



Project Name & Address: 110 Ely Place
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations
Legistar File ID # [73460](#)
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: September 14, 2022

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Aaron Monroe, Architectural Building Arts
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to convert a screened porch to an enclosed four-season room

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is located in the University Heights Local Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
 2. The removal of historic features on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
 3. The introduction of conjectural architectural features without historic precedent on the building is prohibited.
 - (c) Replacement
 1. Existing features shall be replaced in-kind if they are too deteriorated to repair.

- (5). Windows and Doors
 - (b) Sill and Head Height
 - 2. The new or reconfigured openings shall have similar appearance to the historic windows or doors of the structure.
 - (c) Windows
 - 3. Replacement multi-light windows shall use true divided lights or simulated divided lights with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
 - (d) Pedestrian Doors
 - 2. Doors shall not have a textured fake wood grain.
 - 3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view, wood or aluminum, and shall be compatible with the entrance door and the overall design of the building.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
 - (b) Porch Elements
 - 3. Spaces beneath porches and stairs shall be enclosed with a framed lattice of crisscross design, narrow vertical boards, masonry, or other approved openwork design to allow ventilation.
 - 4. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.
 - (c) Enclosing Porches
 - 1. Porches on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way may have framed screens or storm windows, similar in proportion to windows on the structure and painted or coated to match the trim on the porch, installed on the condition that the balustrade be retained and preserved, repaired, or replaced in a design compatible with the historic character of the structure.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to convert the existing enclosed side porch to being a fully insulated room by replacing the screens for windows that replicate the same division pattern, repair the railing above the porch, and convert the two door openings that access the balcony area to window openings with the windows replicating the pattern of the windows on the rest of the house.

This Colonial Revival house was constructed in 1915 by John Findorff for William Kittle, who was the Secretary of the Board of Regents for the State Normal Schools (the early higher education system for training teachers). The building was originally a stucco-clad Prairie style structure and in the 1930s the new owner, William G. Kaeser (superintendent of Pet Milk Company) converted it to the clapboard-clad Colonial Revival style structure it is today. The character-defining features of this building are the symmetrical arrangement of features, Greek columns, Chippendale railings, and multi-light windows. The permanent windows will allow the porch area to continue to read as an open space that was previously an open porch. The integration of the columns into the walling-system allows for that character-defining feature to remain while adapting them to the new use.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. The alteration of the porch to being screened to permanent windows and modification of the pair of doors to becoming windows allows for minimal alterations to this space and maintains the character of the building.
 - 2. No historic features will be removed and instead the project will integrate those features into the alteration of the side porch and balcony.
 - 3. The project will not introduce conjectural features on the building.

- (c) Replacement
 - 1. The balcony railing and the columns are proposed to be repaired. The proposal calls for replicating any of these features that are not repairable.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (b) Sill and Head Height
 - 2. The modified door openings to the balcony will raise the sill height so that the new windows will be of similar appears to the historic window openings.
 - (c) Windows
 - 3. The new multi-light windows facing onto the balcony will have divided lights, per the specifications provided in the application materials. The new windows for the enclosed porch are single-lights to replicate the mostly open appearance of the porch area.
 - (d) Pedestrian Doors
 - 2. The new door to the porch area will not have fake wood grain.
 - 3. The new door to the porch area is proposed as a full light door.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
 - (b) Porch Elements
 - 3. This porch sits at grade so there is no space beneath the porch to be enclosed.
 - 4. All wood on the porch and balcony will be painted to match the existing.
 - (c) Enclosing Porches
 - 1. The new windows are proposed to have a color to match the trim on the porch and installed in a way that the only decorative on the porch (the columns) will remain. The design is compatible with the historic character of the structure.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.