

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

June 25, 2014

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name/Address: 1144 Florence Court

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in an historic district

Legistar File ID # [34516](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Janet and Michael VanVleck

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in a historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(11)(i) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g).
2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The property owner is requesting to install vinyl siding to a dormer and replace all of the windows of the residence.

The scope of the work is discussed in an analysis of Section 33.19(11)(i) below:

1. See analysis of Sec. 33.19(11)(g) below.
2. The installation of vinyl siding over existing wood siding will change the historical finishes, but may remain visually compatible with the existing siding. The replacement of windows will also change the historical finishes, but may remain visually compatible with the existing windows. The existing windows have window horns (ogee lugs) which are not proposed to be replicated on the exterior.
3. The installation of siding and the replacement of windows will not affect the existing and original rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. The installation of siding and the replacement of windows will not affect the existing historical landscape plan.
5. The installation of siding will not affect the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes; however, the replacement windows will have a slightly smaller visible glass size which will affect the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

The analysis of 33.19(11)(g) follows:

1. The installation of siding and the replacement of windows will not affect the height.
2. The installation of siding and the replacement of windows will not affect the historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. The installation of siding and the replacement of windows will alter the existing materials. Due to the location of this structure, there technically is not a street façade; however, I believe the Ordinance can be interpreted so “street façade” means the elevation with the most important hierarchy or the elevation viewed by the public.
4. The installation of siding and the replacement of windows will not affect the roof appearance.

Recommendation

The Commission shall discuss the following items and based on the discussion, possibly create conditions of approval:

1. The Commission shall discuss the interpretation of “street façade”, given the unique access to the residence and the desire to retain original windows wherever viewed by the public.
2. The Commission shall discuss the loss of the window horn elements on the exterior.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with possible conditions of approval related to discussion.