

AGENDA # 10

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: March 22, 2006
TITLE: 415-419 West Dayton Street – PUD(SIP). 4 th Ald. Dist.	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: March 22, 2006	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lisa Geer, Lou Host-Jablonski, Cathleen Feland, Jack Williams, Robert March, Todd Barnett and Ald. Noel Radomski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 22, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(SIP) located at 415-419 West Dayton Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Gary Brink, architect, Rosemary Lee and Pat McCaughey. The project involves the potential relocation of a 2-story wood frame home located at 415 West Dayton Street and the demolition of two adjacent multi-family units located at 417 and 419 West Dayton Street in order to construct a new 20-unit condominium project on the combined lots. The new residential structure will be 4-stories in height with 2 levels of underground parking provided. Although not in Downtown Design Zone 2, the property is directly across the street from properties designated within the zone for transitional development that limits buildings to 3-stories or 40-feet in height. The units within the structure are oriented to either the south (rear) or north (street elevation). The building features the use of glazed and regular modular brick as the main building material. Following the presentation, the Commission's response was as follows:

- Architecture appears unarticulated, especially the Dayton Street façade and entry.
- Entry looks institutional; consider creating a more quasi patio/plaza gathering area at the entry and eliminate the heavy appearance of the entry façade.
- The garage door creates an imbalance with the rest of the front façade; doesn't relate to anything else. The garage door should disappear into the background; the green color doesn't help, consider recessing more but make more of a feature of it by framing it with cast stone.
- The white precast lintel above the garage door does not help reduce its prominence.
- Problem with the narrow width of brick above the upper windows' lintels.
- Consider expanding base of building on front to incorporate garage door and to provide more integration, as well as extension on all four elevations.
- Reexamine the look of the architectural elements to reduce the monument/institutional look and mesh with neighborhood. Utilize all brick instead of prairie stone at base, look at introducing horizontal siding to bring elements from other area buildings, along with consider reversing front center of the building to invert with remainder of the building to extend out.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 6, 6.5, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 415-419 West Dayton Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	-	-	-	6	6	6
	7	7	-	-	-	7	8	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	6	6	6	-	-	5	6	6
	6	6	-	6	-	6	6	6
	7	6	-	-	-	6	7	6.5

General Comments:

- Study ways to better integrate the garage door into the overall street façade. Pedestrian entry too stark.
- Rework the entrance on Dayton Street to move away from the institutional feel. Possibly create more of an entry plaza.
- Entry and garage door need work. Otherwise, the concept, massing and context are very appropriate.
- Asymmetry can work and will avoid a dated look in the future.
- Dayton entrance needs something to make it less institutional.
- Look at neighboring building for architectural queue.