



**Project Name/Address:** 704 E Gorham  
designated landmark, Collins House

**Application Type:** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration

**Legistar File ID #** [40418](#)

**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** October 28, 2015

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Bob Klebba and David Waugh

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration to a landmark

## Background Information

**Parcel Location:** The subject site is a landmark site located in James Madison Park.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) N/A
    - (c) N/A
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

### Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## **Analysis and Conclusion**

The Applicants are requesting two exterior alterations on the rear of the landmark building. The first request relates to the replacement of the windows in the west and north elevations of the enclosed porch. The second relates to the replacement and alteration of windows in the rear dormer addition. Both requests will be discussed below.

### **Certificate of Appropriateness related to replacement of enclosed porch windows**

The request involves replacing the existing non-original fixed and casement windows and fixed transoms on the north elevation of the porch with three sections of a central picture window and flanking double hung windows. The existing non-original windows on the west elevation would be replaced with three ganged double hung windows of equal width.

A brief discussion of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation follows:

1. The use of the property is not being altered by the request.
2. The historic character of the property is being retained and preserved. The removal of non-original replacement windows will not affect the character.
3. The non-original windows are being replaced with new replacement units which will not create a false sense of historical development.
4. The non-original enclosed porch will remain enclosed.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize this property are not being altered by this request.
6. The non-original replacement windows are not historic features.
7. Chemical or physical treatments are not being proposed.
8. The site is not being disturbed by this request.
9. The replacement windows will fit in the historic porch openings and their configuration will be slightly different from yet compatible with the original windows.
10. The proposed replacement windows can be removed in the future and the integrity of the property would be unimpaired.

**Certificate of Appropriateness related to alteration and replacement of added dormer windows**

The request involves relocating the existing window openings so that two new replacement windows are equally spaced in the dormer addition width. The materials would be patched to match the existing adjacent materials in texture and color and architectural detail.

A brief discussion of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation follows:

1. The use of the property is not being altered by the request.
2. The historic character of the property is being retained and preserved. The alteration of non-original windows will not affect the character.
3. The non-original windows are being replaced with new replacement units which will not create a false sense of historical development. According to the submission materials, the proposed window will be approximately 4" shorter than the existing windows to accommodate the height of the related roof flashing under the sill. The Marin window elevations seem squat in proportion to the existing window proportions. The replacement of these windows may necessitate the need to meet building code egress requirements and therefore may make these windows casements with a wide horizontal muntin to look like a double hung meeting rail.
4. The non-original dormer addition will remain.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize this property are not being altered by this request.
6. The non-original windows are not historic features.
7. Chemical or physical treatments are not being proposed.
8. The site is not being disturbed by this request.
9. The replacement windows will be slightly different from yet compatible with the original adjacent windows.
10. The proposed replacement windows (and dormer addition) could be removed in the future and the integrity of the property would be unimpaired.

**Recommendation**

**Certificate of Appropriateness related to replacement of enclosed porch windows**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration to the windows of the enclosed rear porch are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request as submitted.

**Certificate of Appropriateness related to alteration and replacement of added dormer windows**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration of the dormer windows are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicants shall confirm that the proposed dormer windows are of the same proportion as the existing windows so that their appearance is compatible.
2. The Applicant shall confirm with Building Inspection about the type of window used in this location and review for final approval any changes necessitated by the building code with Staff.

Not related to the formal requests, but necessary for the appropriate treatment of the landmark, Staff recommends that Landmarks Commission request that the Applicants paint the unfinished metal gutters and downspouts of the rear dormer.