

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION**PRESENTED:** June 3, 2009**TITLE:** 418 South Gammon Road (West Towne Mall) – Alteration to a Planned Commercial Site Exceeding 40,000 Square Feet of Retail Space for the Construction of a Longhorn Steakhouse. 9th Ald. Dist. (13787)**REFERRED:****REREFERRED:****REPORTED BACK:****AUTHOR:** Alan J. Martin, Secretary**ADOPTED:****POF:****DATED:** June 3, 2009**ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Jay Ferm and Todd Barnett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of June 3, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of alterations to a Planned Commercial Site located at 418 South Gammon Road. Appearing on behalf of the project was Jack Degagne, representing Darden Restaurants; and Ald. Paul Skidmore, District 9. Degagne provided an overview of modifications to the plan in response to the Commission's previous review of the project as follows:

- Elimination of the southerly entry drive on the mall's ring road as requested.
- Redesign of parking lot to incorporate more tree islands within the southerly one-half of the site along with the addition of landscaping within the buffer along Gammon Road, as well as within a previously non-planted islands.
- The issue with oversized logo elements on the building's façade is eliminated and removed as part of the package.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- The use of tree lilac is missing an opportunity to provide shade; although OK could use a taller tree.
- Better off with larger trees in islands on Gammon add more trees to the two islands in front of the north elevation. Although Degagne noted conflicts with existing poles; it was noted that poles could be adjusted and located elsewhere as to not conflict with additional tree planting.
- Eliminate existing Spruce along the ring road; use sod in this area.
- Adjust planting beds so not to float and give a simple curvilinear form; suggest bringing to sidewalk with a design that provides for ease of maintenance.
- Add a shade tree to the southwest corner of the building within the end island adjacent to the drive aisle entry.

 **DRAFT****ACTION:**

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Ferm, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-1) with Barnett voting no. The motion required the placement of lilac trees within islands with major canopy trees, the easing of curving within planting beds along Gammon Road with a more simplified curvilinear form, in addition to modification to the existing lighting within tree islands abutting the building's north elevation to provide for incorporation of two trees per island.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 418 South Gammon Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating	
Member Ratings	5	6	5	5	6	5	5	-	
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5	
	6	-	6	-	-	6	-	6	
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6	
	6	5	5	-	5	5	5	5	

General Comments:

- Other than central parking area, fine.

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 6, 2009
TITLE: 418 South Gammon Road (West Towne Mall) – Alteration to a Planned Commercial Site Exceeding 40,000 Square Feet of Retail Space for the Construction of a Longhorn Steakhouse. 9 th Ald. Dist. (13787)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 6, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Jay Ferm, Richard Slayton, Mark Smith, John Harrington and Marsha Rummel.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 6, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of an alteration to a Planned Commercial Site located at 418 South Gammon Road. Appearing on behalf of the project was Jack Degagne, representing Darden Restaurants. Degagne presented revisions to the plan as previously noted by the Commission as follows:

- The signage package provides for the development of four building signs without a ground or monument sign.
- The site has been redesigned to address the Commission's previously stated concerns about the lack of a functional drop-off and visible entry to the building.
- Degagne also emphasized changes to the landscape plan.

Following his presentation the Commission noted the following:

- If 83 parking stalls are required and 104 provided, consider cutting back.
- The four canopy trees proposed along Gammon Road have a mounding branch pattern; need to be more upright.
- Tree islands should have two trees such as double Honey Locust and Linden. In addition, add a tree island to the southwesterly bay of surface parking stalls.
- The lighting plan conflicts with tree location in islands; need adjustment.
- Add a tree and additional landscaping to islands along Gammon Road and feature no amenities.
- The site's three entrances on the ring road a problem with traffic flow. Consider elimination of the southerly driveway entry.
- Reconfigure to eliminate the southerly driveway entrance off of the ring road in order to pick up stalls and add a south/north drive aisle to the reoriented parking arrangement.
- Building is OK as relocated but suggest looking at compact stalls along the south edge of the property including lining with trees between parking lot and mall entry.

- All windows are to be vision.
- Resolve any issues with the signage package's consistency with provisions of the Street Graphics Ordinance.

ACTION:

On a motion by Harrington, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-1) with Ferm voting no. The motion required the landscaping in the parking lot as noted with closing off of the most southerly driveway entry off of the mall road, along with the provision of more trees on site and along the West Towne Mall road, along with the removal of the monument sign from the plans, as well as resolve issues with the logo wall signage's consistency with the Street Graphics Ordinance.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 6, 6, 6 and 6.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 418 South Gammon Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	5	-	-	5	5	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	6	5	-	-	6	-	5
	5	6	5	-	6	5	5	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	6	6	5	-	-	6	5	6
	7	6.5	6	6	6	6	-	6.5

General Comments:

- Somewhat better use of mall outlot but too much parking. Architecture is handsome.
- Site plan is much improved. Additional windows at entry are appreciated.

AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: March 4, 2009
TITLE: 418 South Gammon Road (West Towne Mall) – Alteration to a Planned Commercial Site Exceeding 40,000 Square Feet of Retail Space for the Construction of a Longhorn Steakhouse. 9 th Ald. Dist. (13787)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: March 4, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods; Chair, Todd Barnett, Ron Luskin, Dawn Weber, Mark Smith, Jay Ferm, Ald. Marsha Rummel, Richard Wagner, and John Harrington.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 4, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for an alteration to a planned commercial site exceeding 40,000 square feet of retail space for the construction of a Longhorn Steakhouse at 418 South Gammon Road (West Towne Mall). Appearing on behalf of the applicant was Jack Degagne. He stated that the proposal involves demolishing the vacant Smokey Bones restaurant and constructing a new building just to the south. He stated that the front elevation of the building will face the street and include the entrance. Building materials will include stone, brick and EIFS. Degagne stated that they are proposing 96 parking spaces and have reciprocity agreements, noting that 62 spaces are required.

The Commission discussed the following items:

1. The need to keep the EIFS off the ground all around the building.
2. The design of the west facade (facing the mall) needs to be improved and the landscaping well designed in that area.
3. Look at larger tree islands to accommodate two trees if possible, and adding trees to line the mall's ring road.
4. The need for signage to meet ordinance requirements and to be well integrated into the design.
5. Considering changes to the entrance canopy to make the doors more visible from the parking lot.
6. Although the Commission was generally supportive of the building placement, it also would be open to considering moving the building to the north to allow for a drop-off near the front door.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 418 South Gammon Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	6	7	5	-	-	6	5	6

General Comments:

- Location of building is urban and appreciated, but look at articulation/entry issues.
- Nice start. Remember that site dictates a 4-sided building.