement Window Relocation – 117 Building.** The letter of intent states the applicant proposes to move rear basement window to accommodate MG&E Utilities. This is not clearly labeled on the proposed set, though comparing the proposed drawing to the approve, this appears to be a small shifting of the lower basement window a few feet to the “right” and about a foot above where it is currently located. There is a follow up note stating that siding will be extended to “wrap around the window.” This is not labeled on the plans and staff request further clarification on that detail.
- **Window Relocation – 117 Building.** In comparing the approved plans to the proposed, a first floor window will be removed, a second story window will be made smaller and shifted to “right” and a new window will be to the shed dormer portion of the building. These changes are on the “interior” north elevation of this building and are anticipated to have limited views from the street.

No other alterations are specifically requested and are not part of this request. A condition noting this is included in the recommendation section of this report. Staff has also requested a few clarifications.

As the site is an existing Planned Development, alterations must be evaluated against the approval standards for Planned Developments. This includes standard 2(e) related to the coordination of architectural styles and building forms:

“The PD District Plan shall coordinate architectural styles and building forms to achieve a greater compatibility with surrounding land uses and create an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area and the statement of purpose of this PD District.”

While it remains of significant concern that the renovation of these buildings was not completed in accordance with approved plans, the Planning Division believes it is possible that these specific alterations could have been found consistent with the former Planned Unit Development (PUD) Standards (from the 1966 Zoning Code that applied at the time this request was first approved) and with current PD standards that currently apply. Staff notes that plans for these buildings were originally part of a more complex proposal that introduced a rear-yard apartment building which has been placed on file multiple times. Arguably, the most significant alteration proposed with this application was from a metal to a shingled roof. In reviewing the “coordination of architectural styles” standard, staff believes that an architectural shingle roof is consistent with the character of several surrounding wood-frame residential structures.

At the time of report writing, staff was not aware of any public comments on this proposal.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Kevin Firchow, 267-1150)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for Planned Developments are met and approve the requested alterations for 115-117 S. Bassett Street following a recommendation by the Urban Design Commission and subject to input at the public hearing and the following conditions:

Recommended Conditions of Approval Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Kevin Firchow, 267-1150)

1. That the alterations included in this approval are those specifically described in the letter of intent, depicted on plans, and summarized in this report. No other alterations are included within this approval.
2. That the plans submitted for final staff approval clarify any discrepancies between the alterations described in the letter of intent and those depicted on plans. This shall include the window modifications proposed for the 117 S. Bassett Street building, which do not appear consistent with the alterations as depicted on the drawings.
3. That the applicant provides for staff approval additional clarifications on the extension of siding proposed as part of the rear basement window relocation on 117 S. Bassett Street building.

City Engineering Division (Contact Brenda Stanley, 261-9127)

4. The applicant shows connection of outside drains to a sump pump system and a note regarding connection of pump to the storm system. The applicant shall provide documentation by a Professional Engineer or Master Plumber regarding the adequate sizing of this system to handle 100-year design flows for the outside area being directed to the pump and shall show additional information on how and where the public storm sewer is being connected to.
5. The applicant's utility contractor shall obtain a connection permit and excavation permit prior to commencing the storm sewer construction per MGO 37.05(7). This permit application is available on line at <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/permits.cfm>.

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Eric Halvorson, 266-6527)

6. The applicant shall submit one contiguous plan showing proposed conditions and one contiguous plan showing existing conditions for approval. The plan drawings shall be scaled to 1" = 20' and include the following, when applicable: existing and proposed property lines; parcel addresses; all easements; pavement markings; signing; building placement; items in the terrace such as signs, street light poles, hydrants; surface types such as asphalt, concrete, grass, sidewalk; driveway approaches, including those adjacent to and across street from the project lot location; parking stall dimensions, including two (2) feet of vehicle overhang; drive aisle dimensions; semitrailer movement and vehicle routes; dimensions of radii; and percent of slope.
7. The City Traffic Engineer may require public signing and marking related to the development; the Developer shall be financially responsible for such signing and marking.
8. All parking facility design shall conform to MGO standards, as set in section 10.08(6).

Zoning Administrator (Contact Matt Tucker, 266-4569)

→ **Comments not available at the time of report writing and will be provided separately once available.**

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 261-9658)

This agency submitted a report with no recommended conditions of approval.

Water Utility (Contact Contact Adam Wiederhoeft, 266-9121)

9. All operating private wells shall be identified and permitted by the Water Utility in accordance with MGO 13.21. All unused private wells shall be abandoned in accordance with MGO 13.21.

Parks Division (Contact Janet Schmidt, 261-9688)

This agency submitted a report with no recommended conditions of approval.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency did not provide comments for this request.