



Project Name & Address: 415 East Washington Avenue

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the First Settlement historic district.

Legistar File ID # [57816](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: October 21, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Tim Bradley – Great Whale Tattoo

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the First Settlement Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

- (3) Signs. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
- (a) The size or design of the sign(s) would adversely affect the historic fabric of the structure or the district;
 - (b) The sign(s) fails to comply with Chapter 31, MGO;
 - (c) The sign(s) fails to comply with specific standards and guidelines for signs adopted in each historic district under this ordinance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new signage on the building. The application discusses a change of copy of the existing hanging sign, installation of a new wall sign, and installation of a vinyl door sticker. The Landmarks Commission has not traditionally reviewed vinyl door stickers due to their temporary nature and Zoning does not require review of those decals either. For the existing sign, the commission has a provision in the Policy Guide for staff to administratively approve these types of proposals, which states the following:

6. Replacement of the face of an existing sign with new information and the installation of awnings, provided that the proposed design will not detract from the character of the building or district.

The proposed new copy in the hanging sign does not appear to detract from the character of the building or the district.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections as pertains to the proposed new wall sign is as follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
- (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) The First Settlement Historic District does not have specific sign standards.
 - (d) The proposed work does not appear to frustrate the public interest.
- (3) Signs. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
- (a) The new wall sign is proposed to be attached to the side of the building. Staff would recommend that it be attached using stainless steel fasteners that are installed in the mortar joints. Otherwise, the installation of a removable sign does not appear to adversely impact the character of the building. The Landmarks Commission has previously approved murals painted onto panels that are of a similar size and affixed to the side of a building.
 - (b) Zoning is completing a review of the proposed signage. Their initial review is that the proposed signage meets the requirements for total signage within the signable area. However, this property is also located within an Urban Design District, and UDC will be reviewing the proposal as well. UDC staff may ask for the wall sign to be located on the first floor area of the building as that is the location of the business.
 - (c) The First Settlement Historic District does not have specific requirements for signage.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Wall signage be installed with stainless steel fasteners, which are installed in the masonry joints, not in the bricks
2. As long as the sign is no larger than what is currently proposed, the Landmarks Commission does not need to review changes in dimension or location as recommended by the Urban Design Commission.