

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 2, 2009
TITLE: 2601 West Beltline Highway – Street Graphics Variance Continuance. 14 th Ald. Dist. (15338)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: September 2, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Mark Smith and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 2, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **DENIED** a Street Graphics Variance located at 2601 West Beltline Highway. Prior to the presentation staff noted that other elements of the sign package for the “Bonfyre” restaurant as an amendment to the originally approved “Comprehensive Design Review Sign Plan” for the Arbor Gate Development consisting of a combination above canopy/canopy fascia sign was approved by the Commission at its meeting of July 15, 2009. Consideration for a 3-sided projecting/blade sign was referred at the request of Ald. Bruer and was also the subject of opposition by staff due to the inclusion of signage on the parallel face of the 2-sided blade sign. Conventionally blade signs are projecting signs that feature signage on opposing faces perpendicular to the building’s façade. Staff noted that consideration for a canopy sign in the location as currently proposed was an element of the original CDR sign plan for Arbor Gate approved on July 9, 2008. The blade sign/projecting sign on the end elevation was removed from the package and was noted as “excessive with the amount of wall signage as proposed.” Staff noted the current blade sign as proposed features the removal of the problematic third sign face but still requires an amendment to the CDR sign plan based on its previous non-approval by the Commission, combined with its size at 48 square feet, which is more than 25% in excess of the 32 square feet allowed according to provisions of the Sign Control Ordinance. Chuck Zimmermann of Capitol City Neon Signs Company, Inc. then provided details of the proposed projecting sign with Tom Hayman and Brad Duesler representing Food Concepts, Inc. speaking in favor of the sign. Questions by the Commission relevant to the need for the sign were noted where the applicants felt the additional sign provided for needed visibility of the restaurant’s presence off of the westerly corner of the building from the West Beltline Highway. Discussion by the Commission noted that the project under the provisions of its originally approved CDR sign plan was allotted significant levels of flexibility in the development of all signage components for the project, including the lower level combined wall above/below canopy signage, extensive ground signage package, as well as allowance for a non-locale on premise tenant/business identification signage within a secondary sign band.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **DENIED** an amendment to the Comprehensive Design Review Sign Plan for Arbor Gate regarding a blade sign. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-1) with Luskin voting no.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2601 West Beltline Highway

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3

General Comments:

- No blade sign.
- No! Enough signage already.